K4D
Knowledge, evidence and learning for development

Interventions to combat modern slavery

Iffat Idris
GSDRC, University of Birmingham
15 December 2017

Question

What evidence is there, from academic or other sources, about effective and ineffective interventions to combat modern slavery?

Contents

1. Overview

This report details findings from evaluations of a range of interventions to combat modern slavery. While there are three broad areas of efforts to tackle modern slavery – prevention, protection and prosecution – the main focus to date has been on prevention and, to a lesser extent, protection; prosecution has received far less attention. The literature indicates that interventions have generally proven to have limited effectiveness. Various evaluations highlight the need for information campaigns to target specific groups and advocate action rather than simply raising awareness. They also call for protection measures to be targeted, and linked to interventions in health, education, social protection and livelihoods. A number of evaluations suggest that legislation banning trafficking, child labour, etc. can be counterproductive: more stress should be put on improving labour and working conditions.

Modern slavery is very broad-ranging in scope, covering forced and bonded labour, child labour, sex trafficking, human trafficking and so on. Rather than considering interventions under each type of modern slavery, this review categorises interventions into the following:

- prevention – aimed at raising public awareness of modern slavery and its risks;
- protection – aimed at empowering victims and helping them rebuild their lives;
- prosecution – to support implementation of legislation on modern slavery.[1]

Some programmes are cross-cutting, with interventions focused on two or more categories (of prevention, protection and prosecution). Findings from such cross-cutting programmes are given under the most appropriate category.

Since this review is designed to support formulation of programmes to tackle modern slavery, its focus is on whether diverse interventions have been effective or not and, crucially, what lessons or recommendations emerge from them that can be applied elsewhere. The main findings are as follows:

- Information campaigns – it is important that these target specific groups and that they advocate action rather than simply highlighting problems and risks. Baseline assessments can ensure that messaging is appropriate and effective. The priority within campaigns should be on engagement with communities to understand driving factors behind modern slavery and identify suitable interventions – it should not simply be on reaching the maximum number of people (a quantitative exercise). As well as explaining to potential migrants the risks involved and how to carry out safe migration, information campaigns should raise awareness of alternative options that may result in people not having to migrate.

- Protection measures – these too should be targeted at specific groups, in particular projects for children should be separate from those targeting women and should address their specific concerns. Projects to tackle modern slavery should be linked to interventions in education, health, social protection and livelihoods to increase effectiveness.

- Prosecution – simply imposing bans on trafficking, child labour, etc. will not be effective, and could even be counterproductive leading to increased vulnerability to trafficking and a rise in child labour. It is important to prioritise labour and working conditions in destinations, rather

---

[1] Interventions to support victims of modern slavery will be reviewed in a follow-up helpdesk report.

than simply emphasising prevention. Recent initiatives in the UK and California[2] to increase transparency about modern slavery in company supply chains have had only limited impact.

The review drew largely on grey literature, in particular evaluation reports for donor agency programmes. While a number of reports did focus specifically on women, the literature was to a large extent gender blind. The review found no literature looking at the issue of tackling modern slavery from the perspective of persons with disabilities.

2. Prevention interventions

Prevention measures provide communities with information about the risks of modern slavery and human trafficking, raising public awareness about this issue.

Skuse, A.J. & Downman, S. (2012). *MTV EXIT ASIA III: A campaign to increase awareness and prevention of trafficking in persons (Independent Review).* Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT), Australia.
https://digital.library.adelaide.edu.au/dspace/bitstream/2440/91117/3/hdl_91117.pdf

This report gives the findings of an independent review of MTV EXIT ASIA III, a large-scale multi-media campaign designed to raise awareness of trafficking in people (TIP) in the Asia-Pacific Region. The campaign employed a mix of high profile concerts, roadshows, television documentaries, national and international TIP-focused websites, public service announcements, as well as features and music videos. It also produced printed material, supported youth forums and youth media capacity development camps (both designed to help push anti-TIP messages to the local level), and worked with local partners to extend its messages and brand to areas that MTV EXIT would find difficult to target, i.e. rural locations.

