

ZIMBABWE

REPORT ON :

**THE IMPACT OF REDRESSIVE ACTION EMPLOYMENT
POLICY ON REDRESSING RACIAL AND GENDER
IMBALANCES IN THE LABOUR MARKET IN
ZIMBABWE**

1980/1989

By

Brigid Strachan*
1993

*** CENTRE FOR APPLIED SOCIAL SCIENCES
UNIVERSITY OF ZIMBABWE
P O Box MP 167
Mount Pleasant
Harare**

Published by ARTCA Publications
P O Box 3383, Harare. 1994

PRICE: ZW\$40.00
ISBN: 0-7974-1344-8

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES	iii
LIST OF APPENDICES	iii
PREFACE	iv
FOREWORD	v
1. <u>INTRODUCTION: THE ISSUE OF TERMINOLOGY - AFRICANISATION, BLACK ADVANCEMENT AND REDRESSIVE ACTION</u>	1
1.1 <u>Africanisation</u>	1
1.2 <u>White Migration</u>	2
1.3 <u>Affirmative Action, Redressive Action and Black Advancement</u>	5
1.4 <u>Issues in Implementing a Redressive Action policy</u>	6
2. <u>THE SOCIO-ECONOMIC BACKGROUND AND THE NECESSITY FOR REDRESSIVE ACTION.</u>	7
2.1 <u>Colonial Philosophy of Education and Training.</u>	7
2.2 <u>The Effects of the Colonial Philosophy.</u>	7
2.3 <u>The Developing Skills Shortage in the 1970s.</u>	8
2.4 <u>Black Advancement Before Independence</u>	10
2.5 <u>The Need for Redressive Action.</u>	11
2.6 <u>The 1981 National Manpower Survey</u>	12
3. <u>REDRESSIVE ACTION IN THE LABOUR MARKET: NON-POLICY, PREFERENTIAL AND NON-PREFERENTIAL MEASURES.</u>	14
3.1 <u>Imbalances of colour and gender in the labour market</u>	14
3.2 <u>Preferential Policy Measures or Affirmative Action</u>	14
3.3 <u>Non-Preferential Measures</u>	15
3.3.1 <u>The Non-Policy Approach - Pressure on the Private Sector</u>	16
3.3.2 <u>Non-Preferential Policy Measures</u>	16
3.3.2.1 <u>Government's National Manpower Strategy</u>	16
3.3.2.2 <u>Controls on foreign Recruitment.</u>	17
3.3.2.3 <u>The Expansion of Education and Training.</u>	19
3.3.2.4 <u>The Manpower Planning and Development Act</u>	20
3.3.2.5 <u>The Labour Relations Act</u>	21
3.3.3 <u>Reasons for Government Caution on the Private Sector</u>	23
4. <u>AFFIRMATIVE ACTION IN THE PUBLIC SECTOR.</u>	24
4.1 <u>Factors Facilitating Redressive Action</u>	26
4.1.1 <u>The White Exodus and the Expansion of the Public Service</u>	26
4.1.2 <u>The Retirement Incentive Scheme</u>	27
4.1.3 <u>Supersession and Shifting Sideways</u>	28
4.1.4 <u>The Presidential Directive and Promotion on Merit</u>	29
4.1.5 <u>Training and Manpower Development</u>	30
4.1.6 <u>Africanisation of the Parastatals</u>	30
4.1.7 <u>Was there an Alternative to Rapid Africanisation, particularly of the civil service?</u>	33
4.2 <u>Problems Arising With the Changes in the Public Sector</u>	33
4.2.1 <u>Lack of Experience and High Turnover of Personnel</u>	33
4.2.2 <u>Declining Efficiency and Effectiveness</u>	34

4.2.3	<u>Nepotism and Corruption</u>	35
4.3	<u>Case Studies - Two Parastatals</u>	37
4.3.1	<u>The National Railways of Zimbabwe.</u>	37
4.3.2	<u>Air Zimbabwe Corporation</u>	38
5.	<u>BLACK ADVANCEMENT IN THE PRIVATE SECTOR.</u>	40
5.1	<u>Africanisation of skilled workers.</u>	40
5.2	<u>Black Advancement in Management</u>	41
5.3	<u>Factors Affecting Black Advancement in the Private Sector</u>	42
5.3.1	<u>The Attitude of Top Management and Racial Prejudice</u>	42
5.3.2	<u>Managerial Function and a Shortage of Skills</u>	43
5.3.3	<u>Industrial sub-sector and Ownership</u>	43
5.3.4	<u>Merit and Experience</u>	43
5.3.5	<u>Cultural Differences</u>	44
5.3.6	<u>The Profile of White and Black Management</u>	44
5.3.7	<u>Window Dressing and Political Appointments</u>	45
5.3.8	<u>Rapid Promotion and False Expectations</u>	45
5.3.9	<u>White Mobility</u>	46
5.3.10	<u>The Need for Redressive Action Policy and Strategy</u>	46
5.3.11	<u>The Necessity of Restructuring the Economy</u>	46
5.4	<u>Case Studies in the Private Sector</u>	47
5.4.1	<u>Case Study A</u>	47
5.4.2	<u>Case Study B</u>	47
5.4.3	<u>Case Study C</u>	48
5.4.4	<u>Case Study D</u>	48
5.4.5	<u>Case Study E</u>	49
5.4.6	<u>Case Study F</u>	49
5.4.7	<u>Case Study G</u>	50
6.	<u>REDRESSIVE ACTION EMPLOYMENT POLICY AND THE FORGOTTEN ISSUE OF GENDER</u>	51
6.1	<u>Statistics on female employment</u>	51
6.1.1	<u>Colour, skill and occupational group</u>	51
6.1.2	<u>Industry and Sector by Gender</u>	53
6.1.3	<u>Informal Sector and Subsistence Agriculture</u>	56
6.2	<u>The Reasons for the Position of Women in the Labour Market</u>	57
6.3	<u>Redressive Legislation Affecting Women</u>	58
7.	<u>THE BROADER IMPLICATIONS OF REDRESSIVE ACTION EMPLOYMENT POLICY</u>	60
7.1	<u>'Africanisation' and Democratisation</u>	60
7.2	<u>The Ownership Pattern of the Zimbabwe Economy</u>	60
7.3	<u>'Africanisation' of Ownership</u>	61
7.4	<u>'Africanisation' and Income</u>	62
7.5	<u>Redressive Action and its Broader Policy Implications</u>	62
8.	<u>CONCLUSION</u>	65
	<u>BIBLIOGRAPHY</u>	70

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1	: Population by Ethnic Group 1969 and 1982	2
Table 2	: Immigration and Emigration 1975 - 1986	3
Table 3	: Economically Active Immigrants and Emigrants by Occupational Category 1965 - 1985	4
Table 4	: Source of Skills.	9
Table 4a	: Nationality and Occupation 1981	18
Table 4b	: Nationality and Occupation 1985	19
Table 5	: Enrolments in Education: 1979 and 1985	19
Table 6	: Apprentices Indentured According to Colour: 1981 and 1984.	20
Table 7	: Composition of Senior Posts in the Public Service: 1989.	24
Table 8	: Racial and Gender Composition of the Public Service	25
Table 9	: Retirement at Non-Pensionable and Pensionable Ages	27
Table 10	: Racial Classification in the Parastatals - Select Occupational Categories and Total Employment: 1985.	31
Table 11	: Air Zimbabwe Corporation: Classification by Race and Skill: 1980 & 1986	39
Table 12	: Management in the Manufacturing Sector in Zimbabwe: 1989.	41
Table 13	: Females by Colour 1987	52
Table 14	: Female Employees by Occupational Group and Colour: 1981 and 1985. ...	52
Table 15	: Proportion of Females in the Trained Workforce by Racial Group: 1981 & 1985	53
Table 16	: Number Employees by economic sector and gender: 1980 & 1987.	54
Table 17	: Percentage Employees by economic sector and gender: 1980 & 1987.	55
Table 18	: Percentage women and men in employment	56
Table 19	: Two Case Studies: Males and Females Employed in the Clothing and Textile Industry, 1989.	58
Table 20	: Income by Colour and Gender: 1987.	62

LIST OF APPENDICES

APPENDIX 1: TABLES	67
RACIAL DISTRIBUTION AND SKILL IN THE LABOUR FORCE	67
Table A1a : TOTAL LABOUR FORCE BY COLOUR: 1982.	67
Table A1b : TOTAL LABOUR FORCE BY ETHNIC GROUP	67
Table A2a : SKILL AND COLOUR: 1981.	68
Table A2b : COLOUR DISTRIBUTION OF THE TRAINED WORKFORCE: 1981, 1985, 1987.	68
Table A3a : OCCUPATION BY COLOUR: 1981.	69
Table A3b : OCCUPATION BY COLOUR: 1985.	69
Table A4 : OCCUPATION BY COLOUR: 1987.	70

In the best of all possible best worlds everyone would be treated as a friend or brother or sister. There would be no prejudice or discrimination, or injustice. However, no matter how hard you and I strive by word and deed to improve the moral and social conditions of man, his social relations and well-being, the development of his individual life and his mind and faculties, we find others who choose to ignore the need for fairness and equal opportunity, justice and freedom from prejudice.

Imbalances emerge. Bias enters the minds of people including politicians. Mistakes are made and misery created through lack of objectivity. At some point in the evolution of every nation a temporary counter-balance is required to rectify the situation. Thus in Zimbabwe at the time of its Independence in 1980 interwoven with the new Government's policy of reconciliation between the ethnic groups was a policy of "Redressive Action". It was, and is, a preferential policy more generally known as Affirmative Action, favouring black Zimbabweans as a counter-balance to the previous Government's bias towards favouritism for the whites of the country. Both the pre and post Independence governments recognised and implemented positive discrimination from opposite ends of the racial spectrum; the earlier Government for white protection, the later one to redress the slowness of black advancement, particularly in business, commerce and government including the civil service.

At the request of the Round Table Race Relations Endowment Trust, Brigid Strachan - the author of this report - has carried out research on economic growth and job creation in Zimbabwe. She has recorded the results of her work focusing attention on the Redressive Action Policy. Members of the Endowment Trust felt that such a study would be of interest and of benefit not only in Zimbabwe but elsewhere. We thank her for her efforts in writing this report.

The contents of this publication are intended to be not only of academic and historical interest but of practical significance as well. Time is too short to repeat mistakes of the past or to discover anew solutions that have already proved successful. History is often a guide post for the future and considerable practical and educational material will be found in this report which can beneficially be used by politicians and members of both the public and private sectors.

At least it will stimulate thought and debate. Should affirmative action, which is not based on advancement on merit, continue? If it is to continue will the process of black advancement be at a pace that is economically sound, does not cause financial erosion and is transparent and accountable? Have the scales been sufficiently balanced to warrant the introduction of a new policy of advancement solely on the basis of education, merit and the ability to perform? If appointments are not made on merit what criteria are used? In the absence of ascertainable criteria how much advancement takes place *inter alia* through bribery and corrupt influences?

Certain qualities, including honesty, industry, efficiency, reliability, fairness and respect for others, are needed, together with a democratic approach, in all walks of life. In this context, to quote Theodore Parker, *democracy* means not "*I am as good as you are,*" but "*You are as good as I am*". Together with quality and democracy is the need to create and maintain a society free from prejudice, discrimination, injustice and intolerance. If these things can be achieved Zimbabwe might well become an example which other countries would wish to emulate.

R A STUMBLES

Chairman

Round Table Race Relations Committee

**REPORT: ZIMBABWE 1980/1989 - THE IMPACT OF REDRESSIVE
ACTION EMPLOYMENT POLICY ON REDRESSING RACIAL AND
GENDER IMBALANCES IN THE LABOUR MARKET.**

Brigid Strachan

FOREWORD

In the 1970s the Round Table funded a major project on Education and Employment in Rhodesia resulting in three publications¹. This project had an impact on the employment and education structure at that time. In 1986 Prof. Murphree of the Centre of Applied Social Sciences and the Round Table were of the opinion that a study on redressive action would be of value. The Round Table Race Relations Trust together with the Webb Estate for Race Relations Research provided funds for a two year project to run from 1988 to 1990. The Round Table Race Relations Trust has been involved for twenty years in promoting research in the field of race relations which will be of benefit to improving race and ethnic relations in this country.

The Redressive Action Employment Policy Project was conducted over two years from October 1988 to September 1990. The project set out to examine how the new Zimbabwe Government of 1980 undertook to correct the 'racial' and gender imbalances in the employment structure. At Independence local whites were dominant in all skilled and professional occupations in the public and private sectors. The project involved analyzing all available Government data and carrying out about seventy interviews in the private sector and the public sectors. It also involved a review of Government policy documents, newspapers and other secondary source material. Those interviewed are not named in the course of the Report as they were assured that their comments would be treated as confidential. Professor Murphree and an Advisory Committee monitored the project. The Advisory Committee comprised of representatives from the Institute of Personnel Management, the Ministry of Labour, Manpower Planning and Social Welfare, the Ministry of the Public Service, and the Round Table Race Relations Trust. The Committee was chaired by Professor Murphree.

The study done in the 1970s focused on the education, training, aspirations and post-school experience of school leavers, in particular black school leavers. The project carried out from 1988 - 1990 examined the impact of government redressive action employment policy on redressing racial and gender imbalances in employment. Racial imbalances in employment in the public and private sector have largely been redressed. However there remains only a very small percentage of women, particularly black women, in formal employment and action is still needed to redress this situation. The major problem of the 1970s has still not been solved. The aspirations of school leavers and job possibilities for school leavers are issues which redressive action did not address. The numbers of women in formal employment is also connected to the availability of jobs. Having largely solved the issue of 'racial' imbalances in employment, a major policy issue for Government is the appropriate education and training, and the availability of productive employment for Zimbabwe's hundreds of thousands of school leavers.

¹ M.W. Murphree and others, Education, Race and Employment in Rhodesia, 1975; B. Mothobi, Training for Development, 1978; J. May, Where do We Go From Here?, 1978.

1. INTRODUCTION: THE ISSUE OF TERMINOLOGY - AFRICANISATION.
BLACK ADVANCEMENT AND REDRESSIVE ACTION.

"Earlier academic studies into the social significance of the racial factor concentrated on the socio-psychological dynamics of racial prejudice. More recently it has been realised that attitudes, although of great importance tend to be secondary to the situations which engender them: If research confirms anything, it is that prejudice is the product of situations, historical situations, economic situations political situations; it is not a little demon that emerges in people simply because they are deprived" (Murphree, 1975:6).

"While capable and qualified black professionals have made rapid progress in the public sector since Independence, it should be glaringly obvious to most that few have so far made it to the top in the private sector. In fact, one can virtually count the black chief executives of the major corporations on one hand" (The Herald, 4/10/85).

This report will examine redressive action employment policy, and its impact on the racial and gender imbalances in employment in the public and private sectors since 1980. Historically blacks were excluded from settler-colonial society, especially from decision making in politics. Few blacks moved up the occupational scale in the public or the private sector. The education and training system served as an instrument of settler-colonial society. Whites were given priority in access to secondary, university and technical education, and whites dominated middle and high level occupational categories in the public and private sectors. At a skilled level whites controlled the trade unions. They ensured that their members did not receive competition from black labour, keeping black workers in unskilled and semi-skilled jobs.

Redressive action in Zimbabwe, whilst not fundamentally different from other African countries, has some particular features. Zimbabwe has a much larger local or resident white population than most other African states. The country had significantly more black graduates than most other African states at the time of their independence. The Zimbabwe economy is relatively developed with a highly diversified industrial, commercial and agricultural base. A significant amount of this economic activity has been dependent upon local white entrepreneurial skills and capital. The country also experienced a far more protracted and bitter war than most other African states in order to put an end to white minority rule. All these features have influenced the specifics of the redressive action process in Zimbabwe.

1.1 Africanisation

In all newly independent African countries the issue of Africanisation has had centre stage from independence. This was to be expected with the glaring colour-based inequities of colonial society. Politically, Africanisation was imperative. Decolonisation by definition was the transfer of power to the local black or African population. It was also perceived as being important economically in overcoming serious skills shortages which had developed in the lead up to or following the achievement of independence. Africanisation in most African countries has been synonymous with

localisation and has applied in particular to employment and ownership in the economy. In referring to employment it implies the replacement of expatriates or foreigners with local, generally black personnel. Economically the term refers to increasing local black ownership and participation in the economy through a number of measures. These include nationalisation, localisation of ownership and/or control of foreign-owned companies through shared equity arrangements, and buy-outs of foreign owned companies.

The policy instruments for Africanisation of employment in most of sub-Saharan Africa have been controls of immigration and the rights of non-nationals to work in the country, and the expansion of education and training at all levels. The priority in Africanising employment was the civil service. This was essentially for political reasons. Independence in essence meant handing political power over to the black population. Blacks were automatically put into positions because they were black and local, ie. it was de facto affirmative action or positive discrimination.

1.2 White Migration

In Zimbabwe the policy issues become more complex primarily because the colonisers have settled and become locals. According to the census of 1969 the white population was 4,5% of the total population or 230 000. Projections of the Central Statistical Office (Salisbury, October 1976) stated that in 1975 the white population was 277 000. Table 1 shows that according to the 1982 census the white population was 147 000 or 2% of the total population of Zimbabwe.

Table 1
Population by Ethnic Group: 1969 and 1982

	1982		1969	
	no. in '000s	%	no. in '000s	%
Africans	7 291	97,6	4 880	95,0
Whites	147	2,0	230	4,5
Asians	11	0,1	9	0,2
Coloureds	21	0,3	15	0,3

Source: Statistical Yearbook 1985, CSO, p.15, based on 1969 and 1982 census.

Between 1975 and 1982 40 to 50 percent of the white population emigrated. From the mid-1970's white emigration rose steeply with some 95 000 people (largely white) emigrating between 1976 and 1985 (see Table 2 over page). In addition a proportion of whites left as tourists, but did not return. The statistics therefore underestimate both the level of emigration, and the drain on the available pool of skills.

Table 3 shows how the emigration of professional, technical and related, clerical and related, and production and related personnel increased from the mid-1970s exacerbating skill shortages in the economy. It is interesting to note from Table 3 that immigration of professional, technical and related personnel has remained more or less constant, with a slight increase from the mid-1960s to the mid-1980s. Emigration in these categories has also been high and constant. Immigration of clerical, production and related and sales on the other hand was high prior 1980, and then dropped off dramatically. This is the result of stringent foreign recruitment controls and Africanisation at skilled level. However, emigration of production and related and clerical workers has also remained high, as high as the professional, technical and related category. It is in this area where a shortage is still evident in 1989, despite expectations to the contrary in view of Africanisation at skilled level.

Table 2
Immigration and Emigration: 1975 - 1986

Date	Immigrants: - TOTAL	of which active economically ²	Emigrants: - TOTAL	of which active economically ³	Net Migration - TOTAL	Net Migration of Skills - TOTAL
1975	12 552	5 595	9 242	4 270	3 310	725
1976	7 941		13 013		- 5 072	
1977	5 914		14 556		- 8 642	
1978	4 650		16 467		-11 817	
1979	3 647		12 951		- 9 304	
1980	6 407	3 017	17 240	6 445	-10 833	- 3 428
1981	7 794		20 534		-12 740	
1982	7 715		17 942		-10 227	
1983	9 944		19 067		-12 123	
1984	5 567		16 979		-11 412	
1985	5 471	2 339	6 918	2 888	- 1 447	- 549
1986	4 452		3 787		665	

Source: Quarterly Digest of Statistics, December 1986, CSO:2.

² See Table 3 - Economically active immigrants and emigrants.

³ See Footnote 2.

Table 3
Economically Active Immigrants and Emigrants
by Occupational Category: 1965 - 1985

Occupations	ECONOMICALLY ACTIVE IMMIGRANTS				ECONOMICALLY ACTIVE EMIGRANTS			
	During UDI		Post Independence		During UDI		Post Independence	
	1965	1975	1980	1985	1965	1975	1980	1985
Professional, technical and related	1 172	1 245	1 158	1 394	955	1 399	1 602	1 091
Admin and managerial	314	201	279	146	377	360	431	203
Clerical and related	871	1 163	480	142	517	1 084	1 563	405
Service	411	300	150	45	377	360	431	203
Agricultural and related	203	291	138	37	103	150	243	114
Production and related	1 216	155	96	69	410	959	1 393	664
Sales	327	2 185	627	412	195	327	303	72
Inadequately described	164	55	89	75	116	421	521	92
Armed Forces	69	-	-	1	25	-	-	987
TOTAL:	4 747	5 595	3 017	2 339	2 791	4 870	6 445	2 888

Despite their small numbers, in 1980 local whites occupied virtually all skilled and highly paid occupations. Local white and foreign capital owned and controlled most of the economy. How does a new Government go about the transfer of ownership to blacks and increase their participation in the economy, the administration and control of the state, access to and participation in the labour market? It was not simply a matter of Africanising through controlling the number of foreigners in employment, as was the case with most other colonies.

A variety of preferential and non-preferential policy initiatives have been used to redress imbalances of colour and gender in the labour market in countries such as the USA, Britain and Zimbabwe. Preferential policy measures, known as affirmative action or positive discrimination, involve giving preference to blacks or women in appointment and promotion. Affirmative action involves appointing and promoting people to positions or occupations previously held by whites or men because they are black or female in order to redress historical inequities.

The criterion of merit in appointment and promotion tends to become secondary. A vital component to an affirmative action programme that does not self-destruct is therefore education and training. This is to ensure that whilst people are given accelerated promotion, they are able to do the job competently and not as 'an affirmative action appointee' - i.e. not quite 'up to standard'.

