

Cost-effectiveness in humanitarian work: Integration of displaced persons into host community services

Magdalena Mikulak, PhD
September 2018

Question

What cost effectiveness evidence is there of integration of displaced persons into host community services in humanitarian work, and what does the evidence tell us?

Contents

1. Summary of findings
2. Methodology
3. Annotated bibliography

The K4D helpdesk service provides brief summaries of current research, evidence, and lessons learned. Helpdesk reports are not rigorous or systematic reviews; they are intended to provide an introduction to the most important evidence related to a research question. They draw on a rapid desk-based review of published literature and consultation with subject specialists.

Helpdesk reports are commissioned by the UK Department for International Development and other Government departments, but the views and opinions expressed do not necessarily reflect those of DFID, the UK Government, K4D or any other contributing organisation. For further information, please contact helpdesk@k4d.info.

1. Summary of findings

With unprecedented numbers of displaced persons around the world, the humanitarian system is facing huge financial pressures. The international community provides support (about US\$22 billion in 2015) mainly through humanitarian programs, but the World Bank describes the current model as critically flawed (WBG 2017, p. 12) because forcibly displaced persons have to be sustained by the international community at a high cost in large part because they are prevented from working and integrating into host communities. To overcome this, the World Bank recommends that development actors should help work toward solutions that can be more cost-effective and sustainable (WBG, 2017).

The existing literature makes a strong case for the integration of displaced persons into host community services and labour markets, making displacement a development issue as well as a humanitarian issue (WBG, 2017; UNCHR, 2018). There is evidence that joint humanitarian and development programmes can improve displaced persons and host communities' access to services and livelihoods (Centre on International Cooperation, 2015); such joint responses have proven effective in a range of contexts, including Lebanon, Colombia, Eastern Sudan, Sudan, Jordan and China (ibid.). There is also an understanding that policies that encourage the inclusion of displaced persons in the formal economy are likely to yield benefits in the form of increased productivity and improved fiscal revenue (ibid.).

At the same time the picture of case specific and empirical evidence and evaluation in the integration sphere is 'generally bleak' (Migration Policy Institute Europe, 2018, p. 8). There is very little high-quality evaluation to indicate which types of interventions work best, 'very few evaluations are robust enough to prove that any differences in integration outcomes were caused by the intervention' (pp. 1, 7) and in particular cost-efficiency analyses are largely absent. Still, the evidence that is available generally points towards moving away from international humanitarian aid and care and maintenance responses towards a more holistic response that foster integration and build resilience.

The reviewed literature acknowledges that integration puts strain on local communities, as many encounter problems meeting the demand for services that comes with the increase in population. Affordable housing, education, and availability of income-generating opportunities can be considered the primary drivers of tension (ORSAM, 2015; REACH, 2014). Consequently, it is agreed that for integration programmes to be effective and foster social cohesion, they must also benefit host communities. Most of the world's displaced persons are hosted in low- and middle-income countries, so hosts and displaced persons share vulnerabilities and their economic and social well-being is intertwined (ODI, 2015). This is particularly relevant to cities as many of those displaced to urban areas 'live alongside other urban poor in slums/informal settlements where resources and services are already overstretched, social relations fragile and communal solidarity lacking' (Cities Alliance, 2011). A good example of a response that benefits both host community and the displaced population is the Itang integrated water infrastructure system in the Gambella region in Ethiopia (UNCHR, 2017), or the Eastleigh Community Wellness Centre (ECWC) in Kenya with a monthly attendance of close to 2500 patients, half of whom are migrants (WHO African Region, 2018).

The literature reviewed further demonstrates that integrating support for refugees into mainstream government service provision, where it exists, can be more cost effective and sustainable than setting up large-scale camps and setting up parallel humanitarian service delivery channels (WBG, 2015). An example of successful integration of displaced persons into

existing services where the local services were in place was a case of child protection services in Tanzania, where in response to the influx of refugees from Burundi in 2015-2017 the Department of Social Welfare deployed 100 Social Welfare Officers to provide case management services to refugee children in need of individualized child protection services. This was possible because Tanzania, unlike other countries in the region, had a cadre of trained social welfare officers to draw on (UNHCR & UNICEF, 2018).

Integration of displaced persons into host community services is seen as a more sustainable and cost-efficient approach than camps (UNHCR, 2014). For the forcibly displaced in camps, services provided by agencies may be better to what is available locally and moving to country systems may result in a net loss of welfare (WBG, 2017). However, the overwhelming majority of refugees and IDPs do not have access to such services and their welfare depends on the strengthening of host community systems. Therefore, in the medium term, scaling up such systems and including forcibly displaced persons into them is viewed as the most cost-effective and equitable option; the transition needs to be managed carefully, in particular in those poor and remote regions where local systems are weak (ibid.).

Systemic obstacles exist whereby weak incentives for governments and communities to integrate displaced people into the economy and services, combined with weak incentives for development and humanitarian actors to join up their efforts, results in inadequate, costly and unsustainable programs (Centre on International Cooperation, 2015). The political context needs to be given consideration alongside funding and local cooperation, as at times even successful responses that benefit both host and displaced communities can be resisted if the political will to integrate displaced persons is not there. This was the case for the Sudan UNDP/UNHCR Transitional Solutions Initiative (TSI) Joint Programme in 2012-2014, for example, which suffered from difficult cooperation with line ministries about service delivery and was temporarily suspended by the government over concerns about integration, illustrating the importance of a political process addressing all actors' incentives and concerns (Centre on International Cooperation, 2015, p. 22).