The review found that the effectiveness of the programme could not be meaningfully assessed because there was no clear statement or organisation of what MTV EXIT was trying to achieve, or baseline to measure progress against. However, it had two major criticisms with regard to effectiveness. One, the majority of the anti-TIP messages were targeted at the general public, when specific messages targeting specific groups/stakeholders could potentially have had more impact. Two, the outputs reviewed contained a primary focus on the experience of being trafficked, the trafficking process and examples of where trafficked persons had been liberated by law enforcement authorities. Messaging was largely empathetic, and designed to stir concern about the issue. What was absent from MTV EXIT's approach was a clear behaviour change focus, i.e. information or messaging which advocated an action, upon which people could act.

Sainsbury, C. (2006). *Final evaluation: Information campaign to combat trafficking in women and children in Cambodia.* International Organisation for Migration (IOM). Final evaluation: Information campaign to combat trafficking in women and children in Cambodia

Cambodia is important as a receiving, sending and transit country for trafficking. This report gives the evaluation findings for the project Information Campaign to Combat trafficking in Women and Children in Cambodia. The project adopted a threefold prevention of trafficking strategy focused on raising awareness on trafficking, fostering community networks to combat trafficking, and the development of a counter-trafficking database to develop effective counter-trafficking policy. The

---

[2] 2015 UK Modern Slavery Act and 2010 California Transparency in Supply Chains Act.

four year campaign was implemented across 18 provinces by the Ministry of Women's Affairs (MoWA) with technical assistance from IOM and funded by USAID. In relation to its primary outputs the evaluation findings were as follows:

- <u>Increased awareness about trafficking</u> – the project contributed significantly to improved knowledge and awareness of safe and blind migration and trafficking amongst villagers in all target areas, but there was less improvement in villagers' awareness levels of the less tangible and culturally grounded aspects of trafficking, such as debt bondage. The evaluation found that use of baseline information to inform the development of the campaign strategy was an excellent way to ensure the intervention was relevant and appropriate to the needs of the target audience, but it raised doubts about whether single information events would be enough to bring about long-term behaviour change.

- <u>Communities protecting themselves against trafficking</u> – the evaluation found anecdotal information that villagers were implementing steps to protect against blind migration by using information they had learned, and where necessary approaching actors within the referral system for more information or to report suspicious activities. It was successful in setting up a community referral system for trafficking, but was too ambitious in terms of developing a referral system that could provide assistance to vulnerable groups at risk of trafficking.

- <u>Capacity of MoWA to carry out information and advocacy campaigns</u> – the capacity of the MoWA project team to develop and participate in information campaigns about trafficking significantly improved, with the final phase of campaign activities implemented and managed almost entirely by MoWA. A key strength of the project was its ownership by MoWA, especially at provincial level, with critical support from high ranking MoWA officials and close technical guidance from IOM.

- <u>Counter-trafficking database</u> – while an active trafficking watch database was not established, this did not seem to have inhibited the success of the project. Moreover, the initial stakeholder analysis identified clear policy themes, which were followed up with excellent success at national level.

ILO (2017a). *Lessons learned from the Work in Freedom Programme.* International Labour Organisation (ILO). http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---asia/---ro-bangkok/---sro-new_delhi/documents/publication/wcms_600474.pdf

Work in Freedom is a development cooperation programme of the ILO, supported by the UK Dept. for International Development (DFID) that started in 2013. It adopts an integrated and targeted approach in developing practices and multi-sectoral policy measures that reduce vulnerability to trafficking of women and girls in South Asian countries of origin (Bangladesh, India and Nepal) and in selected destination countries (India, Jordan and Lebanon). Work in Freedom's interventions engage migrants, civil groups, businesses and regulators in a collaborative effort to address the multiple facets of forced labour in source and destination areas of migrant domestic and garment workers.

Lessons learned in relation to prevention interventions include:

- <u>In better information campaigns, the content of information exchanged with prospective migrants should not exclusively focus on safe migration</u> - Programmes should not only seek to provide information to potential migrants about migration and work abroad, but also focus on ensuring that potential migrants are aware about other options that may

result in the person not having to migrate. Thus the focus should shift to enabling migration by choice.

- __Quantitative targets undermine effectiveness of interventions__ - Programmes seeking to inform inhabitants about their rights when they migrate would be better advised to ensure that their respective community workers invest time in understanding the reasons why people migrate and tailor their interventions accordingly rather than seeking to upscale mass awareness campaigns that will not be effective.

- __Safe migration interventions tend to be ineffective in preventing the violation of women's rights__ - While safe migration programmes can be helpful, in patriarchal contexts the concepts of safety and protection tend to exclude women's agency. Programmes should therefore consider frameworks that enable women's emancipation.