Affirmative action is not the only nor always the best way to redress all aspects of imbalances in the labour market. Non-policy measures such as moral persuasion, and non-preferential policy measures are also aimed at equalising access for blacks and women to the labour market but do not involve positive discrimination. One example of a non-preferential policy measure is legislation which makes discrimination illegal (except for positive discrimination), and includes the means to monitor the implementation of such legislation. Another example is the provision of more education and training facilities ensuring access for blacks and women to the labour market.

The dilemma for a new government is that whilst it is committed to non-racial democracy, how does it reach that situation without affirmative action to overcome historical inequities. Positive action is necessary. The specific objectives and time-frame of such action does need to be clearly defined. A combination of preferential and non-preferential policy initiatives, plus non-policy measures have been used in Zimbabwe in attempting to redress colour and gender imbalances in employment. Redressive action is the term which encompasses the different approaches to the problem, and the term which will be used in the course of this report.

Yet another term used is black advancement. Black advancement has been used in Zimbabwe and South Africa in relation to the private sector. The terms affirmative action and black advancement have been used in Zimbabwe and South Africa in preference to Africanisation which is perceived as offensive to local whites who consider themselves African. In addition Africanisation is interpreted as having Africanist connotations, hence supporting the view that whites have no place in Africa.

The issue of terminology can be emotive and confusing. The term redressive action is relatively less emotive. It is largely whites who interpret the terminology emotionally. The reason is that whatever the term, they have difficulty with the political reality of the need to redress historical inequities and come to terms with blacks as equals. Whites who cannot accept the necessity for redressive action have not come to terms with the political reality of post-independent Africa. In Zimbabwe a protective and prejudiced attitude on the part of whites has slowed down the process of redressive action.

1.4 Issues in Implementing a Redressive Action policy

Experiences of other African and Asian countries and the United States provide important lessons on the problems arising in the course of redressive action. To summarise some of the ideas of Prof. Murphree expressed in the *Zimbabwe Journal of Economics* September 1979 in an article entitled *Africanising Employment in Zimbabwe*:

- An 'Africanisation' policy should be explicit and statements made of its intent, duration and extent, avoiding the uncertainties of covert ad hoc implementation.
- It should be occupation specific and time -specific, requiring careful manpower planning.
- The value of white skills should not be self-proclaimed, and should take cognisance of sensitive economic and political structures.
- Efforts should be made to provide whites displaced by 'Africanisation' policies with opportunities for occupational mobility to positions where their skills are transferable and needed.
- An 'Africanisation' policy must avoid cosmetic window dressing.
- While an 'Africanisation' policy is granting preferential employment to someone *because they are black*, and is necessary for political reasons, it is in the long run disastrously counterproductive if the person does not have the potential to achieve the required performance in an appropriate time-span. An Africanisation policy must extend only so far as potential is available. Hence the importance of the training component. In other words, merit is still an important factor, and not simply colour.
- Lastly, the principle justification for the discriminatory nature of Africanisation is that it is a temporary suspension of the principle of non-racialism in order to achieve that ultimate objective. Vigilance is required to ensure that the expedient does not become a principle. *The policy should therefore be designed within specific time frameworks, and implementation subject to continuous review.* While Africanisation is in one form or another inevitable it requires careful planning and implementation so as to be restricted to a temporary phase leading from Africanisation to Zimbabweanisation. To ignore the issue, whether by denial or wishful thinking that somehow change will occur does not serve everyone's best interests.

It is clear that a well-planned, time-specific approach is necessary to the issue of Africanisation.

The focus of this report is the use of non-policy initiatives, preferential and non-preferential policy measures to redress racial imbalances in the labour market in Zimbabwe. The issue of ownership will be briefly discussed as it does affect black participation in the labour market. The conclusion will examine some policy implications of the Zimbabwe experience.

2. THE SOCIO-ECONOMIC BACKGROUND AND THE NECESSITY FOR REDRESSIVE ACTION

Prior to 1980, colour or race divided all aspects of Zimbabwean society. Education, income, occupation and ownership in the economy were all divided along lines of colour.

2.1 Colonial Philosophy of Education and Training

From the early 1900s education for Africans was to prepare them for manual work. H S Keigwin, who became Director of the Department of Native Development in 1918, stressed that Africans should not have an education that would bring them into competition with whites:

"If we do not intend to admit blacks, be it now or by degrees, to encroach on social equality, let us not put false ideas into their heads nor encourage them to foster hopes of equality" (cited in R. Zvobgo, 1985:17).

Huggins, who became Prime Minister in 1934, set out to ensure white privilege through providing whites with a superior education. In 1937 he stated:

"I will go a little further and say that it is only by allowing our race the very best education and bringing out the latent talents there that we will enable our race to survive in Africa. I will go even further and admit that although our youth may be able to play Rugby and would protect their skin with differential legislation, they will not be able to preserve their white brain. If they are to survive, it will be by nothing but superior education" (ibid.:18).

From the early 1930s exclusion of Africans from skilled trades through the Industrial Conciliation Act was meant to ensure that education and training would keep white youth from becoming poor whites. In 1951 Chairman of the Select Committee into Technical Education stated:

"One thing we must observe and take very serious consideration of is the large number of natives who are now working in the industrial field, working with an aptitude which seems peculiar to the native mind, and native hands. By technical education we must ensure that even the lowest strata of European labour shall not be passed by the intelligent native up the industrial ladder while the European labourer is coming down" (cited in Mothobi 1978:50).

2.2 The Effects of the Colonial Philosophy

This philosophy was evident up until 1980. In 1978 expenditure per black pupil was \$44 and per white pupil was \$500 (Riddell, 1980:23). In 1977 whereas all of the 127 560 white, Coloured and Asian employees in the formal sector had a secondary education, 50 percent of Africans in formal employment had no formal schooling at all. Most of the remainder of the African workforce had 4 to 7 years primary schooling (Murphree, 1975:267).

At independence, the education system was not meeting the inputs needed for the economy to expand and, as well, to include more of the black population directly in the dynamic process of post-independence development.

The unemployment rate amongst Africans has always been much higher than that of whites. Only 16 percent of the total black population was employed in the formal sector in 1976 (920 000). In 1976 the total number of economically active whites was 115 000. Over 45 percent of the white population was employed in the formal sector (115 000 out of 268 000) (Stoneman, 1978:5). One of the most important reasons for the low rate of African employment in the formal sector was the structure of the settler economy. Africans had been moved from the fertile farming lands into the Tribal Trust Lands. Only a small proportion had entered the labour market. Because of high population growth rates this land became insufficient, over-grazed and infertile and, in what was meant to be a rural economy, generated mass under- and unemployment. By the end of the 1970s the lack of African employment opportunities in the formal sector was a growing and serious problem. Due to the land question and unemployment not being adequately addressed in the 1980s, unemployment was to become an even bigger problem in the first ten years after independence.

Income distribution, like access to education and employment, is another indicator of the social inequality of the colonial philosophy of education and training, and the disparities between the formal and subsistence economy. In 1976 the Gross Domestic Product of Rhodesia was \$2 000 million. Of this, 58 percent was paid in salaries and wages - 34 percent to whites and 22 percent to blacks (then 89 percent of the workforce). This excluded profits from companies, from which whites would have benefited primarily. Overall, whites had a per capita income of \$2 158 and blacks a per capita income of \$95 (including incomes from rural households) per annum. The ratio of black to white earnings was 1:10.8 on average, and 1:24 in agriculture and forestry (Stoneman, 1978:5).

The distribution of income in relation to population illustrates the fact that it was whites who occupied the most lucrative jobs, i.e. professional and technical, administrative and managerial, and skilled occupations. In the study entitled *Education, Race and Employment in Rhodesia* (1975) Prof. Murphree showed that Africans occupied 15 percent of professional and managerial posts, 8 percent of skilled and technical posts, 64 percent clerical and supervisory posts, and 100 percent semi- and un-skilled posts. It was the preferential educational and training opportunities open to whites at all levels that facilitated and consolidated the unequal distribution of skills and occupations between white and black in the economy.

2.3 The Developing Skills Shortage in the 1970s

By the 1970s industry began to feel the shortage of skills in the economy due to the economic growth of the UDI period. In 1970 the President of the Chamber of Mines said:

"We are not far off the point where this shortage of skilled personnel will severely restrict the further expansion of the industry." (Riddell, 1978:90).

From 1975 Africans began to be absorbed into skilled work, although this was not formally recognised through job recategorisation or an increase in wages. Incorporation of Africans into skilled work was done largely through job fragmentation and some increased training. There was no real change in the racial structure of the labour force. White trade union officials even resisted the fragmentation. In their view fragmentation meant undercutting them. Africans doing the jobs for lower wages would eventually eliminate the white skilled worker and so increase the profits for employers (Mothobi, 1978:76).

Movement of Africans into technical training and the apprenticeship system was a challenge to the vested interests of white labour and white society. Despite the needs of the economy, prejudice remained. Mothobi noted in 1978 that:

"A senior labour official admitted that any white, whatever calibre, could get an apprenticeship... One Authority officertold me that a great number of white youths...who were accepted for apprenticeship training, could not hold their own in open competition with African youths and were only being taken on because some firms have policies to give opportunities of apprenticeship to sons or relatives of workers, or take them on to please their parents." (Mothobi, 1978:60)

It is no surprise that education and technical training of Africans became synonymous with the Africanisation of skilled trades previously dominated by whites, and one of the most pressing areas of Government manpower policy soon after independence.

Africans began to move into skilled jobs because there was an increasing number of white skilled workers emigrating or doing army service, and the shortage of skills in the economy began to be felt more acutely. A shortage had always existed due to the discrimination in education and employment, and a lack of an adequate training infrastructure for industry. This shortage had been met through an active policy of white immigration. However, immigration began to decline sharply in the 1970s (see Table 2)

The number of African apprentices being indentured went from 1.67 percent of the total in 1970, to 16.38 percent of the total in 1976 (Murphree, 1975:106.)

Table 4
Source of Skills

Year	Immigration	Apprenticeship Training
1970	80%	20%
1976	65%	35%

In this same period the ratio of immigration to apprenticeship training as a source of skills was reduced from 80 percent:20 percent to 65 percent:35 percent (Mothobi, 1978:22).

Colclough and Murray (1978) in a study done for the Commonwealth Secretariat found that despite the fact that whites occupied some 63 percent of the 200 000 skilled jobs in the economy, there was a supply of Africans to fill the gaps which would be created with white emigration. There were considerable numbers of graduates being trained abroad, and some from within the country. Due to this Zimbabwe did not find itself with the crippling shortage experienced in other African countries at the time of independence. However Colclough and Murray predicted that there would be shortages in crucial areas where white high level skills were dominant: engineers, administrators, scientists and accountants (Colclough and Murray, 1978:33-40). This prediction was revealed to be correct in the post-1980 period.

Up to 1980 there was no comprehensive analysis of the level of black skills in the economy so accurate assessments of skills shortages could not be made. As will be shown in the section on statistics below, there has not been a comprehensive comparative analysis of skills since 1980.

In the early 1970s black advancement in the labour market had not yet begun. The study carried out by the Centre for Inter-Racial Studies of the University in the 1970s found that:

"...employment policy and practice in respect to the allocation of jobs and rewards for work are generally not merit-based, and ... are constrained by the mechanisms of racial discrimination" (M. W. Murphree, 1975:26).

By the mid-1970s some employers began to realise the necessity for change. In addition to the increasing shortage of white skills, through emigration and the escalation of the war, the changing political climate and enlightened self-interest on the part of larger employers led some to begin to address the issue of black advancement at skilled level. The 1977 Annual Report of Empress Nickel Mine (Rio Tinto) stated:

"In 1977 we removed all reference to race in the classification of our employees and divided them into two groups based on the importance to the company of the work that they do, group 1 being unskilled and group 2 being skilled".

According to Rio Tinto, "our policy was directed to the desire to survive as a multinational company" (interview 19/6/86).

Similarly in 1977 Anglo-American took initiatives in relation to black advancement because:

"We experienced Zambianisation and nationalisation of the mining companies in Zambia. In 1977 a lot of top people came from Zambia to draw up a programme for black advancement in Zimbabwe. We knew from our experience in Zambia, that when there was a new Government here, they were going to push for Zimbabweanisation" (interview 22/7/86).

Murphree (1979:23) likened this early black advancement phase in Zimbabwe to the 'equalisation practice' in the USA in the late 1950s and early 1960s. He cites Dr Broby, of the University of Rhodesia, who in 1978 found management committed to 'equal opportunity' programmes:

"Training programmes for Africans at supervisory and management levels have already been implemented and the introduction of equal job opportunities is being generally explored. Concepts such as localisation, indigenisation, and Africanisation have become part of senior management's repartee. The term 'localisation' appears to have taken preference over the others, as it is devoid of any racial connotation. Localisation is already widely practised both here and elsewhere by many of the multinational corporations trading in this country. Indeed a policy of localisation has been put forward as one of the arguments in favour of the presence of multinationals in developing countries. Such a personnel policy provides expanded job opportunities for the indigenous population, and is contributory to the creation of a pool of well trained manpower.

The neutrality of the 'equal opportunity employer' approach reflects the rational goal of the enterprise in combining labour, capital resources and managerial expertise in the best possible way. This policy, espoused by the Institute of Personnel Management (Southern Africa) rejects 'Africanisation' since it is claimed that this would lead to discrimination in reverse, and such a state of affairs would not be in

the interest of the individual or the enterprise. Equal opportunity, they say, opens the way for a truly multi-racial environment, at least as far as the work context is concerned".

The attitude of much of the private sector in the 1980s has been to support the idea of Zimbabweanisation and localisation, rather than Africanisation and black advancement. Such a view is sometimes genuine, but also often opportunist and an excuse for going slow on black advancement. It also does not provide for a corrective mechanism. If blacks have historically been denied access to education and employment, this approach provides no evidence of how access is going to be facilitated and therefore guaranteed.

In Government during the 1970s in the Public Service there was not even an 'equalisation policy'. The 1960 Report of the Advisory Commission on the Review of the Constitution of Southern Rhodesia and Nyasaland stated that:

"There are at present no Non-Europeans serving in the Southern Rhodesia Civil Service, though the Southern Rhodesia Government have announced their intention of taking early action to admit them" (B. Raftopolous, 1985:9).

The settler colonial regime did not permit an African civil servant to rise above the middle rank of senior administrative officer. One of the reasons for this was given in 1979 by a Minister for the Public Service in the UDI Government:

"The mere possession of an academic qualification is not in itself a criterion for appointment to any job ... We have to consider suitability of the candidates bearing in mind certain factors. Perhaps the most important single factor so far as the Public Service is concerned is loyalty to the State ... Secondly, national security" (Bulawayo Chronicle 18/4/87).

Being white was obviously a guarantee to the security of the state. Whilst there was an increase in numbers of blacks in administrative fields during the Smith-Muzorewa Government of 1979, some action was clearly necessary in relation to the civil service when the ZANU (PF) Government came to power in 1980.

At Board level, a handful of companies began to incorporate blacks to improve their image. However, in general companies and Government relied largely on whites for middle and high level personnel right up to 1980. Before 1980 African graduates found great difficulty in getting jobs, with the exception of teaching posts.

2.5 The Need for Redressive Action

Some have argued that UDI produced 'a small economic miracle'. The economy diversified, it had a growth rate of about 8 percent per annum, education and employment grew, and the country did have a small but efficient workforce. This is all so. But it was largely the white population who benefitted from these developments. The white population had the money to buy the increasing range of consumer goods produced locally, they were assured of education and jobs, and had one of the highest standards of living in the world. However, when one examines the education system and the structure of the economy which the new Government inherited, one can only conclude that serious structural changes would have to be made to the economy before the majority of the population would have access to an education and a job.

In 1980, the new Government inherited an extremely difficult task. There was a vast disparity between white and black in terms of access to education and training, income and employment, and ownership. It is this background which necessitated action on the position of blacks in the employment structure. Redressive action on the part of Government was initiated with this history in mind. For political reasons action was necessary to redress the effects of the colonial past. It was also necessary for technical reasons in order to develop an indigenous skilled human resource base, representative of all sections of the population.

2.6 The 1981 National Manpower Survey

On paper and in statement, the Zimbabwe Government from 1980 committed itself to 'socialist transformation'. In terms of human resources specifically, in the Government National Manpower Survey of 1981, Prime Minister Mugabe stated:

"The object of Government was to plan for manpower utilisation and training in accordance with its socialist objectives.... Of fundamental importance is the commitment and organisation capacity to transform the relations of production in which such utilisation takes place" (NMS, Vol 1, 1981:1).

In the same statement Prime Minister Mugabe highlighted three features which characterised the human resources of the inherited settler economy:

- *the dominance of white skills in all sectors of the colonial economy;*
- *the lack of skills amongst the African population;*
- *the possibility of a mass exodus of whites soon after independence"*
(NMS, Vol 1, 1981:1).

The Ministry of Labour, Manpower Planning and Social Welfare (MLMPSW) was established soon after independence with the difficult task of resolving this colonial heritage. The Department of Research and Planning (DRP) was established to:

"Determine a framework for national decision-making on manpower and to suggest alternative projects and programmes for eliminating manpower gaps ... to begin to plan and correct the distorted manpower situation inherited from the colonial past ... and to provide immediate measures regarding manpower development and utilisation ... (and to) draft medium and long term plans on manpower" (MLMPSW, DRP, 1987:3).

The Department of Labour, Manpower Planning and Social Welfare has concentrated on the task of "development and utilisation of human resources to fill gaps and imbalances in the light of economic developments" (MLMPSW, DRP, 1987:3). Government has in essence concentrated on the redressive aspects of employment policy, although without much evidence of manpower planning.

At independence there were serious gaps in the data available to allow for comprehensive human resource planning, utilisation and development. The first task that the Ministry set itself therefore was the National Manpower Survey (NMS) in order to provide:

"the data base upon which to plan for the transformation of manpower utilisation in accordance with ... socialist objectives" (NMS, Vol 1:3).

The objectives of the NMS were fourfold:

- to assess the size and characteristics of the workforce at professional, skilled and semi-skilled levels;
- to assess the potential of Zimbabweans working or studying abroad;
- to assess existing shortages with regard to professional, skilled and semi-skilled personnel;
- to formulate short, medium and long term policies for education and training to meet the country's development requirements (NMS, Vol 1:43,45).

The NMS did make a significant contribution to the data gap, although it excluded from its survey the armed forces, domestic workers, subsistence agriculture and the informal sector (NMS, Vol 1:21). The latter three areas are the sectors where women predominate. To a limited extent, the Survey did assess shortages, although only in relation to present demand. The Survey did not provide an analysis of human resource requirements for a changing Zimbabwe. General strategies were proposed, especially the expansion of education and training at all levels, but not a strategy which detailed how to overcome specific shortage areas. Such detail should be the essential aspect of any redressive action employment policy. In Zimbabwe the political aspects of redressive action employment policy have always been given more attention and emphasis than the more technical aspects of the problem in the form of carefully measured implementation.

The primary thrust of the National Manpower Survey was political. In contradiction with some of its results, one of its objectives, was to deny a shortage of black skills and a reliance on white technical and professional personnel, namely "white indispensability in the economy" (NMS, Vol 1:21). According to the NMS, colonialism did generate:

"formally or informally a whole corpus of skills among the African people. The scope and extent of these skills however remained largely concealed behind white settler ideological rhetoric and their official statistics all of which were designed to emphasise the assumed indispensability of white skills ... (and) that there was a dearth of skills among the African people in Zimbabwe" (ibid:34,35).

According to the NMS the mechanisms for ensuring this were job reservation, undercategorisation of skills, and under-utilisation and unemployment of African skilled and professional personnel (NMS, Vol 1:34,35). In its effort to prove that white skills were not indispensable, the NMS credited the colonial education and training system with more than was due to it. The result was a tendency on the part of Government to overlook the urgent need to develop the skill capacity of the black population in a planned manner. The NMS maintained that:

"the economy was only 5 percent below employment capacity in 1981 (and) that there can be no doubt therefore that 'manpower shortage' as such cannot be the main constraint to economic development in post-colonial Zimbabwe" (NMS, Vol 1:39,53).

Despite some of the more rhetorical and contradictory aspects of the NMS, on the basis of the NMS certain immediate policy issues were tackled, "primarily those aspects resulting from colonial prejudices and inadequacies" (NMS, Vol.1:58). The Ministry of Labour, Manpower Planning and Social Services used the NMS as a basis for initiating a National Manpower Strategy to rectify racial imbalances and provide "a stable and reliable force making skills truly national" (Towards a National Development Strategy, MLMPSW, 1982:5).

3. REDRESSIVE ACTION IN THE LABOUR MARKET: NON-POLICY, PREFERENTIAL AND NON-PREFERENTIAL MEASURES.

3.1 Imbalances of colour and gender in the labour market

At the time of independence whites were dominant in the skilled and better paid jobs in the professional, technical, administrative, managerial, and certified skilled occupations. The majority of Africans in the labour force were unskilled or semi-skilled labourers. Gender imbalances in the labour force were just as striking. Women comprised only 13 percent of total formal employment in 1980, and only 7.5 percent of manufacturing employees. Two-thirds of African women in formal employment were in unskilled jobs, as opposed to most white women who were in salaried positions.

The education and training system reinforced the division of labour based on colour by guaranteeing whites access to secondary, technical and university education. In contrast, only a small minority of Africans had access to secondary and tertiary education.