Access to formal employment opportunities has been seen as particularly crucial for improving outcomes for displaced persons, as an opportunity to be employed, including self-employed and possibly even creating livelihoods for others, is a sign of economic integration (Mixed Migration Centre, 2017). Recently Turkey and Jordan have tried to increase the number of Syrian refugees engaged in regular employment by simplifying the processes through which refugees can seek formal employment. However, permits tie an employee to one employer for a year (except in the agricultural sector) and most refugees are still only able to access informal work, which usually offers and most of the time informality of work offers limited opportunities for integration (ibid.). Positive responses that have proven cost-effective have been found in Georgia, where provision of agricultural machinery and training to mixed IDP and non-IDP groups enabled them to increase their incomes and number of hectares farmed; the programme also fostered social cohesion (CARE, 2012). A key element in improving the impact of skills training initiatives is to link them to pathways to employment such as career guidance, job referrals, on-the-job training and internship schemes (UNHCR, 2018).

Finally, the literature reviewed presents a good range of examples of effective integration of displaced persons into education and health systems (UNHCR, 2017; Centre on International Cooperation, 2015; UNICEF, 2018; UNHCR, 2018). With respect to cost efficiency, the case of Lebanon stands out as it has been noted that integration of refugee health care within the national health system was an important factor for the resilience of the system. It reduced

administrative and set up costs and shifted the burden to several geographic areas in Lebanon and to several different players in the Lebanese health system (Journal of Global Health, 2016).

2. Methodology

This literature review is a result of 5 days of desk research into the available evidence about whether of integration of displaced persons into host community services and labour markets is value for money with respect to improving humanitarian outcomes and reducing the cost of the response. The ALNAP Humanitarian Evaluation, Learning and Performance (HELP) database was used as the primary source for material to review. The review aims to examine efficiency and effectiveness of integration of displaced persons into host community services and labour markets, and materials that discuss either or both of these aspects have been included. The 'value for money' criterion is here understood as bringing the two aspects together.

The ALNAP database was searched with the keyword 'cost effectiveness' and tags 'refugees / IDPs / host communities / local capacity', and the search returned 1672, largely irrelevant results. Further searching was conducted narrowed by 'country' with 18 countries (hosting large populations of displaced persons) selected. This search returned 804 results; 150 sorted by relevance were examined; only 15 were deemed relevant to include within the sample. Further searches were conducted within Google Scholar using the keywords 'cost effectiveness of integration' and 'integration of refugees into services', 'integration of refugees into labour market'. These searches brought a range of largely irrelevant results (for each search the first 7 pages sorted by relevance were analysed). This produced 1 additional document that was added to the sample after manual review with the criterion for inclusion being its focus on cost effectiveness and efficiency.

Many of the available sources on integration of displaced persons lack any details on cost-efficiency and/or cost-effectiveness of the intervention they discuss, pointing to the overall difficulty of tracing the 'humanitarian dollar.' The difficulty in finding literature on cost-efficiency and/or cost-effectiveness points also to the challenge of measuring these aspects in relation to integration of displaced persons and to a lack of robust methodological tools for the same. Due to the scarcity of relevant documents, more space has been given to account for the evidence of effectiveness and/or efficiency when such was identified.

3. Annotated bibliography

Title	Link	Date	Focus	Document	Organisation	Methodology	Cost-effectiveness and cost efficiency evidence
Turkey's Response to the Syrian Refugee Crisis and the Road Ahead	https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/bitstream/handle/10986/23548/Turkey0s0response0an%20d0the0road0ahead.pdf?sequence=1	December 2015	Situation of refugees in a host community	Policy brief	World Bank Group	Desk review	<p>The Government of Turkey (GoT) has taken a unique <i>non-camp approach</i>. Only 12% of the total number of Syrians under Temporary Protection (SuTPs) are living in tents and temporary shelters; the rest are settled in urban areas, where they seek their own accommodation and work opportunities.</p> <p>Integrating support for refugees into mainstream government service provision can be more cost effective and sustainable than setting up large-scale camps and setting up parallel humanitarian service delivery channels.</p> <p>Syrians arriving with assets have invested in Turkey. Syrians have also started up (mainly unregistered) microenterprises, particularly cafes and restaurants. Further gains come from the expansion of local markets in areas with high SuTP concentration; receipt of remittances from within Syria during the early years of the conflict; and the benefits of government SuTP expenditures for local suppliers and SuTPs' labor contribution.</p> <p>Integrating SuTPs also creates challenges for both SuTPs and hosting communities, which include socioeconomic pressures such as deficits in housing and service delivery, joblessness, and the potential for social tensions. The strains of hosting SuTPs are felt especially in cities in the southeast of Turkey. Tensions from Turkish communities relate to competition over jobs, rising rent prices, strains on municipal services and infrastructure, and cultural differences with SuTPs.</p>

<p>A needed evidence revolution: Using cost-benefit analysis to improve refugee integration</p>	<p>https://www.alnap.org/system/files/content/resource/files/main/RefugeeIntegrationCostBenefitAnalysis_Final.pdf</p>	<p>July 2018</p>	<p>Refugees and labour market integration</p>	<p>Paper</p>	<p>Migration Policy Institute Europe</p>	<p>Desk review, analysis of methods</p>	<p>Refugees are selected on the basis of their vulnerability rather than their skills, so they are less likely to fit easily into local employment opportunities.</p> <p>Most labour-market integration programmes in Europe have been evaluated only through qualitative, survey measures.</p> <p>Very few evaluations are robust enough to prove that any differences in integration outcomes were caused by the intervention.</p> <p>Refugees are particularly vulnerable population and may face risks that are not fully addressed by providing additional resources. One such risk is long-term unemployment. There is relatively strong evidence that unemployment persists.</p> <p>It is important to understand this phenomenon to model the value of getting beneficiaries into employment early. Getting into employment early will reduce the incidence of unemployment over the beneficiary's entire career. Because many refugees are also building fundamental skills when they arrive, they are different from other unemployed adults. The process of building up skills could account for the slow transition rate into employment. It is also possible that this could be avoided with programmes designed to make job searches more effective early in the job seeking process.</p>
<p>Lebanon Crisis Response Plan 2017: Annual Report</p>	<p>https://www.alnap.org/system/files/content/resource/files/main/64657.pdf</p>	<p>2018</p>	<p>Programme/project review</p>	<p>Report</p>	<p>UNHCR</p>	<p>Desk review of project data and documents</p>	<p>Under the leadership of the Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MEHE), the Education sector partners have taken forward the emergency response strategy for the Syrian crisis through the five-year "RACE II" plan. Structured over three outcome areas – Improving Access, Quality, and Systems of Education – the first year of the RACE II resulted in many successes.</p> <p>School enrolment figures from the Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MEHE) indicate that around</p>