- __Interventions to promote safe migration are ineffective and unsustainable as long as causes of distress migration are not addressed__ - Migration information campaigns should not be used in areas where distress migration[3] is happening as a way of replacing peace building and responsible development policies and programmes. It is important to develop interventions that reduce distress migration to make migration a real choice.

- __Pre-departure skilling is more effective when women worker organisations are involved__ - While vocational and life skill training through private and national skills training institutions can reach higher quantities of people, the way the training is conducted and its content – omitting information about working conditions abroad and portraying a rosy pictures about earnings abroad - can mislead migrants and aggravate the risk of trafficking. These institutions tend to prioritise foreign employment over other considerations. Programmes should consider different ways to involve migrant worker organisations in skilling processes as they are more likely to provide information that can be useful for workers.

Nwogu, V. (2014). 'Anti-Trafficking Interventions in Nigeria and the Principal-Agent Aid Model'. *Anti-Trafficking Review,* Issue 3, 2014: 41-63.
http://www.antitraffickingreview.org/index.php/atrjournal/article/view/64/62

This report highlights some of the problems with anti-trafficking funding in Nigeria, arguing that this has neither been sufficient to meet the scale of the problem nor relevant to the specific needs of groups at risk of trafficking, or of returnee trafficked persons.

Two examples cited in the report show the failure to invest funds effectively. The first relates to an EU-funded information campaign being implemented by UNODC.[4] In October 2012, the government of Nigeria, UNODC and the EU launched a three-year anti-trafficking campaign throughout Nigeria entitled 'I am Priceless'. According to UNODC's website, the campaign is aimed at raising awareness about the reality, dangers and possible impact of irregular migration, as a consequence of either being smuggled or being a victim of trafficking in persons. Howard argues that this 'dominant institutional narrative which drives anti-trafficking interventions (that so-called victims of trafficking are unsuspecting and need to be protected by efforts to stem illegal migration) ignores the realities of so-called victims and their communities (i.e. a need to migrate and find work in the face of grinding poverty)' (cited in Nwogu, 2014). Nwogu notes that,

---

[3] For discussion on distress migration see Avis, W. (2017). *Scoping study on defining and measuring distress migration* (GSDRC Helpdesk Research Report no. 1406). Rome: Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations; and Birmingham, UK: University of Birmingham.
[4] United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime.

'While information campaigns can be useful, Nigeria is already saturated with them. When faced with the harsh economic realities of life in Nigeria today, an awareness campaign will not do much to discourage a young person from seeking a better life abroad.'

The second is EU funding of an NGO WOTCLEF: the EU-funded project in Abuja targets school-going children, their parents, teachers and other caregivers and law enforcement officers with information and awareness to prevent human trafficking. However, Abuja is not a critical source of child trafficking in or outside Nigeria. WOTCLEF's website pleads for donations to support its shelter in Abuja: the NGO is the only one that provides re-integration services specifically to trafficked children. A fact-finding mission in 2011 found the shelter faced extreme challenges in terms of space, staff capacities and facilities – those needs could be met with about USD 122,000 donor funding a year. 'However, these objectives appear not to suit the interests of donors'.

The report explains the failure to spend anti-trafficking funding effectively on the fact that this is provided in a 'principal-agent' relationship by donors to the government of Nigeria and anti-trafficking organisations. Donors (the principals) fund organisations (the agents) to do work they deem important, though organisations tend to have significantly different needs and preferences for the funding. Certain areas are 'favoured' for funding above others, e.g. prevention, prosecution and voluntary return of migrants. Other important issues are neglected, e.g. promoting safe positive migration, protecting the rights of potential migrants and migrant workers, and ensuring effective victim re-integration. Anti-trafficking 'players' are forced by aid dependency to focus on donor priorities and ignore these key issues. The consequence is that interventions paid for by these funds are 'not fit for purpose', making their outcomes often invisible, undesirable or unsustainable.

Abrahams, D. (2017). *Independent Impact Assessment of the Stronger Together Initiative, October 2013-June 2017.* Stronger Together. http://stronger2gether.org/resources/

Established in 2013, Stronger Together is a multi-stakeholder initiative aiming to reduce modern slavery by providing guidance, resources and a network for employers, labour providers, workers and their representatives. As of mid-2017, Stronger Together had trained over 2,850 individuals, from 1,428 businesses; and over 6,000 industry representatives had registered to access the initiative's resources for use within their organisations (Abrahams, 2017: 1).