Whilst Africanisation of ownership has not become a major issue in the first ten years of independence, Africanisation of employment most definitely has. Non-policy, preferential and non-preferential measures were used by the Government after 1980 in their effort to redress the historical inequities in the labour market.

3.2 Preferential Policy Measures or Affirmative Action

Preferential policy measures, otherwise known as positive discrimination or affirmative action, are used primarily for political and equity reasons. Affirmative action in favour of people of a particular colour or gender in the labour market is a result of political necessity and the need to reduce historical inequities. In the case of Zimbabwe in 1980, it was necessary to Africanise the civil service for political reasons in order to meet the aspirations for political power developed in the course of the liberation struggle.

On 2nd May 1980 President Banana issued a Presidential Directive to the Public Service Commission which is responsible for appointments and promotions in the Public Service. The constitutional basis for the Directive was in Chapter VII (75) (2) of the Constitution of Zimbabwe which states:

"The President may give general directions of policy to the Public Service Commission with the object of achieving a suitable representation of the various elements of the population in the Public Service and the Prison service."

The Directive stated that with the major tasks facing Government there would be great demands on the Service. It was necessary therefore to expand the Service, and to give the African people of Zimbabwe the opportunity of playing their part in the development process. In this context the statement said:

"At present the majority of senior posts are filled by European officers. The Government continues to need the services of these officers to ensure a high standard of efficiency in carrying out these new and expanding programmes. The Government wants to assure all European officers that it will continue to protect their terms of service and support the Public Service Commission in its statutory duties, that it will maintain the integrity of the Service, and that it is confident that the impending

The Presidential Directive lifted normal procedures of the Public Service Commission with regard to appointments and promotions in order to facilitate the accelerated promotion of blacks. The Presidential statement directed the Public Service Commission to:

- *recruit staff to all grades of the Public Service in such a manner as to bring about a balanced representation of the element's which make up Zimbabwe's population;*
- *to give more rapid advancement to suitably qualified Africans in appointments and promotions to senior posts in the Public Service;*
- *in carrying out these directions to maintain efficiency and satisfy career aspirations of existing public servants;*
- *to make annual reports on progress."*

The policy statement concluded by emphasising that:

"The objective is the early creation of a balanced Service fully representative of all elements of the population and with skills appropriate to the country's needs. For this a greater training effort will be required."

In appointments to senior posts preference was given to blacks who had the necessary qualifications, but not necessarily the required experience.

The Directive was also directed at the parastatals or state-owned corporations, although it was not legally binding on them. It was presumed that the 'spirit' of the Directive would be acted upon. In the absence of an equivalent body to the Public Service Commission to implement the Directive, the Minister responsible for the parastatal assumed this responsibility.

From a practical viewpoint the Directive has served its purpose. The Presidential Directive however remains in place, with its current role unclear. Whilst the Ministry of the Public Service do maintain that it is a Directive that could be used in the interests of whites, the phrasing of the document does not support this view. Other sources in Government maintain that the Directive is still used for supersession at high levels, for example in the appointment of permanent secretaries. Another argument put forward for maintaining the Directive is that there is still need for black advancement in the private sector. However, legally the Directive does not apply to the private sector. It does seem that the role and content of the Directive as it stands needs examination.

Outside of the public sector, affirmative action measures were not used by Government, although some individual companies and institutions adopted such measures on their own initiative.

3.3 Non-Preferential Measures

Non-preferential measures may include: first, no policy and moral persuasion in the hope that the situation will right itself; or second, the introduction of non-discriminatory initiatives to end discrimination. Examples of the latter include legislation to end discriminatory practices and changes to organisational structures to redress imbalances in the labour market.

3.3.1 The Non-Policy Approach - Pressure on the Private Sector

Government's initial approach to the private sector was one of no policy, but reconciliation and moral persuasion. On several occasions Government Ministers and the President appealed through public speeches to the private sector to address the issue of black advancement:

"Commerce and Industry must increase the rate of advancement of qualified blacks into senior positions. It is necessary however to maintain high standards of efficiency and satisfy career aspirations of existing staff" (Minister of Labour, The Herald 24/9/80).

"Employers cannot be allowed to continue resisting black advancement and recruitment in industry. Employers insist on recruiting expatriates. Once the Government moves on advancement in the private sector a lot of pressure will be put on employers" (Minister of Labour, The Herald, 15/9/81).

In 1984 at the Annual Congress of the Confederation of Zimbabwe Industries one Minister stated:

"There is an unwillingness on the part of the bigger boys in the CZI to democratise their boardrooms" (Herald 4.7.84).

In 1985 the CZI's own black president called on industry to undertake 'manpower planning programmes', and to establish targets and plans for black advancement:

"While it is expensive to train and sometimes duplicate positions to facilitate the black advancement process, it was a necessary cost" (Herald 3.10.85).

In 1986 the Minister of Labour, Manpower Planning and Social Welfare called for genuine black advancement, saying that black advancement was becoming increasingly cosmetic and meaningless (Herald 5.2.86).

In 1989 at his Independence Day speech President Mugabe attacked employers who hindered black advancement and who resorted to window dressing promotions. He said there were many blacks in positions of sales managers and personnel managers, but very few in top management positions (Herald 19.4.89).

Where it was possible, Government has exerted pressure on individual companies. Such pressure has in some instances led to positive results, but not always. In other instances, where companies simply want to satisfy Government for their own ends, it has led to political and window dressing appointments.

3.3.2 Non-Preferential Policy Measures

Government introduced a number of such measures:

3.3.2.1 Government's National Manpower Strategy. Government did introduce a number of non-discriminatory policy initiatives to redress imbalances of colour in the labour market. These were part of what Government termed in 1982 its 'national manpower strategy'. The object of the strategy was to rectify racial imbalances "make skills truly national". As part of this strategy there "has been

an element of planning - bonding of apprentices, centralised recruitment of apprentices, scholarships, programmes for shortage areas, expansion of polytechnics, foreign recruitment controls" (Interview, MLMPSW, 22/4/86). Whilst Government initiated this strategy, there is no available public Government document which elaborates, analyses or provides relevant data on this approach. The last available Annual Manpower Review dated 1985 provides data from 1984. So whilst Government intention may have been to formulate a strategy, there is no evidence of evaluation and progress.

The two key non-preferential measures used to redress colour imbalances in the labour market soon after 1980 were controls on foreign recruitment and significant expansion in education and training. Both these measures improved access for blacks to the labour market. In 1984 Government introduced the Manpower Planning and Development Act, and in 1985 the Labour Relations Act. Both Acts were part of Government redressive action initiatives.

3.3.2.2 Controls on foreign Recruitment. Legislation enacted soon after independence which tightened the procedure on foreign recruitment for middle and high level personnel has ensured more space for black personnel, and facilitated redressive action.

From its first policy document *Growth with Equity (1981)* Government stated that it was:

"fundamentally opposed to any system of external recruitment based on expatriate conditions" (Growth With Equity, 1981:8).

To ensure that foreign recruitment did not become an obstacle to the development of indigenous skills Government set up the Inter-Ministerial Manpower Planning Committee on Foreign Recruitment in the MLMPSW "to advise the Immigration Department on skill-based applications for permits to work in Zimbabwe" (NMS, 1981, Vol.1:64). The Committee on Foreign Recruitment established strict criteria for recruiting foreign personnel:

- that there are no unemployed and suitably qualified persons in the country;
- that the employer had genuinely explored the possibilities of filling the vacancy from within the establishment;
- that the foreign recruit has experience and is capable of training a Zimbabwean to fill his place (NMS. Vol.1:63).

In order to ensure that employer and foreign recruit abide by the regulations a Foreign Recruitment Monitoring team was set up in the MLMPSW. The Monitoring Team was to control the inflow of foreigners and check for a transfer of skills. However the Monitoring Team has itself faced problems due to a lack of technically qualified staff.

According to the National Manpower Survey in 1981 14 percent of the labour force were non-Zimbabweans (semi-skilled - 6%, skilled - 5% and professional- 3%) (Vol 3:187). This dropped to 7 percent in 1985. A very small proportion compared to other African countries, especially in the professional category. According to the NMS the skilled and professional non-Zimbabweans were found in accounting, architecture, all forms of engineering, finance, real estate, banking, mining and health. Whilst numerically insignificant, they were dominant in decision-making positions (NMS, Vol 3:187).

Tables 4a and 4b below show occupational category and nationality for 1981 and 1985. The high proportion of non-Zimbabweans in the administrative and managerial category in 1981 is illustrative of the point made in the NMS that they were relatively high in number in the decision-making positions. It is evident from the tables that in the professional and technical group, and in the administrative and managerial group there was significant drop in numbers. This drop reflects the numbers of non-Zimbabweans that became Zimbabweans due to changed citizenship regulations as well as stringent foreign recruitment controls.

Controls on foreign recruitment have contributed to the development of local personnel. However, interchange of skills is important and Zimbabwe does need such input from outside. In addition, in order to overcome shortages, it is cheaper to train personnel in Zimbabwe, and to bring foreign personnel here for certain fields, than to send Zimbabweans abroad. Companies where there are expatriates in top management are not happy with the mentor approach required by Government - i.e. the necessity for the individual to train and produce his or her replacement. They feel that there needs to be a much broader conception of training for top and senior management. Where a company has a training programme and succession planning, one of a few people will come to the top. But, this does take time.

If carefully controlled, expatriate personnel can make a positive contribution to Zimbabwe's development. This requires a detailed knowledge of areas where foreign skills and personnel would be beneficial, and a planned approach to their utilisation. To date the stress has been on control. Whilst there have been gains in terms of reversing the old policy, controls have possibly been a little too stringent in all sectors.

Table 4a
Nationality and Occupation: 1981

Occupation	Zimbabwean		Non-Zimbabwean		Dual Nationality		TOTAL NO.
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	
Professional & Technical	20 972	78	4 945	18	1 114	4	27 031
Administrative & Managerial	7 199	65	3 093	28	792	7	11 084
Agricultural & Forestry	35 202	82	7 449	17	520	1	43 171
Production & Related	104 294	89	12 469	11			116 763
TOTALS:	167 667		27 956		2 426		198 049

Source: Compiled from NMS, Vol 3:187.

Table 4b
Nationality and Occupation: 1985

Occupation	Zimbabwean		Non-Zimbabwean		TOTAL NO.
	No.	%	No.	%	
Professional & Technical	60 410	98	1 470	2	61 880
Administrative & Managerial	5 565	92	460	8	6 025
Agricultural & Forestry	102 021	88	14 023	12	116 044
Production & Related	109 607	92	10 165	9	119 772
TOTALS:	277 603		26 118		303 721

Source: Compiled from ARM, 1985:47.

(The above two tables are not directly comparable due to different sampling procedures. They only serve to provide an indication of proportional trends).

3.3.2.3 The Expansion of Education and Training. The expansion of education and training is crucial for redressing colour and gender imbalances in the labour market. The restructuring and expansion of education and training for those previously denied access to education is the most fundamental aspect of a redressive action strategy. Without it, access to employment is not possible. However, the dilemma for a new government is whether to put money into education or employment creation given limited resources. Zimbabwe put emphasis on investment in education, and less investment into job creation. This approach does give rise to long term problems of school leaver unemployment, frustrated aspirations, and difficulties in sustaining educational expansion in the long term.

Education and training is the area where Zimbabwe concentrated its resources as part of the effort to overcome unequal access to education and employment. Primary, secondary and tertiary education expanded at a rate unprecedented in Africa.

Table 5
Enrolments in Education: 1979 and 1985

Institutions	1979	1985
Primary schools	819 128	2 229 936
Secondary Schools	73 590	497 766
Teacher training	3 002	9 504
Agricultural colleges	171	888
Technical Colleges	3 663	18 213
Apprenticeships	805	1 436
University of Zimbabwe	1 481	4 742

Sources: ARM, 1984: 55; Socio-Economic Review, 1985: 170, 173, 175; Statistical Yearbook. 1987, CSO: 66).

Since 1981 Education has been the largest vote allocation in Government Expenditure, rising from 12,4% in 1979-80 to 19,7% of the budget in 1984-85. From 1985 the rate of expansion of education and the education budget began to raise serious problems in the context of rapidly rising unemployment - particularly of school leavers (390 000 in 1988), little productive investment and a generally negative economic growth rate. While expanding and providing education, Government did not have a policy for economic development which took sufficient cognisance of the need for growth in employment. While educational expansion did satisfy aspirations in 1980, in 1990 the demand is for employment.

3.3.2.4 The Manpower Planning and Development Act. The Manpower Planning and Development Act gave Government increased control over the recruitment and training of skilled workers including apprentices. Prior to this legislation, in 1982, Government introduced bonding of apprentices (working to repay training). The reason was that Government had become a training ground for South Africa and Australia with white apprentices training and then leaving the country.

The Manpower Planning and Development Act was intended to facilitate Africanisation of the skilled work force. Increased Government control over all aspects of technical and vocational training was perceived as necessary in order to overcome the skill shortages experienced after independence as a result of emigration, the racist nature of technical training under the previous regime, and the fact that training was to a fair degree left to employers and therefore depended on the economic climate and the racial prejudices of employers. Government wanted to overcome the racial character of technical training and ensure that there was sufficient supply of skilled, especially technical personnel for economic development.

In order to finance their increased role, in the early 1980s Government increased the training Levy paid by employers to Government from 0,1 percent to 1,0 percent of the employer's wage bill. Employers who trained employees in certain skills were to be eligible for rebate. The Levy was however badly administered. Few employers received rebates for few courses and after six years Government announced they were to put the accumulated money into buildings for training. The issue has led to resentment and resulted in smaller companies in particular reducing their training initiatives. Government has not provided any incentive for companies to train. This has been unfortunate in view of the importance of training to the black advancement and redressive action process.

Table 6
Apprentices Indentured According to Colour: 1981 and 1984

INDUSTRY	1981		1984	
	white	black	white	black
aircraft	85	30	7	43
automotive	313	147	47	96
building	18	139	4	56
electrical	189	161	29	225
mechanical	474	323	77	359
printing	51	56	10	28
hairdressing	41	17	7	11
TOTAL no:	1171	873	181	818
%:	57,3	38,2	18,1	81,9

Source: ARM, 1985: 46.

Note: Blacks includes Coloureds and Asians.

Much of the process of redressive action at skilled level was already set in motion by employers prior to the legislation. From Table 6 above it is evident that by 1984 82 percent of apprentices were black compared with only 38 percent in 1981 (ARM, 1985:46) There was however an overall reduction of 990 white indentured apprentices and 55 black. The number of apprentices under training during this period therefore halved, with serious consequences for industry. This has led to a shortage of journeymen with employers unwilling to take apprentices under existing government regulations.

The Act provided for the collection of all relevant data on 'manpower resources'. There is no accurate comparative data on colour, nationality, occupation, training, skills and income in Zimbabwe between 1980 and 1990. By 'comparative' is meant being able to compare the data on occupation, skills, education and training, incomes for blacks and whites, expatriates and Zimbabweans, 1980 - 1990. Prior to 1980 comparative data of this nature was not collected. Since 1980 there has been the National Manpower Survey of 1981, and the Annual Occupational Survey conducted by the Ministry of Labour and Manpower Planning. The 1985 Annual Review of Manpower provides the most recent available data from the Annual Occupational Survey of 1984. The MLMPSW has not made any survey data available since 1985.

In 1987 the Central Statistical Office conducted a Labour Force Survey. The object of the 1987 CSO Survey was to give a broad picture of the size, qualifications, composition and activities of the total labour force. It did not attempt to provide accurate data of the skilled labour force {narrowly defined} in terms of colour, nationality, occupation, training, qualifications and income, although it did provide some more general data. The main problem with all these surveys is that none are comparable, having all used different samples and methodology, each with their own problems. So it is not possible to have an accurate picture of trends in the skilled labour force since 1980, or a comprehensive analysis of human resources development and the impact of redressive action in Zimbabwe since 1980. For purposes of analysis, as well as human resource planning and development it would be useful for the Ministry of Labour and Manpower Planning to make more data available.

The key data available on skill and colour is provided in the tables A1 - A4 in the Appendix. The tables show that there has been a significant reduction in the numbers and proportions of whites in skilled and professional occupations. The only area where the proportion of whites is still significant proportionately is in administrative and managerial occupations (32 percent in 1987). Administrative and managerial occupations in fact comprise under 2 percent of the labour force. It is however around black advancement into administrative and managerial occupations that there has been the most controversy.

3.3.2.5 The Labour Relations Act. In 1985 Government introduced the Labour Relations Act which applies only to the private sector (i.e. not the parastatals and the Public Service). This essentially non-preferential measure is the central piece of legislation which addresses discrimination in the labour market. Section 5 states that "no employer shall discriminate against any employee on the grounds of race, tribe, place of origin, political opinion, colour, creed or sex" in relation to advertisement, recruitment, job classification, wages, salaries and benefits, or any other matter related to employment. In the Act a person is deemed to have discriminated if he treats any person from the aforementioned categories "less favourably, or more favourably" than another person from another of these groups.

The stated objective of the Act is to ensure equal opportunity for all. Equal opportunity is defined as "the right of all persons to advance on the basis of merit, ability and potential, regardless of race, tribe, place of origin, political opinion, colour, creed or sex". Employment discrimination is defined as "all intentional or unintentional employment practices which have an unequal effect on the employment opportunities of persons or groups of persons because of their race, colour, religion, sex or tribe" (MLMPSW Memorandum No.1 1987).

to inspect and monitor all institutions and organisations in the private sector for discrimination in terms of appointments and promotions in employment. It also provided for investigation where complaints of discrimination were reported in terms of the Labour Relations Act. A Memorandum from the Ministry on procedures to be followed when investigating discrimination cases in terms of the Act outlines a lengthy procedure of interviews and examination of company files and practices (MLMSW, Memorandum 1 1987). Justifying the need to "identify discriminatory employment systems and root them out", the document states:

"Since ... the coming to power of a non-racial Government destructive and consistent employment discrimination remains confirmed by statistics, job actions and attitudes and practices of some major corporations and other institutions in this country. Much of this post-independence discrimination particularly against blacks still persists through intentional acts of employers ... But the most pervasive discrimination today results from employment practices which are neutral on their face but discriminatory in their applications. Such actions include the use of employment agencies and black Industrial Relations Officers to launder discrimination, the old boy network, promotion policies which insist on promoting from within, job requirements which insist on experience and qualifications which do not reflect the actual needs of the job or the current reality of our manpower resources".

However, implementation of key areas of the Act in relation to racial discrimination have been difficult and therefore limited. The Ministry has not been able to monitor effectively against discriminatory practices as they have too few personnel (MLMPSW, interview 24/5/90). In effect this means that insufficient mechanisms were put in place to implement the Act. Neither did the Act provide for corrective measures to overcome practices and imbalances resulting from past discrimination.

In terms of the Act, positive discrimination or affirmative action is actually illegal. No provision is made in the Act for any exemption from anti-discriminatory segments of the Act. In other words if any white manager contested a failure to be promoted because of a black advancement programme he would probably win in the courts (interview, Labour Relations Officer, MLMSW, 26/6/90). The Presidential Directive is therefore clearly limited (in terms of the law) to those areas not governed by the Labour Relations Act, namely the civil service.

This important aspect of the legal provision to redress racial imbalances in the private sector is reflected in many of the discrimination cases dealt with by the Ministry. Most discrimination cases involve complaints by black personnel who believe they should be promoted as part of a black advancement programme (and in many cases actually refer to the Presidential Directive). When the Ministry investigates, in terms of the Labour Relations Act there are no grounds for complaint because the actual appointment or promotion has been based on 'merit' (usually higher qualifications or longer experience) and therefore there has been no discrimination (Labour Relations Officer, interview, 26/6/90).

In addition matters are treated on a case by case (usually individual by individual) basis. This is said to exacerbate the confusion because overall discriminatory policy within a company can be masked by an individual appointment policy based on merit. This is often achieved by constantly upgrading the requirements of a post in terms of qualifications and experience (particularly the latter). Discrimination based on current practices towards an individual is therefore very hard to prove. The individual may not succeed in the courts or the Ministry of Labour arbitration machinery, while in fact discrimination is being widely practised in the private sector. Few cases therefore have ever reached the Supreme Court (interview, 26/6/90).

The Ministry does seem to be aware of this deficiency in the Act, and cases of gross discrimination are often dealt with by applying political pressure on the company. There have been no adjustments to the Act proposed in order to correct the situation or facilitate black advancement policy. A neutral but corrective measure could have been to provide incentives for companies to train, develop and promote black management. Black and white management alike have reservations about a 'black advancement policy' as such, but black management do think there is still a need for redress albeit based on merit.

The Labour Relations Act, belated as it was, focused on discrimination as it affects the individual. It did not address the effect of past and present practices on the structure of the labour market, in particular imbalances in terms of colour and gender. From an employer and employee perspective the legislation in Ministry activities in this area have been problematic. From the employee perspective the legislation made experiences of discrimination difficult to prove with the onus on the individual. From the employer perspective given the weakness of the law the Ministry of Labour often took the 'law into their own hands' and imposed 'political pressure' on companies in relation to appointments of black personnel. The legislation was therefore too weak to protect the individual, open to abuse by government and not open enough with sufficient guidelines for employers.

3.3.3 Reasons for Government Caution on the Private Sector

Government's approach towards the private sector has therefore been an essentially 'no policy approach' with some moral pressure, and a belated non-preferential policy measure in the form of the Labour Relations Act. Not wanting to upset the 'Rhodesian apple-cart', Government was acutely sensitive to the animosity that existed between white and black by the end of the war and wanted to allay retaliatory action on the part of whites alone or in alliance with South Africa. In addition the whites were the mainstay of the private sector. Government did not want to accelerate the flight of entrepreneurial, administrative and technical skills and was also aware of the objective difficulties of intervening to facilitate accelerated black advancement in management in the private sector, as had been the case in the public sector.