						<p>430,000 students enrolled in formal public education across the country for the 2017/2018 school year, representing a 9% increase in compared to 2016 (14% increase for non-Lebanese children). For the first time, the 2017/2018 school year has more non-Lebanese than Lebanese students in those schools. 2017 data align with this trend, showing a 37% improvement in the proportion of Syrian children aged 6-14 enrolled in schools, from 52% in 2016 to 70% in 2017. The Education sector was the best-funded LCRP sectors in 2017, receiving 70 %of its appeal. Partners have provided a range of services and assistance in support of the back-to school campaign, out-of-school children, school rehabilitation, and covering both formal and nonformal education programmes.</p> <p>It appears that transportation costs are a major barrier for the enrolment of registered Syrian children in public schools. 11% of displaced Syrian families have withdrawn their children from school as a livelihood coping strategy in 2017, down from 14% a year before.</p> <p>2017 data indicates that 56% of displaced Syrian men aged 15-64 worked (in the past 30 days) in 2017. In 2016, 70% of the 18-65 aged group reported working. The employment rate of displaced Syrian women remains very low at 7.6% in 2017, up from 7% in 2016.</p> <p>Providing short-term opportunities through labour-intensive projects remains a key pillar of the sector strategy to provide access to income, but only 6,529 individuals (out of 37,000 targeted) were enrolled in public works projects in 2017.</p> <p>Assistance is focusing on smaller-scale interventions, including technical assistance, training, capacity development, studies and assessments, and provision of equipment. Partners supported 2,738 businesses in 2017, a four-fold increase compared to 2016, and a six-fold increase from 2015. As small businesses are the main job creators in the Lebanese labour market, these interventions did lead to creating or maintaining 2,305 jobs, but there is limited evidence that they have had an</p>
--	--	--	--	--	--	--

							<p>impact on overall, sustained economic growth yet.</p> <p>On the supply side of the labour market, efforts have continued to expand significantly in 2017, with more than 35,000 Lebanese, Syrians and Palestine refugees having completed market-based skills training, nearly a two-fold increase from 2016. Employability was further strengthened, with all MoA technical schools supported and around 3,800 youth enrolled in both short- and long-term courses to receive trainings on agriculture, employability skills, and basic literacy and numeracy. In 2018, a key priority is to match skills training and workforce employability with a robust job creation strategy and scaled-up investments in the demand-side of the labour market.</p> <p>The sharp increase of the number of beneficiaries of short-term skills training has been a key feature of the work of the sector in 2017. However, only 13% of the people trained eventually find a job or generate income. Therefore, the vast majority of beneficiaries of skills training do not see an immediate improvement in their livelihoods.</p> <p>Partners are increasingly making sure that skills training programmes are part of a 'package' of services to improve employability of beneficiaries. This is a positive trend that should be built upon in 2018. A key element in improving the impact of skills training programmes is to link them to pathways to employment such as career guidance, job referrals, on-the-job training and internship schemes.</p>
<p>Decent Work for Whom? Economic Integration of Refugees and Other Foreign Nationals in the Middle East</p>	<p>https://www.alnap.org/system/files/content/resource/files/main/Briefing-paper_-Decent-work-for-whom.pdf</p>	<p>July 2017</p>	<p>Economic integration of refugees</p>	<p>Briefing paper</p>	<p>Mixed Migration Centre</p>	<p>Desk review</p>	<p>The economic aspect of integration is key. It pertains to the access refugees and migrants have to the labour market and financial services.</p> <p>Access to formalised employment is crucial. Beyond that social security and decent and just labour condition are also very important.</p> <p>Work experience and qualifications from foreign institutions tend to be undervalued/unrecognised; this is where access to vocational and professional training becomes relevant, as these can offer a refugee a</p>

							<p>recognised qualification in the host country, enhance their skillset and foster upward mobility.</p> <p>Opportunity to be self-employed, possibly also creating livelihoods, is a sign of economic integration.</p> <p>Refugees should be enabled be should establish sustainable livelihoods and a standard of living of comparable to the host community, to participate in in the social life of the host country and attain a wide range of rights in the host state. As host governments, have not always welcome local integration, integration without direct, or official, or international assistance has been taking place in many contexts.</p> <p>Turkey and Jordan have tried to increase the number of Syrians engaged in regular employment. Both countries have simplified the processes through which refugees can seek formal employment, however the existing permits tie an employee to one employer for a year (except in the agricultural sector).</p> <p>Most refugees are only able to access informal work; most of the time informality of work translates into less opportunities integration.</p>
<p>No Lost Generation: Supporting the School Participation of Displaced Syrian Children in Lebanon</p>	<p>https://www.alnap.org/system/files/content/resource/files/main/WP_2018_06.pdf</p>	<p>June 2018</p>	<p>Impact of cash transfer on refugee children school participation</p>	<p>Report</p>	<p>UNICEF</p>	<p>Longitudinal geographical regression discontinuity design</p>	<p>Evaluated programme provided cash to children who are enrolled in the afternoon shift of a public primary school. It was designed to cover the cost of commuting to school and to compensate households for income forgone if children attend school instead of working.</p> <p>There were limited of effects on school enrolment, but substantive impacts on school attendance among enrolled children. School enrolment among Syrian children rose rapidly across all of Lebanon's governorates during the period of the evaluation, resulting in supply side capacity constraints that appear to have dampened positive impacts on enrolment.</p> <p>Positive impact on schooling outcomes among children</p>