This report gives the findings of an online survey conducted amongst suppliers in the UK consumer goods sector who had attended the Stronger Together training workshop 'Tackling Modern Slavery in UK Businesses' between October 2013 and June 2017. The overwhelming majority of respondents agreed Stronger Together had helped them understand what modern slavery is and how to tackle it, as well as how to handle potential situations of forced labour. A majority reported that their senior management had committed to tackling modern slavery in their business and supply chain. Businesses reported the initiative had led to improved relationships with their labour providers, supply chains and retail consumers. Key recommendations were for Stronger Together to develop ongoing engagement with businesses and promote the more advanced steps that businesses can take, as well as share case studies of successes and learning from businesses that have tackled forced labour.

Van der Laan, P. et al (2011). *Cross-border trafficking in human beings: Prevention and intervention strategies for reducing sexual exploitation.* The Campbell Collaboration.

https://www.campbellcollaboration.org/media/k2/attachments/Van_der_Laan_Trafficking_Review.pdf

This is a systematic review to assess the available evidence (at that time) on the effects of interventions that aimed to prevent and suppress trafficking in human beings. The review focused on cross-border trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation. It found that policies or interventions to prevent or suppress cross border trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation have not been evaluated rigorously enough to determine their effect.

3. Protection interventions

Protection efforts include recovery and reintegration of women and children; they empower individuals to move beyond their victimisation and rebuild their lives with dignity, security and respect.

Nwogu, V. (2014). Withdrawal and Re-integration of Children in Domestic Service and Prostitution Project (Oyo State, Nigeria) in 'Anti-Trafficking Interventions in Nigeria and the Principal-Agent Aid Model'. *Anti-Trafficking Review,* Issue 3, 2014: 41-63.
http://www.antitraffickingreview.org/index.php/atrjournal/article/view/64/62

This project is an example of an effective community-led anti-trafficking intervention. The project is supported by the Women's Consortium of Nigeria (WOCON) in Lagos state. WOCON, in partnership with ILO-IPEC[5] began the programme in 2002 in the town of Shaki, Oyo state. This rural border town was known for trafficking of children to Côte d'Ivoire, Guinea and Mali to work as hawkers and domestic servants. A comprehensive programme of open-air campaigning, market outreach and a consultative forum was conducted to raise awareness among the town's inhabitants. The community pointed out that one of the major reasons for child trafficking was the lack of income generating ventures available to them. WOCON proposed the commercialisation of honey, an abundant product in the town, to provide employment for the adult population. WOCON staff then made a representation to the state government on behalf of the Shaki community for the grant of cooperative credit facilities to assist the community in honey production. At the end of the programme, not only did the community vow to stop placing their children and wards in the hands of traffickers, they also established severe sanctions against those who violated the agreement. Since then, WOCON has used the success of this programme as a model to be replicated in other rural communities in Nigeria. An impact evaluation of the initiative would be welcome to determine if the success of the programme has been sustained.

Boateng, P. (2017) *Interventions on Child Labour in South Asia.* Institute of Development Studies (IDS), Brighton. http://www.gsdrc.org/publications/interventions-on-child-labour-in-south-asia/

This report looks at key interventions on child labour in South Asia at local, national, regional and international level, as well as the organisations carrying them out. The final section of the report looks at impact evaluations. Key findings are as follows (all references from Boateng, 2017):

---

[5] The International Labour Organization's International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (ILO-IPEC) Project.

- Investment in early childhood education (ECD) appears to substantially lower the risk of child labour and increase the likelihood of school attendance at later ages (Paruzzolo, 2009).

- Conditional cash transfers are promising - Such schemes have proved effective in several countries in increasing enrolment, retention in school and thus helped to reduce child labour supply (Raju, 2006). Linking social transfers[6] with other types of social protection programmes and child protection systems can maximise positive outcomes. For example, social transfer programmes linked to extra-curricular activities have shown greater impact in reducing child labour. However, findings suggest that the impact of social transfers on child labour differ by region and by gender – with boys more likely to benefit than girls from reductions in child labour. This may be explained by the fact that in many studies on the effectiveness of social transfers, household chores, which are predominantly done by girls, were not included in the definition of child labour (UNICEF, 2014). Social transfers can also produce unintended consequences on child labour. For example, a cash transfer scheme may provoke an increase in productive investments by beneficiary households, in turn creating new opportunities for children's work within the family. Consequently, child-sensitive programmes must be carefully designed to achieve positive impacts on child labour.