Yet another reason for this cautious approach was the apparent contradiction between developing socialism and promoting black advancement in the private sector thereby facilitating the development of a black middle class. Ironically, this ambivalence with regard to black advancement in the private sector left the way open for rapid advancement of whites who filled the vacancies that became available due to emigration in the first few years after 1980.

According to a spokesperson for the Ministry of Labour, Manpower Planning and Social Welfare, Government pressure on the private sector so far was intended:

- To make the private sector more sensitive to Government policy, and to give the private sector a more national orientation;
- To assist in the mobility of non-whites into all occupational levels;
- To be a part of an overall national manpower development strategy (interview MLMPSW, 4/6/86).

Zimbabwe therefore used preferential policy measures or affirmative action in the public sector, but non-policy and non-preferential policy measures in the private sector. Having looked at policy approaches, the report will examine how imbalances of colour have been redressed in the public and private sectors, and what problems have arisen.

Redressive action in the Public Service of Zimbabwe was particularly challenging since there was no explicit process of 'preparation' as had been the case in other British colonies. Zimbabwe was no different to other African countries in making 'Africanisation' of the Public Service one of the first tasks after independence. As one author commented on Africa in general:

"The Africanisation of the civil service, no matter what the costs in terms of effectiveness and efficiency became the only viable political alternative", (A Adedji, 1981:31).

In the first four years after independence, the Public Service in Zimbabwe was comprehensively 'Africanised'. In 1989, 277 (93.6 percent) out of a total of 296 senior posts (permanent secretaries, deputy secretaries, under secretaries, ambassadors) were occupied by blacks (see Table 7). Prior to the Smith-Muzorewa Government of 1979 African civil servants did not rise above the middle rank of senior administrative officer.

Table 7
Composition of Senior Posts in the Public Service: 1989

	Black	White
Permanent Secretaries	26	-
Deputy Secretaries	73	3
Heads of Department	7	3
Under secretaries (open field)	124	8
Under secretaries (closed field)	23	5
Ambassadors	24	-
TOTAL no.:	277	19
% :	93.6	6.4

Source: Public Service Commission, 1990. Fieldwork by Author.

Table 8 over page shows that whites in the administrative, professional and technical fields totalled 5 207 in 1981 (or 37% of a total of 13 918) and 1 340 (or 1.3% of a total of 100 016) in 1989. The Service expanded considerably in the same period, including in the Departmental and Administrative areas. The Table shows that total numbers in the Service (administrative, technical, professional, employees and others) expanded from 56 442 in 1981 to 164 757. Approximately 75 000 of this number are teachers due to the expansion in education. According to the Ministry of the Public Service change of personnel in the technical occupations was slower than administrative positions.

'Africanisation' of the civil service did mean a change in personnel as well as objectives the state defines for itself. 'Africanisation' definitely made the state more responsive to the implementation of Government and ZANU(PF) policy. To meet the immediate demands of independence a significant proportion of Government expenditure has been in the non-productive areas of the state sector. Since 1980 the state has therefore increased its role as a provider of social welfare for the majority of the

population. The state has expanded to provide education, health and improved facilities in the rural areas. According to Mr Anderson, the Minister of State in 1988 the civil service has therefore adjusted to redress imbalances and meet the demands of the liberation struggle.

Table 8
Racial and Gender Composition of the Public Service: 1989
 (Figures in brackets indicate persons in 1981.)

A. Blacks in the Public Service

	MALE	FEMALE	TOTAL
Admin	796 (282)	242 (36)	1 038 (318)
Admin closed	1 154 (351)	369 (68)	1 523 (419)
Professional	1 193 (458)	355 (66)	1 548 (524)
Technical	1 472 (568)	245 (43)	1 717 (611)
Departmental	3 157 (917)	568 (90)	3 725 (1 007)
Health	712 (309)	4 179 (571)	4 891 (880)
Teaching	54 599 (3 114)	28 500 (1 328)	83 099 (4 442)
Clerical Exec.	879 (308)	256 (130)	1 135 (510)
TOTAL:	63 962 (6 379)	34 714 (2 332)	98 676 (8 711)
Established employees	91	25	116
Group I	7 228 (3 410)	5 108 (4 777)	12 336 (8 187)
Group II	9 847 (6 759)	3 339 (1 996)	13 186 (8 755)
Group III	31 843 (21 380)	3 758 (1 315)	35 601 (22 695)
Hourly paid*	1 496	595	2 091
Expatriates	132	27	159
Contract	257	7	264
TOTAL:	50 894 (31 549)	12 859 (8 088)	63 753 (39 637)

Critics would however say that the state has expanded too much, and that the expansion has not necessarily made it more efficient. It has, they would maintain, increased bureaucracy and hence inefficiency and a lack of accountability. In addition priorities in terms of expenditure are questioned. Rapid expansion of numbers employed has limited the salaries for all staff which has facilitated the brain drain to the private sector (of black and white alike). The priority of meeting short term demands in terms of social welfare has also been at the expense of a long term strategy of productive investment to sustain the welfare sector. As a result Government is increasingly in the unfortunate position of having to hold back its aspirations with regard to its financial commitment in areas such as health and education.

B. Whites in the Public Service

	MALE		FEMALE		TOTAL	
Admin	20	(176)	4	(20)	24	(196)
Admin closed	19	(314)	10	(142)	29	(456)
Professional	155	(590)	63	(79)	218	(669)
Technical	57	(324)	13	(95)	70	(419)
Departmental	101	(833)	13	(96)	114	(979)
Health	8	(27)	54	(196)	62	(223)
Teaching	289	(805)	495	(966)	784	(1 771)
Clerical Exec.	12	(198)	27	(196)	34	(494)
TOTAL:	661	(3 317)	679	(1 890)	1 340	(5 207)
Established employees	4		3		7	
Group I	46	(1 059)	83	(1 820)	129	(2 879)
Group II	0	(0)	0	(14)	0	(4)
Group III	3	(4)	0	(0)	3	(4)
Hourly paid*	288		315		603	
Expatriates	162		77		239	
Contract	7		0		7	
TOTAL:	510	(1 063)	478	(1 824)	988	(2887)

Source: Public Service Commission, 1990. Fieldwork by author.

4.1 Factors Facilitating Redressive Action

4.1.1 The White Exodus and the Expansion of the Public Service

Redressive Action was facilitated by the exodus of white civil servants and the expansion of the Public Service from 40 000 in 1980 to 90 000 in 1989 (excluding teachers whose numbers have risen significantly). Soon after independence 5 000 experienced white officers left the Service (Bulawayo Chronicle 18/4/85). Not all of them left the country, some went into the private sector. Whites left the civil service for a number of reasons. First and foremost was a political or 'racial' reason - their resistance to working under blacks. In addition they were fearful of their promotion prospects, they felt they had been superseded by people less experienced and less efficient than themselves, they did not think that blacks could run the country, they were fearful for the future of their children, and most important they were encouraged by a lucrative retirement incentive scheme (interview, Chris Anderson, Minister of State for the Public Service, 10/9/87).

4.1.2 The Retirement Incentive Scheme

The Retirement Incentive Scheme has been a mechanism in many British colonies to induce white civil servants to stay on for some five years after independence. Such a scheme was introduced in Zimbabwe in 1979 under the Smith-Muzorewa regime, and later became part of the Lancaster House Agreement. The conditions of the scheme were that:

- If a white officer was replaced by a black officer they could retire with full benefits;
- the pension benefits increased for five years after independence;
- the scheme guaranteed remittance of benefits to any person ordinarily resident outside the country;
- a lump sum which was a proportion of pension benefits, could be commuted tax free on retirement (interview Ministry of the Public Service 10/9/87).

The Scheme in fact became an inducement for whites to leave the country or at least to leave the civil service with pension benefits and take another job in the private sector. An analysis of 696 retirements in 1983 revealed that 567 people retired under the scheme. Of these, 506 were below 60 years of age - i.e. below the minimum pensionable age (see Table 9). Forty-two percent of those who retired were teachers (see Table 9).

Commenting on the Retirement Scheme the 1983 Annual Review of Manpower from the MLMPSW stated:

"The Scheme has contributed to the drainage of skilled manpower from the public sector to the private sector. These people get full retirement benefits from the Government at the same time as getting full salaries from the private sector (if they remained in the country Ed). Maybe the Incentive Scheme has not been as useful as it was meant to be" (ARM, 1983:39).

The Scheme also had a negative effect on foreign currency reserves, due to the emigration of many of those who retired. One of the early retirees who went to the private sector commented: "It seemed crazy not to leave" (interview 11/7/89). "Even those loyal to the new order left because of the Incentive Scheme. It would have been a problem if they had stayed" (interview 24/11/89). A significant proportion of the whites who remained in the Service after 1985 were too old to start new careers and have therefore waited for full pension benefits before retiring at retirement age (interview 25/6/89). Not only whites have taken advantage of the Scheme. Blacks appointed before the 1979 Agreement have also been able to take advantage of the Scheme, and have done so.

Table 9
Retirement at Non-Pensionable and Pensionable Ages

GROUP	AGE BELOW 60 YEARS		AGE 60+ YEARS		TOTAL	
	no.	%	no.	%	no.	%
Administrative	80	92	7	8	87	15.3
Medical	41	87.2	6	12.8	47	8.3
Technical	92	94.8	5	5.2	97	17.1
Teaching	211	88.7	27	11.3	238	42
Departmental	82	83.7	16	16.3	98	17.3
TOTAL:	506	89.2	61	10.8	567	100

Source: ARM, 1983:37.

4.1.3 Supersession and Shifting Sideways

Supersession is the skipping of promotion procedures and placement of less experienced (black) personnel above those already in place (who are white) and therefore first in line for promotion. It is a mechanism for affirmative action, but due to its generally negative consequences, needs to be used with extreme caution. The argument against supersession is that people are placed without sufficient experience for the job, i.e. they are not necessarily the best person for the job, but are placed there for other reasons - political and equity reasons and therefore primarily colour.

This practice has been a particularly sensitive issue amongst whites throughout the public sector. Some whites do maintain they left the Service because they were superseded by officials junior to themselves or newcomers. One Ministry with a particular technical specialisation reported 'leapfrogging' or supersession which resulted in whites leaving:

"This is what Government wanted. They did not worry if whites left. The problem occurs when you are in a Ministry which is a shortage area in terms of skills. To encourage people to leave is a problem" (interview 17/11/89).

Others maintain they were squeezed out, having realised that their promotion prospects were zero, and maintaining that their working situation was made intolerable for them (interviews 11/7/89, 26/6/89). This occurred particularly where blacks were put to work in tandem with whites. The Ministry maintain that they had to use this approach because of the need for whites to impart skills and the strong possibility whites would leave.

In view of the large numbers that left because of the Retirement Incentive Scheme it is difficult to say really how many left because of supersession or being squeezed out as opposed to how many were induced out by the Retirement Incentive Scheme. The Minister of State for the Public Service claims that such cases were a minority, although they did exist. He maintains that only three civil servants actually lost their jobs - i.e. were fired (interview 10/9/87).

A black ex-senior civil servant stated that:

"The directive was theoretically sound - blacks had been disadvantaged. In the implementation we went overboard giving whites the impression that there was nothing for them. In essence it is true that preference was given to blacks and it led to supersession" (interview 25/11/89).

The Ministry of the Public Service hotly reject the viewpoint which implies 'reverse discrimination' or at least problems in the implementation of the Directive in point of principle. The Ministry of the Public Service maintains that if there had been no supersession, Africanisation of senior posts would have taken a very long time.

Some whites no doubt were superseded. The view of the Ministry is that the question remains as to how relevant the skills and experience of a number of these whites were to transforming the state structure so that it was more oriented to the needs of the majority of the population. Whilst it is said that the departure of whites led to a loss of skills, it may be asked "skills for what targets"? The Ministry point out that while the old civil service was efficient in relation to its objectives, it could not meet the demands of the objectives of the post-1980 society. The Ministry hold the view that the pre-1980 civil service was efficient in terms of its own objectives which were to serve the white minority Government. The post-1980 civil service has however not been efficient in terms of its objectives which are to serve the interests of a development-oriented government catering for the needs of all the population (interview 15/6/90).

4.1.4 The Presidential Directive and Promotion on Merit

According to the Minister of State in 1988, the objective of the Directive was to "redress the racial imbalance, i.e. preference had to be given to blacks in recruitment, appointment and promotion". Colour was not however the sole criteria for appointment. The role of the Public Service Commission was to ensure appointments and promotion were also made on merit. According to the Minister of State, it was necessary that people had adequate qualifications for the job, and then preference was given to blacks. Now that the balance is redressed, except for a couple of controversial areas, appointment and promotion is on merit. The exception is constitutional posts such as permanent secretaries, the Attorney General and Ambassadors where political factors are considered and the President is consulted (Minister of State, interview, 10/9/87).

The Public Service Commission was appointed by the President with it seems fairness in mind. The Chairman of the PSC is white, and therefore perceived as 'neutral'. All regions of the country are represented through the other appointees. One of the appointees is a women. The conception was to prevent nepotism and ensure merit in appointment.

However, critics who have left the PSC and others in the Public Service report that in the first three years when many procedures for appointment were lifted, appointment was not always on 'merit, namely qualifications and experience. One ex-civil servant said:

"There was the tendency from Ministers to use their position to think of less fortunate relatives. The Directive came at a time when the politician wanted to control. This tendency was strong in 1981 - 1983. The President stood up against this interference and worked through the Chairman, Mr Thompson. In hindsight the politicians should not have had a say in appointments" (24/11/89).

In 1983 Government carried out a review of 'Presidential Directive appointees'. Apparently some of the appointees were suitably placed and performing well, others were not and some were downgraded as a result. The priority was then to train those people for the positions in which they found themselves (interview 18/8/89). It was not, however, possible to obtain the data from this Review. After 1983 stricter appointment procedures were observed.

Until 1990 for all non-constitutional posts ideology or political persuasion was not a necessary consideration in appointment. A new appointee did not have to be a socialist to be appointed a Public Commissioner or any other senior administrative post. In fact most of those appointed to senior administrative positions after 1980 were trained in the UK and USA and their ideological orientation was not necessarily socialist (interview 18/8/89). In June 1990 this policy seemed to change when the Senior Minister for Political Affairs announced that civil servants who do not agree with the principles of the ruling party should not seek to work for Government. He reported that ZANU had actually asked members of the civil service to be card carrying members of the party (The Sunday Mail, 24/6/90).

Although in principle promotion was meant to be on merit, and the PSC was created with such an objective in mind, some sources do maintain that:

"There was no mechanism for implementation. There were too many arbitrary decisions on qualifications and no decisions on experience. There was an arbitrariness on relevant skills. There should have been details on skills, plans and a formula for correcting the situation" (interview 10/11/89).

Possibly such arbitrariness was unavoidable in view of the pace of change and high turnover of personnel. In the absence of documentation from the Public Service on this process it is difficult to make a conclusion as to whether the critics or the Ministry are correct in their view of the implementation of the Directive. What is certain is that the pace of change probably led to problems beyond the control of Government. This pace was facilitated by factors such as the Incentive Scheme in particular and supersession.

4.1.5 Training and Manpower Development

Prior to 1980 there was little or no training available for civil servants. Although progress with the examinations of the Institute of Chartered Secretaries and Administrators was there as a promotional barrier, most white civil servants had only a secondary education, 'O' levels or less. This was one important factor in the incompatibility of old white and new black civil servants. Most black civil servants at senior level have at least one degree. As in the private sector, older, experienced, less educated white personnel often find difficulty in absorbing and adapting to the young and educated black newcomers at higher levels.

Blacks were only given clerical and executive posts for which standard 4 or JC was required. The Chairman of the PSC maintains that the new Government inherited a situation where a lot of people in the Service especially at lower levels did not have a lot of education.

"In the rural areas the white DC's let the blacks handle their own people. Inefficiency did not matter. Many of those people are still there. Now a clerk needs 5 'O' levels" (interview 13/11/89).

From 1980 Government policy was to give training to all levels of the Service. This was reinforced with further legislation in 1986 which stipulated that all ministries should be involved in training and career development for all levels of the Service (The Herald 15/1/86). Individual Ministries undertake specialised training. Upper levels of the Service receive training at the Zimbabwe Institute of Public Administration and Management established in 1984. Middle and lower level personnel are trained in management and administration at two centres (Highlands, Harare and Bulawayo). Training is also undertaken at provincial level and concentrates particularly on development in the rural areas. All training is managed by the Ministry of the Public Service.

4.1.6 Africanisation of the Parastatals

In 1980 Government inherited 28 parastatals, and by 1990 had 35. The parastatals that the Government inherited were well established institutions. Salaries in the parastatals were only about 20 percent lower than those of an equivalent post in the private sector. Management was mainly white, long-serving and therefore 'experienced'. A study done by the National Manpower Survey in 1981 showed that of the 838 professional employees - 89 percent were white and 11 percent were black. Of the whites, 21 percent were British nationals. The blacks had the educational, qualifications and the whites the experience. Of the blacks 28 percent had degrees compared with 17 percent of the whites. Yet 88 percent of white employees had more than 10 years work experience, as opposed to 10 percent of blacks. The work experience of whites placed them in the highest income bracket.

Of the skilled category of employees 56 percent were white, and 44 percent were black. Half of the whites were British nationals. Whilst many of these British nationals would have probably also had access to Rhodesian citizenship, the high proportion illustrates the point that the majority of skilled personnel were 'imported' prior to 1980, rather than developed through the training of local

particularly black personnel. Most whites employed by the parastatals were however about to retire.

The extract below from The Herald of 30/9/86 is an illustration of the pace of change in one parastatal, the Cotton Marketing Board:

"The Cotton Marketing Board, CMB, as was indeed the case with many public sector organisations, found itself with mass resignations from experienced employees - virtually all of them whites, in the period following the attainment of independence ... In 1980 there were 867 people employed in the CMB, 128 of them were salaried staff and of these 32 were blacks and 96 whites. There was only one black depot manager, and not a single black ginner. But now the Board's employment figures have risen to 1 193, with 243 salaried staff and 227 of these are blacks and 16 whites. Six out of the eight depot managers are black, and all the ginning personnel from the chief ginner to the mixers are black ..."

Again there is little Government data available on the progress of redressive action and skill development in the parastatals. Even the Parastatal Commission set up after the Commission of Inquiry in 1987 were unable to provide comprehensive statistics when asked to do so. The last available Government data is from the 1985 Annual Manpower Review. The Table 10 below shows blacks and whites in the different occupational categories. The table shows that the proportion and numbers of whites in the professional and technical, and administrative and managerial occupations has declined significantly to 19 percent and 36 percent respectively.

Table 10
Racial Classification in the Parastatals -
Select Occupational Categories and Total Employment: 1985

OCCUPATION		BLACK	WHITE
Professional,	No.	3 234	779
Technical & Related	%	79	19
Administrative & Managerial	No. %	307 64	175 36
Production & Related	No. %	7 959 91	799 9
TOTAL:	No. %	41 149 93	2 932 7

Source: Compiled from ARM, 1985: 40

Note: Blacks includes Coloureds and Asians.

In the parastatal sector 'Africanisation' was however considerably slower than the civil service. First, it was slower because the Presidential Directive was not legally binding on the parastatals. Hence the Minister assumed responsibility for the task. There was no equivalent to the PSC to implement redressive action in an organised and planned manner. Second, the process was slower because it was not a matter of immediate political priority to 'Africanise' top posts. Third, there was no programme of action or guidelines to follow, it was up to the Minister and the Management Board of each parastatal to tackle the problem in the way they saw fit. Presidential appointments were made where it was clear that no progress was being made. Ministerial appointments to Boards were made with varying degrees of success. In some instances, local white and black personnel with an understanding of the need for change and how to bring it about were appointed by the President to replace more conservative white management. A fourth reason for the slower pace of change was that most whites in the parastatals did not benefit from the Retirement Incentive Scheme. Fifth, certain parastatals require very specific technical and professional knowledge and expertise. It was more difficult to find appropriate people for these posts, particularly at higher levels and for top management.

Whites did however leave the parastatals in fair numbers. Some left for political reasons as in the case of the Service. They also left because of the deteriorating conditions of service in comparison with the private sector. There was a freeze on top salaries in Government for the first 5 years after independence. Others left where there was supersession and political appointments to management. It is difficult to separate entirely supersession as a reason for leaving from 'political reasons'. About 70 percent of the white personnel left the parastatals in the first few years after independence. This can be compared to 90 percent in the civil service and 35 - 40 percent in the private sector (interview 19/12/89). In sum, the forces at work in the parastatals were resistance to change by some white management, deteriorating conditions of service and the exodus of whites (interview 19/12/89).

From 1980 - 1982 in the parastatals there was a struggle to redress racial imbalances, especially at management level. From 1983 to 1985 (until the appointment of the Commission of Inquiry of the parastatals) the ministers intervened in appointments and promotions, and the running of the parastatals. Many of the parastatals did and still do have succession planning. The problem was however that the Minister did not accept the successor, and appointed 'his person' (interview 19/12/89). Many parastatals also had human resource development plans even before 1980. However, such plans are only successful if attrition is manageable and if they take cognisance of the changing political realities of the country. Ministerial interference and the high rate of attrition affected the parastatals in the first five years after independence. According to a white manager who was a Presidential Appointee to facilitate change in the parastatals:

"Ministerial interference resulted in a loss of white skills and accelerated deterioration in conditions of employment. A lot of Ministers went overboard. Boards were less effective and the Ministers intervened in the day-to-day management. If the parastatals had put themselves in order, there would have been less Government interference. Government should only have intervened to restructure Boards and call on executives to have effective succession planning taking the need to redress imbalances into account. The problems arose in allocating responsibility to the Minister" (interview 19/12/89).