							<p>who enrolled was found.</p> <p>In settings of massive displacement such as Lebanon, supply-side constraints may hamper the delivery of goods and services to populations in need in many different sectors, including not only education, but also health, hygiene, nutrition, and so on. As a result, demand-side interventions may not fully achieve desired effects unless implemented in coordination with supply-side interventions.</p>
<p>Evaluating the Effect of the Syrian Refugee Crisis on Stability and Resilience in Jordanian Host Communities: Preliminary Impact Assessment</p>	<p>https://www.alnap.org/system/files/content/resource/files/main/reach-fco-syrian-refugees-in-host-communities-preliminary-impact-assessment.pdf</p>	<p>2014</p>	<p>Impact of refugees on host community</p>	<p>Report</p>	<p>REACH</p>	<p>Desk review, key informant interviews, focus group discussions and governorate level workshops with local government representatives and key stakeholders</p>	<p>The role of affordable housing, education, and income-generating opportunities can be considered as the primary drivers of tension on community level in host communities of northern Jordan.</p> <p>In 47% of communities with stated tension, respondents indicated that this was due to lack of affordable housing.</p> <p>Generally, housing has become a core issue in Jordan as a result of significant inflation in rental prices with a corresponding reduction in availability.</p> <p>In 43% of communities with overtly acknowledged tension, this was attributed to challenges in education. Issues surrounding education included Syrian children not being able to attend school due to altercations with Jordanian children, in addition to shortened lesson times to accommodate the influx of Syrian children into the school. Jordanian families are concerned over decreased quality of education for their children as a result of shortened class times and overcrowded classrooms.</p> <p>In 28 of the 73 communities (38%) with reported tension, income-generating opportunities was cited by key informants as a main source of tension.</p> <p>From a Jordanian perspective, the belief is that Syrians are willing to accept employment below the pre-crisis market rate and are therefore selected in favour of</p>

							<p>Jordanians by employers.</p> <p>Syrians feel that they do not have a choice and must accept low wages, given that they are in need of cash and do not receive adequate support from the humanitarian community. As a result, many feel exploited by Jordanians that try to provide the lowest wage possible. The risk for exploitation of Syrians in the workplace is further complicated due to their illegal work status and accompanying lack of legal protection mechanisms.</p>
<p>Effects of the Syrian Refugees on Turkey</p>	<p>https://www.alnapp.org/system/files/content/resources/files/main/201518-rapor195ing.pdf</p>	<p>Jan 2015</p>	<p>Impact of refugees on host community</p>	<p>Report</p>	<p>ORSAM</p>	<p>Not disclosed</p>	<p>Syrian refugees living in the camps have no difficulty in accessing basic services such as health and education. If registered, refugees in the camps can also have free health services in public hospitals. Public hospitals around the border cities serve the refugees, which may take up around 30% to 40 % of their capacities.</p> <p>Because of the high number of patients, hospitals are suffering from insufficient capacity in terms of the operational conditions and personnel.</p> <p>Only the refugees who enter with a passport or have a residence permit can attend government schools. However, there is a language challenge for new students from Syria who attend public schools. Other than public schools that are supported by the initiatives of Turkish NGOs and various Syrians, other limited education services are provided. Overall these initiatives are only a beginning. Nevertheless, only about 10% of the Syrians living in Turkish cities can access formal education.</p> <p>It is therefore clear that there is not much immediate pressure on the educational sector. But, a lack of education might cause a risk in terms of social issues in the long term.</p> <p>With the rapid rush of huge number of Syrians, several cities, such as Kilis whose population doubled in a year, have encountered problems meeting the demand for</p>

							services.
Stabilization and Integration of IDPs into Mainstream Georgian Society (SIIMS)	http://www.care-caucasus.org.ge/uploads_script/newspapers/files/SIIMS_Final_Evaluation-Final.pdf	2012	Evaluation of IDPs' integration project	Evaluation report	CARE	Desk review, quantitative analysis of monitoring data, quantitative assessment tools, quantitative surveys of project participants, qualitative data including focus group discussions, structured interviews of key informants and project participants, site visits of project activities	<p>The agricultural machinery component of the income generation program was a scheme to provide equipment to the IDP settlements and surrounding communities. Community members formed into small groups of 5-7 members, which were required to include both IDPs and non- IDPs. The groups were given training in writing a business plan and managing finances, including taxes; they were regularly visited by project staff and given assistance. The monitoring data shows that the groups were able to make a net profit while maintaining the machinery and paying salaries to members of the group. Costs are reasonable and it appears that the groups are doing a good job of accounting for their income and costs. Survey results show that both IDP and local farmers considerably increased the number of hectares they farmed.</p> <p>IDP farmers increased their income by 78% while the local farmers increased their income by 12%. Local farmer focus group discussion participants confirmed that the agricultural machinery groups have assisted their closer relationship with IDPs. Stakeholders often mentioned the agricultural machinery program as having the most significant impact on the project area communities. While the main objective of the project is to raise incomes for IDP and local farmers, the fact that all of the groups were able to make a net profit and to raise incomes for those in the group through paying salaries to them has very positive implications for the groups' sustainability. Local farmer FGD participants confirmed that the agricultural machinery groups have assisted their closer relationship with IDPs.</p> <p>The women entrepreneurs component assisted women to create their own businesses through training and the provision of grants. The objectives of the project were to enhance livelihoods, increase skills, create models of successful business start-ups, empower IDP women and increase integration with the local community. The</p>

						<p>program gave grants to 86 IDP women to initiate 83 small businesses. Nearly all (99%) of these became operational, with 95% still operating at the end of the project period. Moreover, 89% of the businesses became profitable; and nearly half would be profitable even if they were required to pay back the initial grant amount. The profitability of the businesses and the availability of data on income and expenses provide evidence of the effectiveness of the trainings.</p> <p>34 of the businesses also employed people, for a total of 47 employees overall. Survey data shows that the women's household incomes increased substantially after joining the program, and the increase was almost entirely due to the business enterprise.</p> <p>FGD revealed that the new businesses were seen to have a positive impact on the communities where they are located.</p> <p>The 'grants for jobs' scheme, invited businesses in the local communities to submit proposals for grants for expansion, with the condition that new jobs would be created for IDPs. By the end of the project period, 15 businesses had received grants of which 13 were still viable. Over the course of the project 69 IDPs were employed; 56 of these were still employed by the end of the project.</p> <p>The grants for job scheme appeared to be the least cost efficient of the three income generation projects when comparing the amount of the grants with the number of people benefitting.</p> <p>The cost effectiveness of program with regard to its economic efficiency also raises questions about its sustainability. However, it can be said that while the start-up costs were high, in the short-run the program provided much needed immediate employment opportunities, and in the long run to continued employment for some number of IDPs. The program has another important advantage in that it was of direct</p>
--	--	--	--	--	--	---

							benefit to non-IDPs in the community.
Forcibly Displaced: Toward a Development Approach Supporting Refugees, the Internally Displaced, and Their Hosts	https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/bitstream/handle/10986/25016/9781464809385.pdf	2017	Forced displacement as a development challenge	Report	World Bank Group	Systemic desk review	<p>With financing scarce, cost-effectiveness is key. The fundamental issue for governments and international partners alike is to determine the affordability of forced displacement programs and their value for money. The quality of support for refugees, IDPs, and host communities is largely a function of available resources and of the policy context. But for a given amount of financing, outcomes also depend on the choice of activities to be supported and on how they are implemented.</p> <p>Development actors should focus on interventions that can be sustainable. Most of them aim to finance investment rather than consumption: to simplify, the implementation of a development project (to fund an investment or support policy reform) is expected to eventually reduce the requirements for external assistance. Support to refugees, IDPs, and host communities should aim to gradually reduce needs by making durable improvements in their situations, as part of a broader effort to move toward sustainable solutions.</p> <p>For the forcibly displaced who are in camps, services provided by humanitarian agencies may be superior to what is available locally, in terms of both accessibility and quality: shifting to country systems may result in a net loss of welfare. But the overwhelming majority of refugees and IDPs do not have access to such services and their welfare depends on the strengthening of country systems. In the medium-term, scaling up such systems and including forcibly displaced persons (both refugees and IDPs) into them is likely to be the most cost-effective and equitable option, but the transition needs to be managed carefully, especially in those poor and remote regions where national systems are very weak.</p>

<p>UNHCR Policy on alternatives to camps</p>	<p>http://www.unhcr.org/5422b8f09.%20html</p>	<p>2014</p>	<p>Alternatives to camps</p>	<p>Policy</p>	<p>UNHCR</p>	<p>n/a</p>	<p>Refugees can better contribute to the communities where they are living when they are supported in achieving self-reliance in a way that is adapted to local conditions and markets. In many situations, the presence of refugees has stimulated local economies and development. Moreover, community-based protection activities and livelihoods and education programmes that also involve local people can promote social cohesion, reduce xenophobic attitudes and create a better protection environment. Where people work, study and play together, they are better equipped to resolve differences and live peacefully.</p> <p>When setting up a refugee camp, UNHCR, host governments and partners also make significant investments in infrastructure and systems for the delivery of basic services. The running costs for maintaining and operating these dedicated facilities and systems are also considerable and often must be sustained for many years or even decades. These investments are typically lost when refugees go home, particularly where camps are located in isolated areas far from local communities, so that facilities cannot be handed over to them.</p> <p>Building upon and seeking synergies with national development planning, by contributing to local infrastructure and bringing refugees within national structures, such as for education and healthcare, can be a more sustainable and efficient approach. This avoids the duplication and inefficiencies arising from the creation of dedicated, parallel structures to serve refugees, while also have greater lasting positive impact for host communities. UNHCR will always retain its accountability for ensuring that the needs of refugees are met, but camps are not the only, or often, the best mechanism for the delivery of services.</p>
<p>Addressing Protracted</p>	<p>https://cic.nyu.edu/sites/default/fil</p>	<p>Dec</p>	<p>Protracted</p>	<p>Think piece</p>	<p>OCHA, UNDP, UNHCR,</p>	<p>Systemic review</p>	<p>Low incentives for governments and communities to integrate displaced people into the economy and</p>