In 1987 Government appointed a Commission of Inquiry into the Parastatals under the Chairmanship of Justice Smith. Ministers came under serious criticism in the Inquiry for their interference in the management of the parastatals. The Inquiry pointed to the fact that the importance of technical considerations when appointing senior management for economic and financial institutions was totally underestimated. Senior management were appointed because they were black and for nepotistic

reasons (interview 19/12/89). Because of such ill-advised appointments, problems such as inefficiency, corruption and nepotism have been evident in the parastatals. Two such case studies will be examined below. It must be emphasised that this was not the case with all parastatals. The Commission of Inquiry led to the establishment of the Parastatal Commission. In 1989 this was dissolved and according to one source was "simply political interference in another guise" (interview 19/12/89).

4.1.7 Was there an Alternative to Rapid Africanisation, particularly of the civil service?

The exodus of whites for personal/ political reasons facilitated rapid 'Africanisation' of the civil service. The way the Directive was implemented through preferential appointment of blacks and supersession, also facilitated rapid 'Africanisation'. The implementation of the Directive speeded up the process of 'Africanisation' through the perceived insecurity experienced by whites of their position.

The Presidential Directive was a decree to 'Africanise'. However, the absence of clear objectives and guidelines for implementation led to some unfortunate consequences which have had serious repercussions for the operations of Government and the financial viability of a number of parastatals. Because the pace was not entirely in the control of Government, some of these problems were unavoidable. Whites would have left for the private sector and emigrated in significant numbers whatever Government did.

Human resource development and manpower planning can only succeed when attrition is manageable. 'Africanisation' has involved costs in terms of effectiveness and efficiency for most African countries. However, in Zimbabwe the costs to the public sector have been greater than the private sector. This is not because of 'Africanisation', but because of the process of implementation, and possibly political expediency. As one ex-senior black Government official said:

"Government appointed people and took risk, they funded it if there was a failure. In the private sector this was not the case" (interview 30/10/89).

The question may be asked retrospectively whether or not Zimbabwe did have another option to rapid 'Africanisation'? Is it the implementation of the concept that has led to the problems, or is it the concept itself? Possibly it is both. Clearly change was necessary for political reasons. The white civil service could not remain intact. However, did change have to take the form it did in view of some of the costly consequences?

4.2 Problems Arising With the Changes in the Public Sector

4.2.1 Lack of Experience and High Turnover of Personnel

The first four years after independence saw rapid promotion in the Service for the best of Zimbabwe's black middle level and high level personnel. Many of these new appointees to the Service were educated abroad during the liberation war, were a part of the liberation war, or had been in jail for participating in the war. Most of these appointees did not have the experience required for high-level administration. As the Minister of State commented: "It does seem ironical that the whites complain about 'falling standards' when no blacks were trained or given the experience" (Chris Anderson, interview, 10/9/87).

Whilst the Ministry of the Public Service maintain that many new appointees had experience of some kind (interview 15/6/90), it does seem that the dilution in hands-on experience of public administration had an effect on the functioning of the Service. There are definitely cases of Ministerial and senior appointments where the appointment of one inappropriately placed, but senior person, alone had a fundamentally negative effect on the operations of the Ministry. There have been the success stories as well. Inappropriate appointments are made while there is a high turnover of personnel, but mistakes should be reserved for lower levels of management. As in the private sector, top management appointments should not be made without due recognition of experience and merit. There is a place for affirmative action, but not in top or senior management, whether in the public and private sector.

Rapid promotion in the early days has meant that young educated officers who have had experience in the Public Service for five to ten years now have little prospect of promotion. The average age of their seniors is forty. Coupled with more lucrative salaries in the private sector, frustration of middle ranking officers has led to a high turnover of personnel compounding the problem of lack of experience in the Service.

Whilst the turnover of personnel has been high, the civil service has not put sufficient emphasis on their human resource development and planning.

Only in 1986 was the concept of human resource development and planning introduced, and as yet no public documentation is available.

4.2.2 Declining Efficiency and Effectiveness

One ex-black senior civil servant, a critic of the implementation of the Directive, said that the policy had led to inefficiency:

"Decision making has become cumbersome and slow because of the lack of experience. Have people appointed delivered the goods? The parastatals run at a loss and the ministries cannot take decisions" (interview 30/10/89).

Taking into consideration the expansion of Service and the change over in personnel, a decline in efficiency was inevitable. This problem was comprehensively investigated by a high-level Public Service Review Commission in 1989. The Commission Report was very critical and concluded:

"The necessary management skills and management systems have simply not been created...(and)... there is a widespread view in the private sector that the result has been detrimental to the development of the country" (Public Service Review Commission:13).

Other observations have been equally critical of the consequences of the Presidential Directive. These include:

- A serious shortage of trained and experienced personnel;
- Little on-the-job training for new recruits;
- Inefficiency and ineffectiveness as a result of dilution of experience in the Service;
- Incompetence, maladministration and corruption among some public servants;
- Overcentralisation of decision-making as a result of inexperience, making the whole Government procedure cumbersome, bureaucratic and slow moving;
- Over-interference on the part of politicians and Ministers in the operations of the Service;
- A lack of communication with and accountability to the electorate (Mukumbe, 1989:71).

Some at the top of the Service hold the view that it is difficult to say whether the Directive was to blame or not. There were gaps and they had to be filled. In 6 months the majority of permanent secretaries, deputy and under secretaries were black.

"The gaps had to be filled. Some did well and some did not. However, the need for 'quick service' is lacking. From assistant secretary upwards the supervisory element is lacking and the realisation of the need to instill discipline. There is an acceptance of inefficiency. The traditional element is involved in the problem of disciplining fellow workers" (interview 13/11/89).

Inefficiency has been countered through tightening recruitment and promotion procedures, training, and the use of expatriates where necessary. However, the serious criticisms do lead one to beg the question as to whether slower change, if it was at all possible, would have been better for the Service in the longer run. The problem is that maintaining personnel from the previous regime, also meant maintaining racist attitudes and conservative political ideas. Government in the early days after independence did find its efforts 'sabotaged' by some existing white personnel. The difference in political objective between the racist settler civil service of Southern Rhodesia and the civil service of an independent Zimbabwe is possibly too great for there to be any room for compromise.

One senior source in the civil service maintains that the Directive is not necessarily the only source of the inefficiency in the Service:

"The structure of the civil service has not changed dramatically, yet its role and objectives have. Too many overlapping ministries results in inefficiency. The task of the service with its social, economic and political functions is enormous. There is no reward system for senior civil servants. Lastly, the PSC is given the responsibility when it should be the Minister. The Minister should be accountable. He blames the PSC for not giving staff. The Minister's conception is that he is the manager, but only when it suits him" (interview 13/11/89).

Whilst the source of these comments does not identify the Directive as the cause of the difficulties, it seems to confirm the view that 'Africanisation' which focuses primarily on colour and personnel rather than structure and function is a source of such problems.

Zimbabwe was no exception in how it 'Africanised' the civil service. Like most other newly independent countries in Africa Zimbabwe adopted a conservative approach, namely the priority of replacing white with black personnel. In time, like the rest of Africa, 'Africanisation' of positions has become a non-issue, and concern with the quality and democracy of the Service has become paramount.

4.2.3 Nepotism and Corruption

Allegations of widespread nepotism and corruption have been frequently made against senior government personnel. Corruption has occurred for a variety of reasons: People who were disadvantaged felt justified in taking state funds; in the early stages there was no awareness that misappropriation of state funds would result in prosecution; some people deliberately took advantage of the poor quality of personnel who administered accounting and financial systems; there was no hierarchy of discipline and people allowed their comrades to get away with it and remained silent; and, a desire to have 'a piece of the cake'. All these factors relate to bad appointments due to the rapid expansion of the Service and the inability to process each appointee carefully, (C Anderson, 10/9/87).

Corruption at all levels of Government was widely reported in the local press during the 1980s. The Sandura Commission of Inquiry of 1989 exposed 'favours' and financial deals exacted by Ministers by virtue of their position from motor vehicle manufacturers. The Ministers sold the vehicles to businessmen in the private sector, who were otherwise unable to obtain a vehicle, for a vast profit. A number of Ministers were discredited and forced to resign as a result of the Inquiry.

One of the main motor vehicle manufacturers involved was Willowvale Motors, part of the Industrial Development Corporation, a Government parastatal. Appendix 2 shows a news report from The Herald of 4/6/90 which alleges salary discrepancies and a lack of black advancement in the company. One would assume that Government Ministers and Government appointees to the Board of management who have had ongoing contact with Willowvale Motors during and after the corruption scandal would have brought such practices into the open before now. This is an illustration of how 'black advancement' can come to mean one thing to a Government Minister, his own advancement, with little concern to practices of discrimination in the companies with which he deals (illegally). The report is an illustration of how variable progress is in the parastatals due to the lack of clear redressive action policy and implementation procedures for all sectors. It is also an illustration of conservative and racial attitudes on the part of white top management who have not instituted changes in the company through training and promoting black management and technical personnel.

While allegations of nepotism are difficult to prove, nepotism is pervasive and not to be interpreted negatively in a society such as Zimbabwe where ethnic or 'tribal' affiliation is still more important in the political arena than class origins. Nepotism becomes a problem in the context of rapid 'Africanisation' where advancement is defined in primarily defined racial or ethnic terms. Such a scenario generates nepotism and corruption. It occurs because 'Africanisation' has focused only the matter of black personnel. Corruption and nepotism are in other words inherent in appointments which are not made on merit. Appointments not based on merit lead to insecurity. In order to keep his position a senior person appoints his allies (nepotism). Nepotism also plays its part in corruption. Loyalty to the senior person responsible for your appointment, means turning a 'blind eye' to corruption.

Another aspect to the issue of defining the problem of redressive action or 'Africanisation' in purely racial or ethnic terms, is that it perpetuates discrimination. Ndebele people in Zimbabwe allege that 'Africanisation' of the civil service has in fact been 'Shona-isation' and party political, namely ZANU oriented. Such observers argue that in the first eight years of independence both Ndebeles and whites were marginalised, and particular groupings within the Shona given preference over others.

One severe criticism came from an ex-senior black civil servant. In discussing the role of the Minister in the early days soon after 1980, he said:

"There was a kraalhead mentality. Put that way it will upset people. People came from the same district as you, and therefore you trusted them. If you document tribalism, it upsets them (interview 30/10/89).

In a phase of rapid change a benchmark for appointment must be people you know, rather than those you don't. There is no shame in this. The problem arose when such a situation was abused so that appointments were made at all levels which were to the detriment of the Service. Even 'bad' appointments were inevitable with the pace of change. However, not all 'bad' appointments were nepotistic appointments.

To avoid such negative consequences redressive action must not be defined as an end in itself purely in terms of colour. Redressive action designed to correct racial imbalances for political and technical

reasons, must be occupation-specific and time-specific. Redressive action is a temporary measure, not a permanent principle, and must be accompanied by structural and organisational changes which facilitate the development of non-racial democracy. If not, it becomes a mechanism to empower and enrich a few at the expense of the whole economy and society.

4.3 Case Studies - Two Parastatals

The ad hoc and individualised implementation of the Presidential Directive in the parastatals had serious repercussions on key sectors of the economy. Serious financial loss and mismanagement in a number of parastatals led Government to appoint a Commission of Inquiry, the Smith Commission mentioned earlier. Some parastatals such as the Cold Storage Commission and the Agricultural Marketing Authority have successfully redressed racial imbalances at all levels in ten years. In such cases top management undertook human resource development programmes and promotions to senior positions were made on merit. The process took longer, but such organisations have redressed racial imbalances and developed competent black personnel in middle, senior and top management. In Air Zimbabwe and the National Railways of Zimbabwe ministerial or political appointments were used to accelerate 'Africanisation', with negative consequences. These organisations still have the problem of a shortage of appropriate management and technical skills.

4.3.1 The National Railways of Zimbabwe

The report of the Smith Commission on the National Railways of Zimbabwe illustrated how ministerial interference, political appointments, nepotism, racism, tribalism and mismanagement were part of a process which was called 'Africanisation', to the long term detriment of the functioning of all levels of personnel in the NRZ, including top management.

Historically racial discrimination was endemic on the railways with no blacks in skilled or professional occupations, and no blacks allowed to be in supervisory positions above whites. The report showed that despite the fact that white management had set up targets and plans for black advancement, in 1984 the Minister of Transport appointed a black manager to the Railways as part of his Africanisation programme. In doing so the Minister stated that: "the appointment was a political one and therefore no experience or qualifications were called for...(and)... Mr Masango is being imposed on the Railways" (NRZ, Report of the Commission of Inquiry, 1987:100).

Under the power of the Minister once prescribed promotion procedures were ignored or dispensed with, and promotions were made by way of "secretive, unchallengeable, Ministerial Directive" (NRZ, Report, 1987:100). Allegations of nepotism and tribalism were made by many black employees. The Commission Report stated that the Minister had intervened beyond the limits of the law and that promotions of blacks had taken place in such a manner that weakened management to the detriment of the Railways (NRZ, Report, 1987:65). The feeling amongst employees was that promotion was not based on merit, but on whom you knew. The Commission maintained that blacks and whites had been affected by the actions of the Minister. People were appointed who were not technically qualified and were skipping promotion procedures (NRZ, Report, 1987:42,52,54). The Commission Report gave the following summation:

"Because the instances of racism and allegations thereof are so damaging to harmonious staff relations and have such a harmful effect on the efficiency of the Railways, we consider that steps should be taken to deal with the problem. Those areas in the Railways where black advancement has not been fully achieved should be identified and comprehensive plans drawn up to redress the position as soon as

possible. The issue should be brought out in the open and discussed at all levels of management so that the plan is properly implemented and the policy of black advancement is not abused in order to favour friends or relatives or to cover inefficiency or incompetence" (NRZ, Report, 1987,:223).

Whilst redressive action, and in particular affirmative action/ 'Africanisation' is necessary and has its place in the context of fundamental political change, such a strategy needs clear objectives. Africanisation for its own sake leads to problems. The technocratic aspect to appointments and promotions in the labour market is a reality. Whether for Government or state corporation, it is important to have the best person for the job, not simply the relative of the Minister or anyone who is black. This objective has to be balanced with the political imperatives for change.

4.3.2 Air Zimbabwe Corporation

The Minister of Transport, Dr H Ushewokunze, issued a Directive to the Manager of Air Zimbabwe dated 30 September, 1985, which read:

"Further to your enquiry, including a request for consideration to be given to the employment of a further compliment of pilots, I direct as follows: From now onwards and in order to redress the racial imbalance in this sector of your Corporation, you are requested and required to employ black pilots, whether they be Zimbabwean or non-Zimbabwean. The Directive stands and is non-negotiable" (Air Zimbabwe Corporation, Report of the Committee of Inquiry into Parastatals, 1986:76)

No consideration was given to whether black pilots were available, or how long it took to train a pilot. Colour was the key issue in the Minister's mind. Pilots, like top management in other sectors or corporations, should not attain posts through affirmative action. The more important issue for the Minister should have been the training programme to ensure black pilots in the long run, not the appointment of black pilots tomorrow.

Many experienced staff - aircraft engineers and senior air crew members and pilots, black and white, have left the airline because *"certain senior promotional posts since 1985 are ... filled by less qualified people on a non-advertised basis"* (Financial Gazette 3/4/87).

Air Zimbabwe employs a relatively small workforce of about 1 650. Over 50 percent of the workforce are in the skilled and professional occupational categories, because of the specialised and highly skilled nature of the Corporation. Table 11 shows the breakdown of the workforce according to skill and colour for the years 1980 and 1986.

From the table it is evident that whites in 1981 made up 61 percent of the workforce, with only a few blacks in the skilled occupations and none in the professional group. In 1986 whites were only 15 percent of the workforce, with blacks having moved into both professional and skilled occupations. There is however a stable number of whites in the professional category - 10.5 percent of the workforce in 1980 and 9 percent in 1986. The reason is that whites are predominant amongst pilots and flight engineers. The Minister of Transport therefore decided on rather ill-conceived and drastic measures to Africanise these posts. Many whites as youngsters have access to aeroplanes, technology and flight experience. Redressing the proportion of whites as pilots is a long term human resource development project which unfortunately took on a political character when it should not have.

Table 11**Air Zimbabwe Corporation: Classification by Race and Skill: 1980 & 1986**

		1980			1986		
		white	black	TOTAL	white	black	TOTAL
Professional	No.	132	nil	132	150	100	250
	%	10.5	0	10.5	9	6	15
Skilled	No.	530	54	584	75	575	650
	%	42.1	4.4	46.5	5	35	40
semi-Skilled	No.	100	158	258	25	400	425
	%	8	12.4	20.5	1	24	25
un-Skilled	No.	nil	282	282	nil	325	325
	%	0	22.5	22.5	0	20	20
TOTAL:	NO.	762	494	1 256	250	1 400	1 650
	%	61	39	100	15	85	100

Source: Fieldwork by author, 1989.

From 1980 there has been pressure for black advancement in all levels and occupations of the Corporation. In response a black general manager was appointed in 1980, and blacks were brought into skilled, managerial and professional occupational categories. In addition in-house and on-the-job training was started. A Quarterly review was produced in the first couple of years after independence on the Correction of the Racial Imbalance. Table 11 shows that progress was made. According to one source in Air Zimbabwe "black advancement proceeded at a pace that was faster than was economically sound" (interview 25/11/89). In June 1981 the Quarterly Review reported that the problems holding back the pace of black advancement were a lack of available personnel with airline experience, a lack of adequate training facilities, and the long duration for training pilots. The Commission of Inquiry into Parastatals identified several problems affecting the efficient management of the airline. Amongst them were a lack of competence on the part of the general manager, and interference from the Minister of Transport. This interference had taken the form of directives on black advancement, dismissals, appointments and promotions, use of airtickets for immediate family and relatives. Whilst nepotism is difficult to prove, in appointments and promotions and in the use of airline funds it was evident in this instance.

Both the case of Air Zimbabwe and the NRZ illustrate abuse of political power. They also illustrate how 'Africanisation' can be open to such abuse if guidelines and principles of implementation are not clearly defined.

G. Cheater made the following statements in the publication *Education, Race and Employment* (1975):

"The fact that racial distribution of jobs in the organisation structure finds Europeans at the top, and Africans at the bottom, with some racial mixing in the middle, is in large measure a result of the recruitment and selection procedures used by management, with race as a definite, if not always explicitly stated criterion." (Murphree, 1975:226.)

"If comprehensive personnel records are not kept, then management will not generally be in a position to assess its 'stock of skills' among employees and, consequently, training needs cannot be assessed. If no training programmes exist, then manpower will not be developed to its fullest potential, and if recruitment and selection procedures based on race are adopted, then a misallocation of manpower resources will result. Management policy and practice in regard to manpower utilisation is therefore pivotal to the issue of 'de-racializing' the occupational structure within an industrial economy, even in a country such as Rhodesia where the broader context of social and political issues plays such an influential role." (Murphree, 1975:210.)

This section will examine the process of black advancement in the private sector. Even though there has been no redressive action programme or guidelines by Government for the private sector, considerable black advancement has occurred in management and at skilled level. However, the issues in the above quotations, selection procedures incorporating racial attitudes and a lack of human resource planning, have been the key factors affecting black advancement in the post-1980 period.

5.1 Africanisation of skilled workers

Africanisation at the level of skilled workers and apprentices was rapid in the first couple of years after independence. The process had begun in about 1975. The reason was a shortage of skills due to white emigration and conscription for whites. Skilled white workers from production and related occupations were keen to emigrate, and have emigrated in significant numbers as they perceived their jobs to be under threat of Africanisation. This group had the highest emigration rate out of all occupational categories (see Table 3a and 3b).

In the five years before independence in 1980, it did become more economical for companies to employ black apprentices and skilled workers. First, there was no black conscription. Second, they were not likely to emigrate. Third, because jobs were redefined through fragmentation and less skilled workers could therefore be employed at a cheaper rate. Inadequate technical training policies and conflict between Government and private sector grading schemes raises the question of what Africanisation has really meant to the skill composition of the new black skilled workforce. There was an underestimation on the part of Government of the need to identify training needs and skill shortages for industry after 1980. There is a need for data on the changing skill composition of the Zimbabwe workforce, skill requirements and training needs. There is need for clarification and re-evaluation of the role and responsibility of the private sector and Government in training. As is apparent from Table 6, the centralization of training in the hands of Government has not been a successful policy to pursue.

5.2 Black Advancement in Management

In 1980 most companies did not have blacks at any level of management. The table below shows the proportions of blacks in different levels of management in 1989. At senior level whites are in the majority - 62.5 percent, whereas at middle and junior level management blacks are in the majority - 65.5 and 78 percent respectively. These figures are clearly an indication of progress in relation to black managerial advancement. The figures are shown graphically in appendix 3. The figures are based on a sample survey of 18 companies. Twenty two black senior managers and 25 white senior managers were interviewed. The sample of companies represented in total 28 942 employees. Senior and top management are still largely white. This is due to the experience required for top management and the ownership pattern of the economy. According to the Institute of Directors, 20 out of 200 top directors are black.