<p>Displacement: A Framework for Development</p> <p>Humanitarian Cooperation</p> <p>A think piece drawing on collaboration between OCHA, UNDP, UNHCR, UNICEF, WFP, and the World Bank, supported by the Center on International Cooperation</p>	<p>es/addressing_protracted_displacement_a_think_piece_dec_2015.pdf</p>	<p>2015</p>	<p>displacement</p>		<p>UNICEF, WFP and the World Bank – supported by CENTER ON INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION</p>	<p>services combined with low incentives for development and humanitarian actors to jointly reduce humanitarian and host communities' needs result in inadequate, costly and unsustainable programs.</p> <p>When refugees and IDPs do not have formal livelihoods opportunities and employment rights, they are more likely to become dependent on humanitarian aid and cannot contribute to economic growth, social services and public sector revenues;</p> <p>Refugees and IDPs in urban areas often scrape by on a living in the informal economy. Policies that encourage the inclusion of refugees in the formal economy are more likely to yield benefits in the form of increased productivity and improved fiscal revenue.</p> <p>Thus the policy choices taken mean that the costs to host communities are usually high as pressure grows on public services, housing and land and food, yet the needs of host communities are also frequently neglected;</p> <p>There is also evidence that joint humanitarian and development plans and programmes can improve IDP, refugee and host communities' access to services and livelihoods. For example: In Colombia, the Transitional Solutions Initiative (2012- 2016) supports IDPs and host communities to move from dependency to self-reliance. It focuses on local urban integration, and rural relocation and return processes. Through the multi-year programme, communities have exceeded or are on track to meet expectations: 200% of target communities (host and displaced) initiated community land legalization processes, 125% of target communities developed housing programmes, and 40% of communities improved access to water and sanitation. New community organizations have emerged around key local development issues, and host and displaced communities benefit from improving local organization and access to services and budgets aligned to local</p>
--	---	-------------	---------------------	--	--	--

							<p>priorities</p> <p>In Eastern Sudan, UNDP and UNHCR found that joint approaches in the first year of the joint “Transitional Solutions Initiative” (2012-2014) appeared to have contributed positively to social and economic outcomes for refugees and host communities. For example, through a survey of beneficiaries, the programme reported a 30% increase in income levels in the first year, a 60% employment rate of refugees and host community members following VOTECH training, crop yields improved by at least 50% following watershed assistance for host community and refugee farmers, and a record number of host community and refugees had access to local healthcare and education services</p> <p>UNICEF Lebanon has adopted a three pillar approach to programmes which straddles humanitarian and development: a) assistance for basic humanitarian needs, b) access to quality basic services, and c) strengthening government systems. In 2014 alone, USD 99 million of programme funds contributed to the Lebanese people, national institutions and economy through improvement of public service infrastructure, training of public service providers, procurement of local supplies and services, and partners’ local staff salaries and operational costs. Two examples of this are the Ministry of Social Affairs (MOSA) National Plan, which brought together resources and partners in direct support to the SDC network (providing a range of social public services to the poorest children and families); and the RACE initiative, which had the primary objective of providing access to learning for over 400,000 annually, as part of a package that included access to WASH, health and child protection services</p> <p>In Jordan, an initial intervention of psycho-social support to Syrian refugee children has now been expanded into a comprehensive package of interventions for Syrian and Iraqi refugee children as well as vulnerable Jordanian children. The Makani (My Space) initiative makes use of the over 180 child friendly spaces</p>
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	---

						<p>nationwide, with a package including alternative education for out of school children (also home-based and IT-supported), life-skills development (for all 10-24 years old), psychosocial support, as well as outreach activities and child rights monitoring by local Child Protection Committees. Support will be expanded in 2015 to over 200 sites, reaching about 200,000 children</p> <p>In the Middle East and North Africa (MENA) region and Turkey, investment in local health and education services has been extended by the UN to assist host communities and Syrian refugees. Meeting refugee needs also requires investing extra resources to help countries to resolve existing long-term development challenges, thus additional joint development humanitarian finances have been provided to renovate schools in Jordan and Turkey, to train additional primary care health workers in Iraq and to extend polio vaccinations to host communities across affected countries. In Turkey, the UN invested in a new olive oil facility in order to create local jobs in one of the areas most affected by a refugee influx</p> <p>In the wake of the Sichuan earthquake in China in 2008, UNICEF was permitted for the first time by the government to establish Child Friendly Spaces (CFS) in emergency areas. The government has now adopted the model, and 90% of communities will have CFS. Similarly, for the first time after the earthquake, the government allowed the use of micronutrient sprinkles for children affected by anaemia and malnutrition. Levels of anaemia and malnutrition were greatly improved and UNICEF is now routinely distributing them to 4-6 year olds.</p> <p>Sudan UNDP/UNHCR Transitional Solutions Initiative (TSI) Joint Programme, Phase I (2012-2014): The TSI Sudan programme works with relevant Sudanese ministries to target camp-based refugees and host populations to increase self-reliance. It focuses on a broad range of services- and livelihoods-related objectives: generating income opportunities through</p>
--	--	--	--	--	--	--

							<p>VOTECH training, increasing education enrolment and attendance, improving access to healthcare facilities, potable water, improved sanitation, providing protection services and legal support, diversifying and improving rural livelihoods, improving access to microfinance, improving environmental and energy conservation and management, and women's empowerment. In support of these areas, it has an objective to develop local governmental capacity. The programme has targets for refugee and host populations. The programme reported a number of successful outputs.</p> <p>However, first the programme was suspended in the second year for a number of months by the government owing to concerns about the programme's intention to integrate refugees. A second related challenge has been cooperation with line Ministries to commit to taking over basic service delivery. A third related challenge was that the programme also became seriously underfunded, which severely impacted upon its feasibility once it was restarted. All these challenges suggest that viable models must be framed politically from the outset, addressing all actors' incentives and concerns through a compact approach, and that sufficient multi-year funding must be made available.</p>
<p>Working Towards Inclusion: Refugees within the National Systems of Ethiopia</p>	<p>http://www.unhcr.org/uk/protection/integration/5a55ed8c4/working-towards-inclusion-refugees-national-systems-ethiopia.html</p>	2017	Refugee integration	Report	UNHCR	<p>Qualitative research carried out with government officials, UN agencies, and NGO partners</p>	<p>In Ethiopia, the central idea is to ensure more cost effective investments in national systems that will also benefit host communities through the expansion of quality services.</p> <p>The report documents existing collaboration between the Administration for Refugee and Returnee Affairs (ARRA), the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) and line Ministries, both at the Federal and Regional Level.</p> <p>In the education sector, the collaboration between the Federal Ministry of Education, the Regional Bureaus of Education, UNHCR and ARRA has resulted in the adoption of the national curriculum in all schools</p>