Table 12
Management in the Manufacturing Sector in Zimbabwe: 1989

MANAGERIAL FUNCTION	<u>Numbers of managers, management level and colour.</u>						
	Senior Grade E/F		Middle Grade D		Junior Grade C+		
	WHITE	BLACK	WHITE	BLACK	WHITE	BLACK	
General Administration	40	21	18	26	26	27	
Finance	25	15	18	43	17	49	
Production	28	18	26	55	22	127	
Marketing	17	8	32	54	7	63	
Personnel	7	9	10	28	4	49	
Other	18	10	20	29	37	86	
TOTAL:	No.	135	81	124	235	113	401
	%	62.5	37.5	34.5	65.5	22	78

Source: Sample Survey, fieldwork by author, 1989. Some of this data was also reflected in a survey done by the author for the Confederation of Zimbabwe Industries in 1989.

The same sample was asked what proportion of new appointees were black or white between 1986 and 1988. At senior level 60 percent of new appointees were black, for middle management 85 percent of new appointees were black and for junior management 79 percent of new appointees were black. That the majority of new appointments are black is a reflection of the fact that black managerial advancement is taking place and that there is a declining number of whites available in the labour market. Management reports that when a job is advertised, black applications for the post are in the majority.

5.3 Factors Affecting Black Advancement in the Private Sector

Whilst there has been progress in numerical terms, there has been controversy over the pace and nature of black managerial advancement. Black advancement in the private sector has taken longer than in the public sector in part due to racial prejudice on the part of top management. Also however, because the private sector has been concerned with a substantive problem - how to train efficient managers and not just replace whites with blacks. Black advancement in the private sector has been at the opposite end of the spectrum to the 'Africanisation' process in the public sector. It could be said that black advancement in the public sector went too fast and in the private sector too slow. The primary reason for this is the different approach on the part of Government to both sectors with no legislation directly affecting and legally binding on both sectors in the same way.

5.3.1 The Attitude of Top Management and Racial Prejudice

The key factor affecting the pace and nature of black advancement at managerial level has been the attitude of top management. By no means have all white Zimbabweans accepted the moral and political necessity to redress racial imbalances in the labour market, particularly in management. In addition many still hold attitudes of racial prejudice. Such prejudice manifests itself in the stagnation of black managerial advancement or lack of progress altogether. Such attitudes reflect feelings of white superiority, and an insecurity in the part of whites about their positions. An expatriate chief executive reported:

"Whites have a protective attitude which amounts to racism. They think that they are better than blacks."

A white senior manager in a company with all white senior and top management said:

"Whites do still have the idea and impression that blacks are incompetent. If you want the job done, the idea is to give it to a white. Blacks tend to have a 'work to rule approach'. They do not work hard enough."

One black executive did say that he thought the problem of racism was on both sides:

"The problem is that both sides are racist. It is ignorance by both groups of each other. Each group is not seeing people for what they are and what they have to offer. Black and white need to learn to appreciate each other ... There are inefficient blacks who hide behind racism and make excuses for a problem 'because they are black'."

The primary factor facilitating black advancement has been a commitment by top management to the issue. There is a need for top management to have overcome the racial prejudice they had before 1980. A black personnel manager stated:

"For any change there needs to be conviction and candidness. This conviction has to be evident - first in the Board; and second in the Chairman and Chief Executive."

Commitment on the part of top management involves policy, human resource development and planning and a strategy to ensure black advancement. Not all top management with such commitment necessarily have a black advancement strategy as such. Some have had rigorous training and development plans with genuine promotion on merit.

Genuine promotion on merit is evident when some or all of the following elements are a part of company human resource policy:

- A perception and policy that racial imbalances should be redressed;
- mechanisms to ensure this policy is translated into decisions and actions by management;
- evidence of supportive restructuring and supportive components such as training, communication, seminars - all important elements in ensuring success in implementing changing management policies and practices, as well as ensuring that the merit principle is not left out of the black advancement process.

5.3.2 Managerial Function and a Shortage of Skills

The first positions to be Africanised were labour relations, public relations and marketing. This is because these positions were at the interface between management and labour, and management and the community. In production, finance and general administration black advancement has been slower. One reason is that in industry in Zimbabwe these positions lead to top management, and are concerned with overall control and functioning of the company. The slow pace is an indicator of the lack of willingness on the part of white management to bring blacks into the nerve centre of the operation. It is also an indication of a shortage of appropriately qualified and experienced blacks for these positions. Industry does also report a skills shortage in these function areas.

5.3.3 Industrial sub-sector and Ownership

The industrial sub-sector is not a factor in the pace of black advancement. Where top management had taken a decision to implement change, there was progress, whatever the skill requirements of the industry.

In addition the pace of black advancement in foreign-owned companies was not necessarily faster than locally-owned companies. Where a foreign-owned company still had conservative (prejudiced) local white management, there was little change. Companies with part Government ownership did reflect change in relation to black advancement more often, and this was due to Government pressure from the top, namely at Board level.

5.3.4 Merit and Experience

Merit and experience are controversial criteria which have affected the pace of black advancement in the private sector, as well as the public sector. Black and white management alike were of the opinion that advancement should be on merit. Few black managers (but there are some) are willing to be token blacks advanced for their colour alone to improve the image of the company, and not on the basis of merit. White management have however definitely used 'merit' as a criteria for not employing blacks. Without clear guidelines, merit can be very subjective.

'Experience' is a crucial aspect of appointment on merit. It is, however, often used as an excuse not to appoint blacks. Such an excuse reflected a negative attitude to black advancement. First, historically blacks did not have the opportunity to acquire experience. Secondly, after 1980 many whites were incorporated into the private sector from the army, the civil service and the police without the appropriate 'experience'. The private sector maintained that they were 'skilled and experienced administrators'. Such white appointees did sometimes become obstacles to change, often not educated or enlightened with progressive or new management practices.

Black management do however accept the importance of experience for senior and top management. Black management point to the problems in the public sector where people have been appointed without the necessary experience. Black management made the point that the only way to develop 'experience' is to appoint the right person to the job and give them the opportunity to develop.

A false dichotomy is presented by some between redressive action and merit. Those favouring merit equate redressive action with declining standards and point to the public sector for evidence. Such a dichotomy leads to a lack of action and conflict. Redressive action must take place in order to include all population groups in the process of development, whether through affirmative action in appointment and promotion or simply through human resource development programmes. Redressive action must also take place with competence and merit. Those who favour simply putting blacks in places because they are black, that is with colour as the sole criteria, can come to overlook the merit principle.

5.3.5 Cultural Differences

Some white management attributed problems in relation to black advancement to cultural differences. Blacks did not work as hard, could not discipline juniors, abuse company cars and 'put their hand in the till'. White management is as susceptible as black when it comes to 'putting a hand in the till'. In relation to culture and the overall quality of an appointee in relation to performing their job, one black manager said:

"There is no difference between white and black management, only a problem when a manager is promoted to a position without the skills to make him a manager."

Black managers did express the view that there was a lack of appreciation and understanding of African culture, the common assumption being that everything to do with 'white' culture is right. What was evident however is that all companies do have their company culture, their ways of behaving and doing things in the company. Black management sometimes underestimated the importance of absorbing this culture if they wish to succeed in the business world.

Certain aspects of 'white' culture do still however put the young white school leaver at an advantage over his black counterpart. A black personnel manager for an electronics company reported that whilst they wished to have more black school leavers as new recruits, on the basis of merit they got more whites. The reason for this was that the entrance test for the company involved tasks such as changing a plug. Some of the black recruits had never lived with electricity, never mind changed a plug. For such an industry, the technological culture with which more white children than black grow up in Zimbabwe, places them at an advantage in relation to certain skills. This particular company changed their recruitment test and acknowledged the need to give extra exposure to technology in the course of training young black school leavers.

5.3.6 The Profile of White and Black Management

A factor hindering black advancement has also been the inability of white management to accommodate changing management practices. In addition to racial prejudice, this reluctance can be explained by the differing profiles of black and white management. White management is generally long-serving, has over ten years experience, is over 40 years old, and only has secondary education. Most black management has only been in the company about five years, has less than ten years experience, is under 40 years old and has at least one degree (see appendix 3 graphs 1 and 2). White management therefore feels threatened by up and coming black management. The generally lower educational level of white management also makes them less able to adapt and change.

Long serving white managerial staff are also an obstacle to the process of change in that they have experience, and still ten years ahead of them in the company. A number of companies expressed the difficulty of bringing about change when the management was long-serving, white and about 50 years old.

5.3.7 Window Dressing and Political Appointments

An inability on the part of some white management to address the issue of black advancement genuinely, has led to the problem of window dressing. In addition window dressing was a cynical response by the private sector to the Presidential Directive.

'Window dressing' appointments were made simply to have a black in place. The appointee was not appointed to a job, but because he was black. He was not necessarily appointed because he was capable, but because he was black, and with some luck related to the Minister as well. Such appointees have been given large salaries, perks, and often left to 'sink or swim'. They were given little support and all watched while they failed, reinforcing racist stereotypes that blacks cannot do the job after all. Such appointments have had a variety of ill-effects: underperformance of black managers, under-utilisation of potential and actual skills, alienation, frustration and corruption. The source of 'window dressing' is prejudice and an inability to adjust to the changing political environment. Window dressing is an insult and disservice to blacks. It reinforces racial prejudice and leads black and white alike to see and believe that blacks will fail.

Prior to 1980 and soon after, larger companies engaged in such appointments. Political appointments were made by companies which wanted to ensure political contact and therefore access to Government in order to facilitate their operations. Such appointees were put on the Board or in senior management, made a non-executive Director, given titles such as Public Relations Officer or Public Relations Director. After about 1985 as Government and the private sector built their own rapport, such appointments became redundant, and had to be sidelined or paid off. Some still exist, and are referred to with embarrassment. Others do still act as an important channel in getting the appropriate decisions made for the private sector.

5.3.8 Rapid Promotion and False Expectations

Both black and white have received rapid promotion with the high turnover of personnel in the private sector since 1980. Many whites went into senior positions (often Personnel) in industry from being District Commissioners and members of the Police Force. These whites, brought in soon after 1980, became an additional barrier to the incorporation of young black graduates in the private sector. They contributed to the protectionism already existing, raising the price of their labour and keeping blacks out. However, it has generally been the overpromoted black personnel who reach the headlines. One black executive said on the point of over promotion:

"Black management has not been exposed to business for a long time. Today if you push a black to become Chief Executive, he is a non-swimmer in the deep end. He drowns and people pour water on him instead of pull him out. Black top appointments have been used for political ends in the parastatals and private sector. Someone with an economics degree gets appointed Chief Executive of a parastatal, and makes a mess. The business community looks on, and says no. You cannot bring youngsters in with a degree and give them top positions. Blacks who accept such posts do so for selfish reasons. Whether in the Public Service or industry such appointments cause problems."

The mobility of black management, as well as white, has in cases been very rapid, leading to raise expectations on the part of others as the labour market becomes more stable. Some black management are of the opinion that there should be more blacks at senior and top levels of management, with Government intervention if necessary. However, affirmative action has no part to play in appointment at this level. Affirmative action can only be used in the development of potential for senior and top management. Experience is a key requirement for top management, and where political appointments or window dressing appointments have been made at this level, it is generally to the detriment of the company or organisation. Demands by black management for affirmative action at top level have more to do with personal advancement through opportunist means than a moral question with regard to discrimination.

5.3.9 White Mobility

Despite racial prejudice on the part of top management in some companies, protectionism and 'nepotism' by white management, and lack of policy by Government, there has been a notable increase in the proportion of blacks in management. There are a number reasons for this. First, a realisation by the larger companies in particular that if they are to survive in Zimbabwe they must train and develop competent black personnel. Second, with the emigration of some 50 percent of the white population many vacancies were created. Whilst initially these were filled by whites, this is no longer the case. Many young whites are leaving the country believing there is no future for them in Zimbabwe because of their colour. New recruits are therefore in the majority black. Many companies prefer to train young blacks whom they know will stay in the country, rather than young whites who will gain experience and leave.

5.3.10 The Need for Redressive Action Policy and Strategy

The reason policy is necessary at an organisational or institutional level, despite the fact that progress has occurred without it, is to avoid cosmetic 'window dressing' and political appointments, and to overcome real skill needs in the management, professional or technical occupations.

The December 1989 Business Opinion Survey of the Business Studies Department at the University of Zimbabwe showed that 70 percent of respondents were adversely affected by a shortage of skills, the highest ratio for more than five years. This is an indicator that skills shortages cannot be wished away with political ideology, and that while there has been black advancement, it has not been sufficient to meet the needs of industry. Occupation specific analysis is the most crucial aspect of redressive action or an affirmative action programme. Present evaluations of skill or occupational shortages in Zimbabwe are based on foreign recruitment figures.

Planned education and training, and enlightened recruitment and promotion procedures are therefore the key to redressing imbalances of colour in the labour market. The merit principle remains an important factor in a redressive action programme. Avoiding action on the private sector, allows whites to remain predominant in this sector.

5.3.11 The Necessity of Restructuring the Economy

Some companies where no black advancement is evident are family owned companies which comprise 50 percent of local private capital. Such companies cannot give away family interests and wealth in the name of Africanisation. Others where progress has been slow maintain there are no jobs available at middle and senior levels due to a lack of expansion in their company and the economy as a whole. Increasingly black management are demanding access to ownership, not only positions or jobs. The difficulty is that ownership cannot be given but only created or bought.

if affirmative action is going to affect more than just a relatively small number of blacks who are already upwardly mobile, it must be accompanied by strategies for growth and expansion in the economy. Unless this is so, ten years after independence, when colour is less of a problem, the real structural problems begin to emerge: unemployment, a decline in living standards and real wages, a lack of real growth in the economy. This has been the case with Zimbabwe. Black advancement in the private sector has been conservative in form and content. It has meant bringing blacks into the existing pre-independence economic structure as replacements, painfully, rather than generating economic diversification and growth which would permit and induce/necessitate the employment of blacks at all skill levels for whom there is presently no work. If a lesson is to be learned from Zimbabwe's experience it is to concentrate more on development and growth, and the racial imbalance in employment will be forced, in time, to take care of itself.

5.4 Case Studies in the Private Sector

The quotations below illustrate how seven case studies have, or have not, approached the issue of black advancement. As one black chief executive reported in 1989:

"In my view less than half of companies are addressing the issue. Of those who are they do it in varying degrees, they are not all as effective as they could be. For some there is no hurry. Some go all the way. Some - in-between."

5.4.1 Case Study A

This quotation is from a white senior personnel manager in a company with all white top and senior management. In this company, white senior and top management do not have university degrees; they have all been in the company 10 - 25 years; they are all over 50 years old and due to retire in about 10 years. Case Study A is a foreign-owned company:

"The company has no black advancement strategy, but middle, junior and below are all black. There has been a drop in the number of white employed since 1980 by 50%. One black non-executive Director was appointed before independence when the company realised the need for blacks in senior management. We were critical of the person and he did not perform... The problem was that advancement was too hasty due to pressure. The company employs Zimbabweans. The best person for the job. Black advancement is inevitable. We do not need a strategy. Those who would naturally make it will get there. Some think promotion is too slow. Every firm should have a human resource strategy. We do sometimes have it here" (White Senior Personnel Manager).

5.4.2 Case Study B

Case Study B has largely white senior management. The quotation comes from a black executive Personnel Manager:

"Before 1980, blacks who were brought in had little educational background. Up to 1985 there was little black advancement. Those appointments there were largely window dressing. We appointed people with influence with government but no job. Many of these have fallen by the wayside. We have agreed to phase them out if they cannot develop. Such appointments created problems. The people were difficult to control and did not perform. The appointment of a new Chief Executive who was an expatriate had an important effect. We now recruit, train and develop graduates for our graduate trainee programme. The aim is to Africanise management. Ninety five

to redress the imbalance. Our emphasis is on the need to groom people with academic qualifications. Some whites left as a result of the black advancement programme." (Black Executive Personnel manager).

5.4.3 Case Study C

Case Study C has a predominantly white top management.

"There was no black advancement strategy before 1987, only a low key plan. Now there is a plan - there is graduate development and personnel development, and a definite identification of blacks. The problem is a lack of people. Some of the blacks targeted are weak. We are therefore stuck with people we cannot push up. We are now bringing in professional blacks. Top management are local whites. It takes 5 - 10 years to develop top management in this area. We have a conscious policy to appoint blacks, but they must be qualified for the job. There are whites moving up now who we left down so as to accelerate blacks. 'Merit' as a criteria for promotion is problematic - it often means the shape of ones nose." (Black Executive Personnel Manager).

"Black management with degrees have done well. Promotion from within has been a problem due to black personnel lacking education. Senior management do not discuss the strategy for promoting blacks with us. The whites feel strongly about this. They feel slighted. They feel appointments are political and do not agree with the decision of top management. I think merit is better. Advancement must be non-racial - best ability, best experience. There is only a space when a job is free. I had not thought of black advancement as a need to redress an imbalance. Ten years ago the blacks were not in the running for the jobs the whites are in now. I feel the company is promoting blacks because they are black. All whites do. We are told the rationale is to comply with the Ministry of Labour." (White Senior Manager).

5.4.4 Case Study D

This case study is of a company with a black Chief Executive. The company is part-Government and part-local ownership.

"Government took out shares in the company a few years after independence. A lot of whites left the company then. The change from 1980 to now has been remarkable. Bold decisions had to be taken. Black advancement has been rapid and thorough in about 5 years. There was a black advancement strategy. It was agreed that if a white left we would do our best to replace them with a black. All appointments were however made on merit. The yardstick must be business acumen. The experience of the parastatals proves this. No purpose is served when a black face is in a job, but not involved in business decisions. This serves no purpose and shows a lack of trust. Where there has not been one suitable experienced and capable person to fill a management position, we reorganise and restructure so that the position is shared. In this way people are exposed and developed for a senior management position." (Black Senior Manager).

"Where there is a directive to Africanise, it must be stressed that it is not to the detriment of the whites. My criticism of the blacks is that they do not always see it this way. They demand a job because they are black. I do not feel threatened in this company. The effects of Africanising have been good for this company. Senior

blacks see themselves as being given a chance. Performance of the company is better. Senior management are more committed. Communication has improved. Black and white have a sense of belonging and work as a team. Part of our strategy a few years ago was to retire 8 - 10 whites over retirement age. The best people available to replace them were black." (White Senior Manager).

5.4.5 Case Study E

The following quotation is from a white Chief engineer in a company which has a black Chief Executive and considers itself having redressed the racial imbalance. The company is foreign-owned (South African):

"In 1975 the company had an enlightened factory manager. Then we had a policy to take blacks for particular jobs - in particular black apprentices. Now those blacks are in management - Mechanical Engineers and Engineer Foreman. In engineering it is a natural progression. We now have no whites. Our Chief executive came to the company with a degree in the mid-seventies. There was a deliberate attempt to push him through the ranks. There was some resistance from whites in the early stages. We had to take on good blacks realising the problems with the whites. Whites who were unhappy left. Whites were never pushed aside or taken over.

Seven or eight years ago I would have said there was not a black who could do anything. Other companies now face the problem we faced 7 - 15 years ago. The prospects here are good from a black standpoint. The company has always attended to the issue of black advancement, and it is now no longer an issue. Blacks are not frustrated. Nor am I. Time is the reason. We are now OK. We have gone through the traumas and are now able to be selective.

Companies should seek competent blacks with integrity. They should realise, first that government wants more movement in the area. Second, for the future long life of the organisation it is better to get blacks in. They cannot live off whites alone."
(White Chief engineer).

5.4.6 Case Study F

This case study is of a foreign-owned company with a majority white top management. The recently appointed white expatriate Chief Executive had the following to say:

"Up to a couple of years ago there was no plan for black advancement. The person at the top in this kind of company, has to come through production... Some blacks had been sent abroad to train, but they largely failed because their educational background was not good enough. The right people had not been chosen. Since my appointment we have sent more blacks for training, a couple of whom are earmarked for top management. To develop this top management in this company takes 8 - 10 years, and this is accelerated. Those earmarked for the top, would be pushed sooner if possible. This is specific strategy to promote black Zimbabweans.

Black advancement is an issue. You cannot get away from it. A long term strategy is needed to develop blacks for senior management. The way to approach black advancement is to strengthen the base. You need a structure of educated middle and senior management. You need to plan and reinforce from the bottom. Relevant

training and planned strategies are the only answer to black advancement. ¹⁹⁸⁸ careful planning and a strategy you then move as fast as is possible in terms of acceptability and keeping the firm going.

There is no merit in black advancement for the sake of it.... Too rapid promotion is a bad thing. There are blacks and whites who have been too rapidly promoted and have not been able to cope. White senior management believes in merit - but it also believes that blacks cannot do the job. They need to be won over by being proved incorrect. (White Expatriate Chief Executive).

5.4.7 Case Study G

The following case study is of a locally-owned company, with a black Chief Executive (the only black Chief Executive of a locally-owned company in 1989). The problems of a lack of black advancement are still being addressed by this company.

"When I became Chief Executive I realised the need for the company to reflect the national character. At the top there was only me. This was a result of the historical situation. The problem was how to correct the situation? We took the following measures:

- a. *Through accelerated training at every level.*
- b. *By giving preference to blacks who were qualified.*
- c. *By appointing black understudies for a minimum of five years.*
- d. *Not through sacking whites.*
- e. *Through careful recruitment, training and succession planning.*
- f. *Through improving communication channels and ensuring open and honest discussion on the problems relating to black advancement.*
- g. *Through retiring people at or over retirement age.*

It was not easy. Skills are acquired, they are not inborn. I have had to push people myself. The problem has been to strike a balance between redressing the balance and maintaining efficiency. The blacks say I have not been promoting enough, and the whites say I have been promoting blacks. We need to develop, train and promote blacks, but not to the exclusion of white Zimbabweans." (Black Chief Executive).