						<p>operating in refugee camps and in the establishment of the Education Management Information System.</p> <p>The Ethiopian Parliament approved a revised Proclamation of the Federal Vital Events Registration Agency (FVERA) to allow refugees to be included in the national system. Such a development is significant as there are an estimated 70,000 refugee children in Ethiopia without birth certificates.</p> <p>Inclusion in national systems can benefit host communities as well (for example the Itang integrated water infrastructure system in Gambella region).</p> <p>Refugees have access to the national health care system at the same costs as Ethiopians. Primary health care facilities in refugee camps are also accessible for host community members at no costs. In 2016, altogether 868,746 consultations were provided, of which 12.6% (109,895 consultations) were for host community members.</p> <p>Recognizing the fact that refugees access the national health system for more advanced treatment at secondary and tertiary healthcare facilities, UNHCR has over the last ten years donated medical equipment to regional hospitals. These donations have helped to enhance service availability and improve the quality of care provided to both nationals and refugees alike.</p> <p>Since December 2016, refugees are included in national HIV prevention catch-up campaign organized across the 9 regional states and two city administrations by the Federal HIV/AIDS Prevention and Control Office together with the Federal Ministry of Health. By the end of May 2017, the collaboration between ARRA, UNHCR and the line Ministries resulted in 126,823 tests conducted in refugee camps across the country and 374 HIV positive cases (0.3%) were newly identified and linked to ART services.</p> <p>UNHCR's operation in Ethiopia has been providing</p>
--	--	--	--	--	--	---

						<p>education for refugee children since the late 1980s but the rollout of UNHCR Global Education Strategy in 2012 and the National Refugee Education Strategy 2015-2018 has resulted in a more structured approach towards supporting refugee inclusion in national education systems.</p> <p>An estimated 179,022 refugees are enrolled in general education in the 2016/2017 school year, including 75,359 female students. The overall enrolment of refugee children in school is at a rate of 52%; the enrolment rate stands at 45% of girls and 58% of boys. In total, there are 80 Early Childhood Care and Education (ECCE) establishments, 56 primary and 18 secondary schools in and around 26 refugee camps catering to the learning needs of students.</p> <p>UNHCR and ARRA worked with the Judiciary of the Somali Regional State to establish the extension of mobile hearings of the district court to Dollo Ado refugee camps in June 2014 involving the Ministry of Justice, Judiciary and Police Commission.¹¹⁰ The mobile court has resolved 23 child marriages cases since June 2014 and also acted as a deterrent for the practice in the refugee community of Dollo Ado.</p> <p>The positive experience of the mobile court sessions of the district court in Dollo Ado has prompted UNHCR's operation in Gambella region to develop a similar access to justice initiative in response to local conflict in and around refugee communities in 2015 and 2016.</p> <p>While refugees will continue to use traditional justice mechanisms for civil cases (dowry, adultery, divorce), the formal justice will deal with criminal cases, through the use of mobile courts. Such experiences highlight the need for humanitarian and development actors to support longer-term initiatives that facilitate access to national judicial services rather than creating parallel, informal response mechanisms within the camp.</p> <p>The inclusion of refugees within the national systems in</p>
--	--	--	--	--	--	---

							Ethiopia has faced two critical challenges. Firstly, refugees have remained largely in camps in the peripheral and poorest regions of the country where public investment in development has been limited. Secondly, service delivery has remained largely externally financed through the provision of humanitarian aid.
Bridging the Humanitarian-Development Divide for Refugee Children in Eastern Africa and the Great Lakes Region Mapping existing national child protection practice	http://www.refworld.org/pdfid/5b0ea89c4.pdf	2018	Child protection	Report	UNHCR & UNICEF	Desk review	<p>While this study argues for the inclusion of refugees in national child protection systems and services in host countries, it also acknowledges some of the persisting dilemmas regarding the feasibility of inclusion of refugee children in over-stretched and under-resourced national child protection systems. At times, there is disparity between quality and capacity of national child protection services and quality and capacity of services provided by relatively better-resourced international organizations when dealing with highly vulnerable children in emergency situations. This often due to the imbalance between international humanitarian funding and national resources available for the social welfare sector.</p> <p>It is possible to include refugee children in national child protection policies. In the Kenyan example, the child protection entry point was the national guidelines on alternative care, which includes a specific chapter on refugee children. In the case of Rwanda humanitarian response was used as an entry point to achieve broader government engagement on refugee child protection.</p> <p>Both examples demonstrate that UNICEF is in a unique position to bridge the humanitarian and development divide on child protection by working towards inclusion of refugee child protection into 'mainstream' national child protection frameworks. The Guidelines for the Alternative Family Care of Children in Kenya can serve as a model for other countries in the region for similar national guidelines.</p>

							<p>In response to the influx of refugees from Burundi, between May 2015 and January 2017, the Department of Social Welfare deployed 100 Social Welfare Officers (SWOs) to provide case management services to refugee children in need of individualized child protection services. The initiative was made possible by the fact that Tanzania, has a cadre of trained social welfare officers (unlike other countries in the region) combined with an admission that there was a shortage of trained and government-mandated social welfare officers to meet the demands of the Burundian refugee influx.</p> <p>In Uganda, District Probation Officers are providing child protection services to refugee children in refugee hosting districts. While there is some variation between settlements in various districts, Probation Officers cover a range of functions in relation to refugee children. They provide guidance on the applicable national child protection legislation and participate in child protection coordination groups covering the refugee response. The Probation Officers also undertake some individual case management especially in relation to refugee children in conflict with the law. In other instances this has included children subjected to sexual violence and children with unclear custody situations. Probation Officers also participate in Best Interest Determination (BID) panels which are assessing the situation of individual refugee children.</p>
<p>Health of refugees and migrants Practices in addressing the health needs of refugees and migrants</p>	<p>https://www.alnap.org/system/files/content/resource/files/main/Evaluation%20Synthesis%20of%20UNHCRs%20cash-based%20interventions%20in%2</p>	2018	Refugee and migrant health	Report	WHO African Region	Information gathered from the contributions from Member States, IOM, UNHCR, ILO, other partners and WHO regional and country offices, in response to	<p>Ethiopia</p> <p>All refugees have the right to get basic health services and be treated like that of the host community.</p> <p>The Ethiopian Government has set targets for the country in the pledges it made during the Refugees Leaders' Summit in September 2016. The Government decision to roll-out the UNHCR-led comprehensive refugee response framework may further improve access to rights and basic service delivery to refugees.</p>

	0Jordan.pdf					<p>that global call, as well as from literature searches and reports available in the public domain</p>	<p>The government aims to achieve universal health coverage including refugees and migrants and develop integrated host community and refugee water supply and sanitation systems with integrated operation and management models.</p> <p>Kenya</p> <p>Eastleigh hosts many of the urban refugees, as well as a large number of irregular migrants. The Eastleigh Community Wellness Centre (ECWC) was established to manage migration health by offering migrant-friendly services to both migrants and host communities. Currently the clinic serves a catchment population of over 300,000, with a monthly attendance of close to 2500 patients, half of whom are migrants. In the period 2014-2016 the clinic had served 102,880 clients. 8,440 clients received HIV counselling and test, with 633 who tested positive and were referred for treatment. 4,946 clients were screened for TB and 260 new TB cases were enrolled for treatment. 17,050 children attended the child welfare clinic, of which 8,062 were migrant children. 1,570 pregnant women were referred and 2,508 women (15-49 years) were provided with family planning. In addition, community health workers are weekly engaging members of the community in health education, community surveillance and treatment follow-up with door-to-door activities and group campaigns</p> <p>Health service delivery in migration-affected areas promotes equitable access for all including migrants and mobile populations, as well as host communities. The ECWC model of migration-responsive health service delivery demonstrates how to address this challenge in urban areas by applying an integrated and inclusive approach to ensure equal access to care for both migrants and host population. The model includes health systems strengthening, community participation and health promotion, institutional partnership and close engagement with government and local authorities.</p>
--	-------------	--	--	--	--	---	--

							<p>Uganda</p> <p>Integrated comprehensive health care package is provided in the facilities for host and refugee populations. In 87 health facilities supported by UNHCR across the country, 72% of the total number of PHC consultations are made to the refugee population.</p>
<p>The urbanisation of displaced people</p>	<p>http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/824051468148520326/pdf/NonAsciiFileName0.pdf</p>	<p>May 2011</p>	<p>IDPs in cities</p>	<p>Paper</p>	<p>Cities Alliance</p>	<p>Not disclosed</p>	<p>Cities can absorb large numbers of people unnoticed, as most of those displaced to urban areas keep a low profile, often avoiding registration, enumeration and profiling exercises.</p> <p>Many of those displaced to urban areas live alongside other urban poor in slums/informal settlements where resources and services are already overstretched, social relations fragile and communal solidarity lacking.</p> <p>The assistance provided to IDPs, refugees and returnees in urban areas is ad hoc and almost invariably inadequate.</p> <p>Many of the poorly built urban environments in which most urban refugees/IDPs live are in areas that are increasingly vulnerable to natural hazards, such as floodplains, coastal areas and on hillsides. However, disaster risk reduction strategies rarely consider displaced populations.</p>
<p>Health system resilience: Lebanon and the Syrian refugee crisis</p>	<p>https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC5234495/</p>	<p>2016</p>	<p>Resilience of host community health system</p>	<p>Academic article</p>	<p>Journal of Global Health</p>	<p>Case study</p>	<p>The study indicates that the Lebanese health system was resilient as its institutions sustained their performance during the influx of large numbers of refugees between 2011 and 2013 and even improved.</p> <p>Four major factors that enabled resilience were identified: (i) networking with stakeholders (ii) diversification of the health system that provided for adequate infrastructure and health human resources (iii) a comprehensive communicable disease response and (iv) the integration of refugees into the health system.</p> <p>Integration of refugee health care within the national health system, made possible through the settlement of refugees within Lebanese communities rather than camps, was an important factor. It reduced</p>

							administrative and set-up costs, and enabled more responsive service delivery. It also shifted the burden to several geographic areas in Lebanon and to several different players in the Lebanese health system. The benefits of the integrated health system approach over the approach, which creates multiple parallel service delivery and financing systems, have been documented in other refugee crises.
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	---

Suggested citation

Mikulak, M. (2018). *Cost-effectiveness in humanitarian work: Integration of displaced persons into host community services*. K4D Helpdesk. Brighton, UK: Institute of Development Studies.

About this report

This report is based on five days of desk-based research. The K4D research helpdesk provides rapid syntheses of a selection of recent relevant literature and international expert thinking in response to specific questions relating to international development. For any enquiries, contact helpdesk@k4d.info.

K4D services are provided by a consortium of leading organisations working in international development, led by the Institute of Development Studies (IDS), with Education Development Trust, Itad, University of Leeds Nuffield Centre for International Health and Development, Liverpool School of Tropical Medicine (LSTM), University of Birmingham International Development Department (IDD) and the University of Manchester Humanitarian and Conflict Response Institute (HCRI).

This report was prepared for the UK Government's Department for International Development (DFID) and its partners in support of pro-poor programmes. It is licensed for non-commercial purposes only. K4D cannot be held responsible for errors or any consequences arising from the use of information contained in this report. Any views and opinions expressed do not necessarily reflect those of DFID, K4D or any other contributing organisation. © DFID - Crown copyright 2018.