A white executive in the same company made the following comment:

"Black advancement is not inevitable. You have to bring people in. We are overstaffed to a certain extent. I have been encouraged to look for blacks. There is a conscious strategy in the company to train black senior management. We recruit executive assistants - graduates who are given training. If there was no policy one would tend to recruit whites. The policy is therefore a safeguard." (White Senior Manager).

These extracts from case studies show the various approaches to redressive action by several companies. Several of the quotes show that some white management have not realised the moral necessity of redressive action nine years after independence. This is an illustration of how long it takes for attitudes to change. The quotes also illustrate how it is the attitude of top management which is the key to bringing about change. Whether companies took affirmative action measures in appointment and promotion, or simply consciously expanded human resource development programmes, redressive action was possible and successful where top management were committed to it.

6. REDRESSIVE ACTION EMPLOYMENT POLICY AND THE FORGOTTEN ISSUE OF GENDER

Despite the stated policy of Government to support the advancement of women, redressive action in Zimbabwe have meant the advancement of black men. As one senior women civil servant stated:

"The Public Service has not done much to advance women into all sectors and occupations. The feeling was that we should deal with black advancement first - and that meant the advancement of black males ... Women do not understand what they are up against with male attitudes. We need a policy with Presidential backing. Otherwise only lip service will be paid to this issue."

6.1 Statistics on female employment

The National Manpower Survey of 1981 showed that in addition to racial inequality in employment, in particular in the trained workforce, there was also gender inequality. Women comprise about 51 percent of the total population, or 3 827 850 out of a total of 7 501 470 at the 1982 census (see table 13). However according to the NMS only about 1 percent or 40 937 fell into the semi-skilled, skilled and professional skill categories in 1981. Of these over 50% or 21 920 were white in 1981.

The levels and patterns of female employment between 1981 and 1988 will be examined by focusing on the following variables:

- i. colour, skill and occupational group;
- ii. industry, sector and occupation in formal employment;
- iii. the informal sector and subsistence agriculture.

Any examination of the advancement of blacks or women since independence cannot be separated from the general employment situation, namely the lack of expansion of the labour market, particularly in the productive sector of the formal economy.

6.1.1 Colour, skill and occupational group

The National Manpower Survey of 1981 showed that black women in the trained workforce totalled 24 017 or 51 percent of women in professional, skilled and semi-skilled occupational categories (see table 14). White women were however dominant in the clerical and related, and administrative and managerial occupations. Black women were dominant in professional and technical (i.e. nurses and teachers), sales, services, agriculture and production. The National Manpower Survey observed that female employment fell overwhelmingly into service occupations:

"There was little evidence of female participation in top management and other decision-making occupations. It can be concluded that the data both recorded and reflected the colonial and the male domination of our society." (NMS, Vol.1,:50)

By 1985 black women were dominant in all occupational groups except administrative and managerial, which comprises a very small number of employees (see table 14). White women were highest in professional and technical, and clerical and related occupations. The number of white women in clerical and related however dropped significantly from 13 983 in 1981 to 3 885 in 1985 (although it should be noted that these two sets of data arise from different samples). As the number of black

declined slightly, it is possible that a significant proportion of these white women have been replaced by black men as part of the black advancement process. Whilst vacancies were created in the labour market with white emigration, it was black men and not black women who moved into the spaces.

Table 13
Females by Colour 1987

	NO.	%
African women	3 736 590	48
White women	74 570	2
Asian and Coloured women	15 720	.2

Source: CSO, 1987.

Table 14
Female Employees by Occupational Group and Colour: 1981 and 1985
(semi-skilled, skilled and professional)

MAJOR OCCUP. GROUP		1981			1985		
		BLACK	WHITE	TOTAL	BLACK	WHITE	TOTAL
Prof.,Tech., Related	No.	4 654	3 014	7 668	7 068	2 691	9 759
	%	61	39	19	72.5	27.5	36
Admin & Managerial	No.	235	857	1 092	218	373	591
	%	21	79	3	42	58	2
Clerical & Related	No.	6 438	13 983	20 421	5 639	3 885	9 524
	%	32	68	50	59	41	35
Sales Workers	No.	2 361	2 092	4 403	1 489	602	2 091
	%	53	48	11	71	29	8
Service Workers	No.	1 868	662	2 530	1 016	634	1 650
	%	74	26	6	61.5	38.5	6
Agriculture	No.	1 089	531	1 620	354	454	808
	%	67	33	4	44	36	3
Prod. & Related	No.	2 304	675	2 979	1 788	249	2 037
	%	78	23	7	88	12	7.5
Occupation inadequate described	No.	118	106	224	925	65	990
	%	53	47	1	94	6	3.5
TOTAL:	No:	24 017	21 920	40 937	18 280	8 953	27 233
	%:	59	41	100	67	33	100

Source: Compiled from NMS 1981 Vol 3:198; ARM, 1985:19,24.

NOTE: a. Black includes Asian, Coloured and African.

- b. 1981 data is from the National Manpower Survey which was a sample of skilled, semi-skilled and professional employees - a total of 298 391.
- c. 1985 data is based on the Ministry of Labour Annual Survey of Employees which was sent to all private, parastatal and local authority establishments in the formal sector employing 10 or more workers, and a 30 percent sample of establishments employing less than 10 workers across all sectors. The Survey included skilled and unskilled employees and those in training. The total of the Survey was 463 364, which is approximately 50 percent of the labour force in the formal sector. Semi-skilled, skilled and professional personnel were calculated by subtracting unskilled and those in training from the total number of blacks.

Table 15 shows that the proportion of White, Coloured and Asian women, within their racial grouping, in the trained workforce was still high in 1985. The proportion of Asian and Coloured women in the workforce who are trained had gone up from 31 percent to 42 percent by 1985. Although the proportion of trained African women has gone up - it was still low in 1985 -with only 10.5 percent of the trained African workforce. Two-thirds of African women in formal employment are unskilled and wage earners as opposed to the white women the majority of whom are the salaried staff. Considering the small proportion of white women in the population, 1 percent according to the 1982 census they have a high level of participation amongst whites in the trained workforce with 30 percent in 1985 (see table 15). The same can be said for Asian and Coloured women. The overall percentage of white women amongst whites in the trained workforce has dropped from 41 percent in 1981 to 33 percent in 1985.

Table 15
Proportion of Females in the Trained Workforce by Racial Group: 1981 & 1985

	YEAR		AFRICAN	WHITE	ASIAN/COL.
TOTAL:	1981		222 806	66 224	9 361
Prof.skilled & semi-skilled in workforce	1985		158 492	29 889	6 037
WOMEN:	1981	No.	16 104	21 920	2 913
Prof.skilled & semi-skilled in workforce		%	7	33	31
	1985	No.	16 569	8 953	2 528
		%	10.5	30	42

Source: Compiled from NMS Vol.3:176, 198. ARM 1985:21, 24.

Note: points b. and c. in the note for the table 14 above apply here as well.

6.1.2 Industry and Sector by Gender

Female employment in the formal sector from 1981 to 1987 has gone up from 87 184 or 13%, to 130 352 or 15,7% of all employees in the formal sector (nearly 1 million) (see tables 16 and 17). This increase is primarily due to increases in health, education and public administration. The proportion of women in industry, for example manufacturing, has in fact gone down from 7.5% to 7% of the total. This needs to be compared with the expansion of male employment in the formal sector which has also been very small.

Increases in numbers have been made in the public sector, in particular public administration, health and education. There has been an increase in the number of private domestic workers and a drop in the number of male domestic workers. Only in health are women in the majority. In this sector women are largely medical assistants, nurses, midwives and related staff. In public administration women are involved in secretarial and related duties.

in food processing, textiles and clothing, printing and publishing. Even in these sub-sectors they were only 8 percent, 10 percent and 13 percent of the labour force respectively. In this respect Zimbabwe differs from other countries where women often dominate in these sub-sectors. The NMS found the proportion of women in technical and related occupations to be very low indeed.

The pattern of female employment by industry and sector has not changed much since 1980, although numbers have increased slightly. Women are still largely in occupations traditionally thought to be 'women's work'. In terms of numbers there has been a greater increase in the number of males in the formal sector, reflecting black advancement of men, and greater job opportunities for men.

Table 16
Number Employees by economic sector and gender: 1980 & 1987
(Total number employees in the formal sector)

Economic Sector	YEAR	PUBLIC SECTOR		PRIVATE SECTOR		TOTAL	
		Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female
Agriculture	1980	10 080	85	2 155	903	12 235	988
	1987	4 993	229	2 326	527	7 319	756
Mining	1980	106	3	63 696	1 204	63 802	1 207
	1987	106	1	56 321	1 474	56 427	1 475
Manufacturing	1980	10 494	350	135 032	11 466	145 256	11 816
	1987	10 384	602	157 091	11 999	167 475	12 601
Electricity	1980	6 489	227	-	-	6 489	227
	1987	7 829	281	-	-	7 829	281
Construction	1980	16 166	244	25 492	322	41 658	566
	1987	24 402	633	23 934	376	48 363	1 009
Trade, Restau. & Hotels	1980	3 849	607	53 948	11 424	57 797	12 031
	1987	6 102	534	64 402	11 991	70 504	13 125
Transport	1980	26 850	2 134	15 117	917	41 958	3 051
	1987	28 816	2 078	18 667	1 210	47 483	3 288
Public Admin.	1980	56 016	4 973	-	-	56 016	4 973
	1987	85 075	9 902	-	-	85 075	9 902
Health	1980	5 884	7 720	438	855	6 322	8 575
	1987	8 851	11 094	501	1 091	9 352	12 185
Private Domestics	1980	-	-	93 516	17 692	93 516	17 692
	1987	-	-	76 044	24 949	76 044	24 949
Education	1980	25 438	12 595	979	574	26 417	13 169
	1987	63 052	34 625	1 176	760	64 288	35 385
Finance	1980	497	379	6 868	4 616	7 365	4 495
	1987	1 261	604	10 129	4 856	11 330	5 460
Other Services	1980	18 524	3 839	15 926	4 055	34 450	7 894
	1987	26 067	5 716	21 280	4 220	49 347	9 936
TOTAL	1980	180 384	33 154	413 157	54 028	593 551	87 184
	1987	266 860	66 899	433 906	63 453	700 758	130 352

Source: Fieldwork by author, calculated from unpublished CSO statistics, 1988.

Table 17

Percentage Employees by economic sector and gender: 1980 & 1987

(Total employees in the formal sector)

Economic Sector	YEAR	PUBLIC SECTOR		PRIVATE SECTOR		TOTAL % Female
		%Male	%Female	%Male	%Female	
Agriculture	1980	76	1	16	7	7.5
	1987	62	3	29	6	9.5
Mining	1980	.16	0	98	1.8	2
	1987	.2	0	97.3	2.5	5
Manufacturing	1980	7	0	86	7	7.5
	1987	5.5	0	88	6.5	7
Electricity	1980	96.5	3.5	-	-	3.5
	1987	96.5	3.5	-	-	3.5
Construction	1980	38	.5	60.5	1	1.5
	1987	49.5	1	48.5	1	2
Trade, Restau. & Hotels	1980	5.5	1	77	16.5	17
	1987	7.3	1.3	77	14.3	15.6
Transport	1980	60	5	33	2	7
	1987	57	4	37	2	6
Public Admin.	1980	92	8	-	-	8
	1987	89.5	10.5	-	-	10.5
Health	1980	39.5	52	3	5.5	57.5
	1987	41	52	2	5	56.5
Private Domestics	1980	-	-	84	16	16
	1987	-	-	75	25	25
Education	1980	64	32	2.5	1.5	33.5
	1987	63	35	1	1	36
Finance	1980	4	3	55.5	37.5	40.5
	1987	7	3.5	60.5	29	32.5
Other Services	1980	44	9	38	9	18.5
	1987	44	10	36	7	17
TOTAL	1980	26	5	61	8	13
	1987	32	8	52	8	15.7

Source: Fieldwork by author, calculated from unpublished CSO statistics, 1988.

6.1.3 Informal Sector and Subsistence Agriculture

The under-representation of women in formal public or private sector employment, and in the semi-skilled, skilled and professional occupational categories, can to a large extent be attributed to the migrant labour system which resulted in a preponderance of males in the urban areas. Since 1980 this pattern has not been broken. While migrant labour is not institutionalised, the pattern where the women in the large majority live and work in subsistence agriculture in the rural areas, and often subsidise their husbands who live and work in the urban areas (because their wages are too low) still exists.

These women and their contribution to the national economy are not accurately reflected in national statistics. Table 18 below states that 53 percent of women are considered 'economically inactive'. Yet most of them will be involved in daily work to feed and provide for their families.

Table 18
Percentage women and men in employment

	MEN	WOMEN
Formal sector	47%	8%
Informal sector	.7%	5%
Unemployed	9%	5%
Farming	24%	29%
Economically inactive	20%	53%

Source: Statistical Yearbook, 1987, CSO: 45.

Eight percent of women work in the formal sector and they form about 16 percent of all those employed in the formal sector. A very small figure indeed. The majority of women are in 'farming' or 'economically inactive'. What this means is that the majority of women are in communal agriculture. In order to uplift the position of women in employment, to enable the women to be more productively employed and to earn more, this is where serious attention and policy initiatives are needed.

6.2 The Reasons for the Position of Women in the Labour Market

A variety of reasons account for the place of African women in the labour market today:

- a. The migrant labour system favoured the employment of men, in industry and as domestics. The women remained in the rural areas. This pattern has not been broken.
- b. Women who did manage to make it to the towns resorted to illegal activities of petty trading, beer brewing and prostitution in order to survive.
- c. Employers of labour, even where it was not migrant, favoured men. Areas where women are often employed in other countries, such as food processing and clothing, in Zimbabwe are predominantly male. Nursing and teaching have historically been the only areas open to women with education.
- d. Boys, where funds are low, are more likely to be sent to school than the girls. Women lack the adequate education and training for employment in the formal sector, or other sectors of the labour force.
- e. In a situation of high unemployment, the jobs are more likely to go to men, who do not make demands for benefits relating to childbirth and child care.
- f. Traditional and colonial culture, and attitudes of men to women and of women about themselves, play a crucial part in the participation of women in the labour market and the position of women in the home. Whilst independence has not eradicated racial prejudice and discrimination, racism has been seriously eroded. Independence has not led to a similar change of attitudes in relation to women.

Two case studies in the textile and clothing industry showed very different results in the numbers of females employed. In Case Study 1, 40 percent of employees were women. Women, black and white, were at all levels of the firm including top and senior management. The Managing Director of Case Study 1 is a white women. She maintains that the firm is made up of women and blacks, with only one white manager. Few firms, she maintains, reflect such statistics. As with black advancement, the crucial issue affecting the employment of women is the attitude of management. In this case, the attitude of male management, black and white, at top, senior and middle management levels. The MD of Case Study one expresses the view that:

"The fact women have babies deters men from employing them. We give them three months maternity leave with no problem. Employers (men) must accept that women are biologically equipped to have children. This cannot be used as an excuse not to employ women ... We have women as managers over men... Men and women do the same jobs ... If a child is sick the women can take her sick leave and so can the fathers.." (Interview 19/12/89).

The figures of case study 2 are very different. There are no women in senior and top management. And there are no women on the factory floor. Women are mainly amongst non-managerial employees as clerks and secretaries. The white male MD of Case Study 2 maintains that he cannot employ women on the factory floor. The reason given is that there are night shifts and they do not want to put women on the night shift with the men. It comes back to a question of attitude. The MD of Case Study 2 maintains that the women are there waiting for work and waiting to prove themselves. They just need to be given the chance. And this requires a positive and non-prejudiced attitude by management.

Table 19
Two Case Studies: Males and Females Employed in
the Clothing and Textile Industry, 1989.

Management and Employees	<u>MALES AND FEMALES IN EMPLOYMENT</u>			
	CASE STUDY 1		CASE STUDY 2	
	Males	Females	Males	Females
Top and Senior Management	7	6	9	0
Middle Management	7	16	50	5
Junior Management	42	21	70	5
Non-management, clerks etc..	196	116	51	22
Total Monthly Paid	252	159	180	32
Weekly Paid Factory Workers	236	164	64	0
TOTAL	No. 488	323	244	32
	% 60	40	88	12

Source: Fieldwork by author, 1989.

6.3 Redressive Legislation Affecting Women

Government has not instituted preferential or non-preferential redressive measures directed at improving labour market access for women. Black women have benefitted from the removal of legislation which discriminates on racial grounds. They have also benefitted as women from legislation directed at promoting women's equality in the society. Such legislative measures have included:

- The Legal Age of Majority Act (1982) which conferred adult status and full legal capacity on every Zimbabwean citizen aged 18 years and above, regardless of race or gender.
- The Customary Law and Primary Courts Act (1981) which assured, amongst other things, that deserted, divorced or unmarried women could claim maintenance from the fathers of their children.
- The Matrimonial Causes Act (1985) which enabled women, upon divorce to be beneficiaries of the property that they had accumulated during marriage, and changed the procedure whereby children automatically went to the father upon divorce.
- The Succession Bill aimed to standardise the equal rights of women and men to inheritance. (E Batezat: 1981:58).

Whilst the object of these changes has been to promote women's equality, many of the inequalities of customary law still stand, and changes in the law have not changed people's ideas, men and women alike. In addition none of these legal changes have facilitated the redressing of the unequal position of women in employment, arguably the most important aspect of women's equality and independence.

There have been some limited changes to the law in relation to the working conditions of women. The equal pay regulation of 1981 in principle ended lower pay for women. However in many of the unskilled and semi-skilled occupations where women are, it is not really possible to prove women are being given a lower salary because they are women. The Industrial Conciliation Act Section 126 D and E in 1981 introduced unpaid maternity leave and time off for breast feeding. The Labour Relations Act of 1985 further improved these regulations by conferring paid maternity leave and emphasising that employers should not discriminate on the grounds of race or gender.

Whilst this legislation was a step in the right direction, it does not benefit the majority of women in formal employment. Most women cannot get home to breastfeed for half an hour at lunch time and half an hour in the afternoon, nor are most women in a position to fight for equal pay and paid maternity leave. Most women are employed as casual labourers employed in the lower grades with no possibilities of promotion or training. The question may be asked as to whether the legislation has not in fact discouraged employers from taking on women.

More important the majority of women are not in formal employment. Most African women work in the informal sector and in communal areas in subsistence agriculture. There has not therefore been any redressive action employment policy which has promoted the position of women, especially black women in the formal sector. Neither has there been a strategy or policy which has significantly altered the position of women in relation to employment for the large majority of women outside the formal sector. Some women have benefitted from the Africanisation of the Public Service. But in general it is African men who have benefitted from the process of black advancement and redressive action employment policy aimed at redressing racial imbalances.

An affirmative action strategy or some redressive action is needed to raise the position of women in general, and of African women in particular, in the labour market. Left to itself, the situation will not alter significantly. This is evident in how little change there has been in the position of African women in the labour market since 1980. The key aspect to an affirmative action strategy would be to facilitate the numbers of girls and women in all-levels of education and training. Employment creation is the other important facilitator for bringing women into the labour market. Reform of production methods in the rural areas would also uplift the position of women in the economy. In whatever sector - formal, informal, communal agriculture, in the home - the position of women needs to be addressed through an affirmative action programme which is an integral national economic and social development.

7. THE BROADER IMPLICATIONS OF REDRESSIVE ACTION EMPLOYMENT POLICY

7.1 'Africanisation' and Democratisation

Whilst any change from colonial to post-colonial society, apartheid to post-apartheid society, must involve redressive action through affirmative action and equalisation measures, getting blacks in whites places does not of itself alter the socio-economic structure of the society. Nor does it necessarily lead to a more democratic society in the long term. Whilst giving the vote to a black population previously denied it and Africanising the civil service is a step forward in the process of democracy, it often stops there. There is a problem in the Africanisation process of confusing content for form.

The decisive question is not whether people are white or black, but whether they are using their skills and resources to facilitate the advancement of others. This is not to deny the necessity to redress imbalances in the labour market and in the political arena, but it does point to the limitations of a conception of Africanisation or affirmative action which does not encompass the broader political objective of democracy or address the way forward in terms of economic and social development.

Whilst recognising its importance in the decolonisation process, black advancement is in essence an attempt to alter the form of the situation without altering its content. Black advancement as such addresses itself to the question of individual representation - not social power; it assumes the problem is one of personnel (more blacks), not necessarily one of structure (more democracy and change in the economy). Hence, black advancement often remains trapped within the conservative framework of the society. The symptomatic aspects of oppression are dealt with (i.e. the discrimination against an ethnic group); it sometimes ignores the nature of social inequality in the society. It locates the problem as an ethnic or racial one, whereas in reality it is one of power and social privilege (John Hoffman, interview 1/6/90).

In other words Africanisation or black advancement does not provide all the solutions to the problems of post-colonial and post-apartheid society. The result is that ten years after independence in Zimbabwe, after Africanisation, black advancement has been accomplished, and colour is no longer the source of all problems, the real problems of power and privilege come into focus more sharply. Issues of restructuring and access to the economy come to the fore rather than simply the issue of access for blacks to employment.

Colonialism and apartheid are identified with exploitation and social inequality. The liberation struggle in Zimbabwe gave rise to aspirations for socialism, or at least the need for some redress in the social inequities of the society. In the independence period this goal has been more difficult to realise than de-racialisation of the labour market.

7.2 The Ownership Pattern of the Zimbabwe Economy

Government has not radically altered the ownership pattern of the Zimbabwe economy. Government has bought out or gone into partnership with local and foreign capital, possibly in the belief that increased Government ownership is in line with socialism. The result is rather a partnership between Government and capital, with Government developing strong vested interests in the existing capitalist framework. Reliable data on the ownership pattern of the Zimbabwe economy is not retrievable from

the Registrar of Companies in Zimbabwe. Different sources put foreign ownership at about 25 - 40 percent of the economy; local private sector ownership at 50 percent; and Government ownership at 16 - 20 percent of the economy (Confederation of Zimbabwe Industries Survey, May 1989; Dr Maya, Working Paper, Zimbabwe Institute of Development Studies.)

Foreign and local 'white' capital are still predominant in the key sectors of the economy, namely agriculture, mining, manufacturing, construction, distribution, services, finance and commerce. This has been in part due to the constraints on black entrepreneurial development prior to 1980 (on trading rights, land rights, credit), and an economy which has been biased towards large scale industrial production and distribution.

7.3 'Africanisation' of Ownership

There are two mechanisms government introduced to facilitate black participation in the economy during the 1980s. First, Government sponsored small businessmen through the Small Enterprise Development Corporation (SEDCO) and the Zimbabwe Development Bank (ZDB). However resources directed to SEDCO have been relatively tiny in relation to Government's overall budget. In 1988/9 loans worth \$11 million were approved by SEDCO resulting in the creation of 800 jobs. This was the highest figure since the formation of SEDCO in 1984. Small businesses which have received assistance from SEDCO and ZDB experience a number of deep seated problems. Lack of capital, lack of appropriate managerial skills, lack of land tenure rights in rural areas, lack of infrastructure in rural areas, and lack of business premises in rural and urban areas are all problems common to 'emergent' businessmen.

A second initiative by Government sought to Africanise ownership on a larger scale. In cases of disinvestment from the country, widespread in the 1980s, the Reserve Bank gave permission for asset sale remittances only if at least 50 percent or preferably more of the local equity was in the hands of three approved categories of owners. These were to be black Zimbabweans, black Zimbabwean co-operatives, or the Zimbabwe Government. The white dominated private sector contested this ruling as being against the Constitution which forbids racial discrimination against any group in society.

At present, black participation in the formal sector is largely confined to small scale commerce and services, in particular transport and restaurants. Import-export trade has been an area of controversy with regard to 'emergent' businessmen. A strategy on the part of Government to promote black businessmen has been the preferential allocation of foreign exchange through the provision of import licences. Much of the foreign exchange has been used to import consumer items resold at exorbitant prices. In addition what have come to be called 'suitcase businessmen' have made money by obtaining and selling import licences to the private sector. The private sector has registered disapproval of preferential allocation of import licences on grounds of the misallocation of foreign exchange in the context of a serious shortage of foreign exchange for the productive sector of the economy.

The lack of change in the ownership pattern of the economy has implications for the structure of the labour market. In 1990 top management in the private sector was 90 percent white. There will not be a qualitative change in this pattern until blacks become owners and reach a greater level of participation in the productive sector of the economy, particularly in industry. Whilst Government has tried to do this through state participation in line with their objective of socialism, it has not fundamentally altered the ownership pattern in the society.

Income differences between black and white are an indicator of the slow process of social change. When one looks beyond simply numbers of black and white in the employment structure it becomes evident how long and difficult the task is of transforming an enormously unequal society. Table 20 shows that 65 percent of white males (16 423) are in the higher income category, and 4 percent of black males (31 656). Table 20 is a clear indication that whites are still higher proportionately in the higher paid occupations. While more blacks have become part of the high income group and the overall gap between white and black has therefore been reduced a little, the gap between high income and low income earners has increased. The wage freeze should have helped. Top salaries were frozen for ten years, whilst the lowest were given regular annual increments. Such figures are not surprising considering how little the ownership structure of the economy has changed since 1980. There is the indication of the emergence of a black high income group. There is also the indication that a very significant proportion of whites form part of the high income group. This Table is based on salary per month and excludes income from other assets.

It is interesting to note that most of the black females are in the lowest income group. Most white women are in the middle income group. This table is another illustration of the high proportion of white women in employment. White women form about one third of all whites in employment. Whereas black women form about 18 percent of all blacks in employment. Twice as many white women are in employment as black, and at a higher income level.

Table 20

Income by Colour and Gender: 1987.

(Employees earning cash wage per month -
Formal sector 963 525 PERSONS TOTAL)

SALARY (cash wage per month)	BLACK				WHITE			
	Male no.	%	Female no.	%	Male no.	%	Female no.	%
Less than Z\$250	508 956	67	140 772	82	1 714	7	181	1
Z\$250 - Z\$ 999	219 316	29	27 766	16	6 975	28	10 488	82
Z\$1000 +	31 656	4	3 375	2	16 423	65	2 183	17
TOTAL:	759 928	100	171 913	100	25 115	100	12 852	100

Source: CSO, 1989, unpublished data. Fieldwork by author.

7.5 Redressive Action and its Broader Policy Implications

Redressive action has a narrow focus which is the redressing of racial, gender, ethnic and other imbalances in the labour market. However, the approach Government takes to redressive action does effect and is affected by other aspects of social and economic policy, particularly in a newly

independent society when the Government is trying to overcome the disparities of the colonial era.

In Zimbabwe redressive action has been interpreted in its narrowest sense, namely the movement of blacks into professions and occupational categories previously occupied by whites. Gender imbalances have not been addressed. Ethnic or regional imbalances in access to employment have also not been addressed. Access to employment for the disabled and ex-combatants has also not been adequately addressed. In its narrowest sense of replacing whites with blacks in the labour market it is possible to say that redressive action in Zimbabwe has made a lot of progress. However this redressive action has really only benefitted black people, mainly men, who have the qualifications and experience to replace whites in middle and high income jobs. Attention needs to be given to creating equality of opportunity in the labour market for all Zimbabweans.

This is not to say that there is no longer discrimination in the labour market. In areas of the private sector there are still whites and white management who avoid employing black men and women to middle and senior management. This situation exists in either small family firms or firms with conservative, experienced but less enlightened white management. With most young whites leaving the country, in the next ten years this situation will change due to attrition of existing senior white management.

However, it is evident from the ownership pattern in the economy that policy directed at generating black participation will be necessary in order to further alter racial imbalances that still exist in the labour market. This applies to increasing the numbers of blacks in management and ownership as well as facilitating economic expansion for job creation. Government is now turning its attention to this problem. In order to carry through a redressive action programme, and to redress imbalances and access at all levels it is necessary to create more jobs in order to bring more blacks into the formal and productive sector of the economy.

Serious attention needs to be given to the role of women in the labour market. Attitudes by employers and by women of themselves are a major obstacle to change. The productive capacity of women in farming and communal agriculture needs to be raised in order to transform the lives of these families. Crucial to increasing women's access to and participation in the economy is training and education. A conscious strategy is needed to educate and train a greater proportion of the female population.

There is a lack of adequate data available of the skills requirements for the developing Zimbabwe economy. Most employers are now expressing the view that they do have skill shortages, particularly at technical and management levels. There is a need to improve the Government data base on the trained workforce. The quality of and responsibility for technical training is important in ensuring the provision of skilled personnel. Government is acutely aware of this problem. The economy would definitely benefit from the Government providing greater inducements to the private sector with regard to training. This facilitates the process of redressive action and skill development for the economy, and is an approach not yet adopted by government, which has centralized training facilities with negative results.

In public sector employment enormous strides have been made in redressing the racial imbalances of the pre-1980 era. Whilst there have been problems and these have been highlighted, in ten years black participation and access to employment in the public sector has been fundamentally altered with little reliance on expatriate personnel. The role and place of the Presidential Directive is therefore now unclear. For the record, clarification on the current place of this regulation would be useful. With racial imbalances redressed the current priority of the Ministry of the Public Service is to improve the quality of the Service through increased training and education.

As this report has shown, redressive action, and particularly the preferential measure of affirmative action needs to be a temporary expedient with a clearly defined objective. For a Government which has as its goal a non-racial and a democratic society, once glaring racial imbalances have been redressed it is necessary to ensure the new structures created and occupied by new black personnel are accessible and accountable to the majority of the population. As Nelson Mandela consistently states, he rejects black domination and white domination, democracy is the objective. Whilst democracy and the issue of redressive action employment policy may seem unrelated, they are not. The new Government of Zimbabwe is pursuing the difficult objective of transforming a racist elitist society into a non-racial society responsive to the needs of the majority of the population. Redressive action employment policy has been an integral and vital part of this process.

8. CONCLUSION

This project set out to evaluate the impact of redressive action employment policy on redressing racial and gender imbalances in employment in the context of post independence development. In ten years the Government of Zimbabwe has made enormous strides in trying to redress the inequities of the colonial period.

In the first few years after independence racial imbalances in the Public Service were redressed. The structure and role of the Service had altered significantly in order to address the needs of the majority of the population. Government used affirmative action or preferential policy measures to facilitate redressive action in the Public Service and the parastatals. The Presidential Directive to the Public Service Commission, a directive to accelerate the advancement of blacks in the Service, was the primary measure utilised in this process in the public sector. White emigration and the Retirement Incentive Scheme did also facilitate the redressing of racial imbalances in the Service. Problems have arisen in the course of the rapid changes that have taken place in the public sector. However with racial imbalances redressed, the issues of quality of service, the size of the Service, and the efficiency and productivity of the parastatals are being addressed.

In the private sector the process of redressive action has been slower. Nonetheless significant progress has been made. Some blacks have moved into occupations previously occupied by whites. Only in senior and top management are whites still predominant. This pattern will not change until the ownership structure of the economy changes and a greater number of blacks have their own ventures in the productive sector of the economy. Government never legislated on affirmative action for the private sector. Legislation outlawing discrimination was however enacted in 1985. Government has mainly used pressure and moral persuasion to convince the private sector to change its appointment and promotion procedures. About fifty percent of organisations in the private sector have responded positively and have blacks in management at all levels. In others racial prejudice is still hindering the process of change. The responsibility for changing such attitudes and practices rests largely with top and senior management.

Racial imbalances have been redressed in the public and a fair proportion of the private sector in employment through Government redressive action measures. Gender imbalances and access to employment for other disadvantaged groups has however not been redressed. Attitudes of male employers and employees is a primary factor affecting the numbers of women employed in the formal sector of the economy.

A key factor affecting employment, male and female, has been the lack of growth in the productive sector of the economy. Economic growth and job creation are now the priority items on the Government agenda. In this context research into the skill and training needs of the economy is vital in the new phase of the development of independent Zimbabwe.

RACIAL DISTRIBUTION AND SKILL IN THE LABOUR FORCE

Table A1 shows that while whites were 2 percent of the population in 1982, according to the National Manpower Survey, they comprised 2.8 percent of the labour force, or 69 810 persons.

Table A1a
TOTAL LABOUR FORCE BY COLOUR: 1982.

	BLACKS	WHITES	OTHERS	TOTAL
Employed	1 098 060	67 200	12 310	1 177 570
Unemployed	264 460	2 280	1 360	268 100
Communal farmers	1 037 920	330	150	1 038 400
TOTAL				
LABOUR FORCE:	2 400 440	69 200	13 820	2 484 070
PERCENTAGE:	97	3	0	100

Source: Compiled from Statistical Yearbook, 1985, CSO,:47.

Table A1b shows that according to the CSO Survey 1989, whites comprise only 1.4 percent of the labour force. This is to be expected in view of the fact that the black population has increased and whites have emigrated. It shows that the actual numbers of whites in the labour force have gone down from 69 200 to 44 876.

Table A1b
TOTAL LABOUR FORCE BY ETHNIC GROUP

ETHNIC GROUP	NUMBER	%
African	3 197 888	98
White	44 876	1,4
Coloured	11 617	,4
Asian	4 496	,15
Other	618	,05
TOTAL:	3 258 877	100

Source: CSO Labour Force Survey, 1989. Unpublished data.

While whites are only a very small proportion of the labour force, the large majority have always been a part of the skilled labour force. Historically this was due to access whites had to education and training; immigration of white skilled personnel; and racial recruitment policies on the part of

the public and private sectors. Table A2a shows that according to the National Manpower Survey in 1981 whites comprised 22 percent of the skilled workforce, even though they were only 3 percent of the total labour force. In the professional category whites were in the majority in 1981, 20 943 as compared to 15 964 blacks. The large majority of whites, 66 224 out of a total of 69 810 in the labour force fell into the category of skilled employees. Of this 66 224, 51 221 or 77 percent were skilled or professional employees, and only 13 percent semi-skilled. If economic growth is to be achieved and the numbers in formal employment increased, then skills which are vested in an increasingly elderly section of society would be sacrificed to political expediency at the peril of the economy as a whole.

Table A2a
SKILL AND COLOUR: 1981.

	BLACK		WHITE		% TOTAL LABOUR FORCE
	Number	%	Number	%	
Professional	15 964	6	20 934	7	13
Skilled	57 222	19	30 287	10	29
Semi-skilled	158 981	53	15 003	5	58
TOTAL:	298 391	78	66 224	22	100

Source: Compiled from NMS Vol 3, 1981, p.176.

Note: 'Blacks' includes Coloureds and Asians.

It is evident from Table A2b that whites declined as a proportion of the skilled labour force from 22 percent or 66 224 in 1981, to 29 889 or 15 percent in 1985, to 7 percent of 35 842 (a bigger sample total) in 1987.

Table A2b
COLOUR DISTRIBUTION OF THE TRAINED WORKFORCE: 1981, 1985, 1987.

	1981		1985		1987	
	Number	%	Number	%	Number	%
BLACK	232 167	78	163 481	85	465 051	93
WHITE	66 224	22	29 889	15	35 842	7
TOTAL:	298 391	100	193 370	100	500 893	100

Source: Compiled from NMS Vol 3, :176; Annual Review of Manpower 1985, :37, 45; CSO Labour Force Survey, unpublished data.

Notes:

- i. Trained Workforce includes professional, skilled and semi-skilled employees.
- ii. Blacks includes Coloureds and Asians.
- iii. The 1985 data is based on a sample survey - the Annual Occupational Survey of Employees

which is a sample of private sector and parastatal employees, hence the lower total than 1980. In the Annual Manpower Review unskilled workers are included in the total giving 436 363. When unskilled workers are included whites form 7% of the total workforce in the Annual Occupational Survey.

The above three sets of figures are all that is available on the skilled or trained labour force in Zimbabwe. The samples of the populations are different, and skilled or trained is not defined in exactly the same way in all three cases. The result is that these statistics provide only the general indication of a trend, rather than an accurate reflection of the skilled labour force in Zimbabwe since 1980.

Tables A3a and A3b show 3 occupational categories by colour for 1981 and 1985 in private and parastatal corporations. Table 4 shows all occupational categories by colour for 1987 for the total labour force. The tables are not directly comparable, but provide an indicator of the increasing number of blacks in all occupations. All three tables show that it is in the administrative and managerial category where whites are in greater numbers. It is in the private sector and the parastatals, in middle, senior and top administration and management where black advancement has been slower. Because tables 3 a and b only reflect the private and parastatal sectors, and table 4 reflects the public and private sectors as a whole (including public administration), it can be estimated the actual proportion of whites in the administrative and managerial category in the private and parastatal sectors will be between 32 percent and 50 percent.

Table A3a
OCCUPATION BY COLOUR: 1981.

OCCUPATIONAL GROUP	BLACK		WHITE	
	Number	%	Number	%
Professional & Technical	15 246	56	11 785	44
Administrative & Managerial	2 912	26	8 172	74
Production & Related	104 335	89	13 388	11

Source: NMS, Vol 3, 1981: 176.

Table A3b
OCCUPATION BY COLOUR: 1985.

OCCUPATIONAL GROUP	BLACK		WHITE	
	Number	%	Number	%
Professional & Technical	54 554	89	7 226	11
Administrative & Managerial	2 683	50	3 023	50
Production & Related	114 745	96	5 028	4

Source: ARM, 1985: 24.

Table A4
OCCUPATION BY COLOUR: 1987.

OCCUPATIONAL GROUP	BLACK		WHITE	
	Number	%	Number	%
Professional & Technical	129 233	92	10 842	8
Administrative & Managerial	19 306	68	6 193	32
Clerical	101 661	90	10 345	10
Sales Workers	83 648	96	3 314	4
Service Workers	231 247	99.4	1 264	.6
Agriculture	2 080 998	99.9	2 878	.1
Production	535 519	98.4	8 639	1.6
Not stated	276 038	99.5	1 401	.5
TOTAL:	3 457 650	98.6	44 879	1.4

Source: CSO, Labour Force Survey 1989, Unpublished data.

The existing official data on the skilled labour force is not comprehensive, comparative or up to date. Official Government statistics are not allowed to publish using colour or 'racial' categories. The result is that it is very difficult to make any analysis or accurate assessment of the skill composition and skill needs in the economy. Considering the very serious impact the lack of access to education, training and employment had on the skill composition of the black population, and thereby the serious implications for the development of the public and private sectors, more official data in this area should be made available by Government.

Adedji, A.

1981 Indigenisation of African Economics. Hutchinson.

Batezat, E.

1981 In: Zimbabwe's Inheritance. / Edited by C. Stoneman. London : McMillan.

Bulawayo Chronicle, The

18/04/1985

Colclough, and Murray, R.

1979 The Immediate Manpower and Training Needs of an Independent Zimbabwe. Commissioned by the Commonwealth Secretariat, June 1979.

Financial Gazette, The

03/04/1987

Herald, The

15/09/1981, 04/07/84, 04/10/1985, 03/10/1985, 15/01/1986, 05/02/1986, 19/04/1989.

Maya, Dr.

1989 Confederation of Zimbabwe Industries Survey. ZIDS Working Paper, May 1989. - Harare : CZI.

Mothobi, B.

1978 Training for Development : An inquiry into the nature and scope of technical training in Rhodesia for African workers in industry, with special reference to apprenticeship training. - Salisbury : A.R.T.C.A.

Mukumbe, J.

1989 (Unpublished paper on economic crisis and administrative incapacity in the Public Administration of Zimbabwe.) Harare : Dept. of Political and Administrative Studies, University of Zimbabwe.

Murphree, M.W. (Ed.), G. Cheater, B.J. Dorsey and B.D. Mothobi.

1975 Education, Race and Employment in Rhodesia. - Salisbury : A.R.T.C.A. in conjunction with The Centre for Inter-Racial Studies, University of Zimbabwe, August 1975.

1979 Africanising Employment in Zimbabwe: The Socio-Political Constraints. - (In: Zimbabwe Journal of Economics, September 1979, p. 118-128).

Raftopolous, B.

1985 Manpower Information Services, Vol. 2, 1982. Zimbabwe, Government Printers.

Riddell, R.

1978 Alternatives to Poverty. - Gwelo : Mambo Press. Published in assoc. with Catholic Institute for International Relations & the Justice & Peace Commission of the RCBC.

Riddell, R.

1980 Education for Employment. From Rhodesia to Zimbabwe Series, No. 9, Mambo Press.
Salisbury : Mambo Press.

Rio Tinto

1977 Annual Report of Empress Nickel Mine.

Sunday Mail, The

24/05/1990.

Stoneman, C.

1978 Zimbabwe - Skilled Labour and Future Needs. CIIR and From Rhodesia to Zimbabwe Series, No. 4, Mambo Press. Gweru : Mambo Press.

Zimbabwe Government -

Ministry of Finance, Economic Planning & Development.

1981 Growth with Equity. Harare : The Ministry.

Ministry of Labour, Manpower Planning and Social Welfare (MLMPSW), Department of Research & Planning (DRP).

1982 Towards a National Development Strategy. Harare : Government Printers.

Ministry of Manpower Planning & Development.

1983 National Manpower Survey, 1981. (NMS) Harare : The Ministry. 3v.

Ministry of Labour, Manpower Planning & Social Welfare, Department of Manpower Research & Planning.

1985 Annual Review of Manpower. (ARM) Harare : Government Printers.

1986 Air Zimbabwe Corporation: Interim report of the Committee of Inquiry into Parastatals. under the chairmanship of *Mr Justice L.G. Smith.* - Harare : The Committee.

1987 National Railways of Zimbabwe: Interim report of the committee of Inquiry into Parastatals. Under the chairmanship of *Mr Justice L.G. Smith.* - Harare : The Committee.

1989 Public Service Review Commission. - Harare : Public Service Commission.

Zvobgo, R.J.

1985 Transforming Education - The Zimbabwean Experience. Harare : College Press.

The Round Table Race Relations Trust together with the Webb Estate for Race Relations Research provided funds for a project to run from 1988 to 1990. The Redressive Action Employment Policy Project was conducted over two years from October 1988 to September 1990. The project set out to examine how the new Zimbabwe Government of 1980 undertook to correct the 'racial' and gender imbalances in the employment structure. This report sets out findings of the project. The opinions and conclusions of the report are not necessarily those of the Round Table Race Relations Endowment Trust, the Webb Estate or the University of Zimbabwe.



This work is licensed under a
Creative Commons
Attribution – NonCommercial - NoDerivs 3.0 License.

To view a copy of the license please see:
<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/3.0/>

This is a download from the BLDS Digital Library on OpenDocs
<http://opendocs.ids.ac.uk/opendocs/>