- Public works programmes could increase child labour - Findings from impact evaluations suggest that public works schemes aimed at encouraging micro-entrepreneurial activity, may increase children's work either directly in the household business or in activities within the household otherwise carried out by adults (Dammert et al, 2017). Public works programmes have had limited success in India, Pakistan and Bangladesh.

- Attempts to ban child labour could be counterproductive - Findings from two recent studies (Edmonds and Shrestha, 2012; Bharadwaj et al., 2013) suggest that the Indian child labour ban policy of 1986 actually increased child labour. These findings raise concerns regarding the effectiveness of such policies when households that rely on child labour face multiple constraints. They suggest that if child labour is largely a phenomenon of poverty, any attempt to ban it through an enforceable minimum employment age policy could potentially have little effect or be counterproductive. In addition, if the ban is only well enforced in the formal sector, it could increase participation in the informal sector as was seemingly the case in India. Furthermore, legal interventions, even if properly enforced and subsequently reduce child labour, do not necessarily increase child welfare thus building the case for a system level approach.

ILO (2017b). *Evaluation summary: Global Action Programme on Child Labour Issues GAP11.* http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_mas/---eval/documents/publication/wcms_608091.pdf

This was a three-year programme funded by the US Dept. of Labour. It had three components to achieve its three expected outcomes: improved legislation, enforcement and policy coordination on child labour and forced labour; innovative research and monitoring systems to guide policies and programmes; and strengthened protection for children in domestic work (CDW). The

---

[6] UNICEF defines social transfers as regular, reliable and direct transfers in cash and/or in kind to individuals or households (Boateng, 2017: 22).

evaluation report detailed the achievements under each outcome, and made a number of recommendations key among which are:

- Link projects with interventions in education, social protection and livelihoods: Interventions in areas related to child labour and forced labour, such as education, social protection and livelihoods, should be undertaken to increase the overall effectiveness of efforts to promote decent work.

- Ensure country-wise critical minimum number of activities: Effective and efficient country projects require a critical minimum number of activities, sufficient resources, and a long-term staff in the country who would maintain the relations with key stakeholders.

- Address issues on migration: Migration increases vulnerability to forced labour and trafficking and thus needs to be addressed with equal importance.

- Articulate mini theories of change within an overarching strategic framework: Project activities need to be aligned to an overarching strategic framework that include mini theories of change for the elimination of child labour and forced labour.

- Country consultations before implementation: Country consultations before implementation enable stakeholder collaboration and design changes if needed.

- Establish Partnerships: Partnerships should be established with a wide range of stakeholders such as government departments, police and judiciary, border control and other enforcement agents, NGOs and academic institutions for effective implementation of the projects to eliminate child labour and forced labour.

ILO (2015). *Combating the worst forms of child labour in shrimp and seafood processing areas of Thailand – Independent Final Evaluation.* http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_mas/---eval/documents/publication/wcms_450459.pdf

The project 'Combating the worst forms of child labour in shrimp and seafood processing areas of Thailand' was a 4.5-year programme funded by the US Department of Labour (USDOL), which ran from the end of 2010 to June 2015. The project focused on child labour specifically in the shrimp industry, where both Thai and migrant child labour is found. It represented a new generation of USDOL-funded child labour programming for ILO IPEC, with a combined effort at addressing both industry improvement and direct services to children. The project's three components - focused on policy, industry improvement, and area-based direct services - were intended to collectively contribute toward its development objective to eliminate the worst forms of child labour (WFCL) in the shrimping industry.

This report gives the final evaluation findings. The project was found to have made progress towards achieving its objectives. Significant outputs were the development of good labour practices (GLP), which had good buy-in from the Department of Fisheries as well as industry associations, and the implementation of various models for education access at local level. Challenges included denial of the child labour problem at community level, as well as among industry actors, leading to delays in project activities. The evaluation highlighted the risk that the GLP could serve the interests of image over genuine change. It also called for better linkages between the policy component of the project, and the direct service provision components.

ILO (2016). *Fishers First: Good practices to end labour exploitation at sea.*
http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_norm/---declaration/documents/publication/wcms_515365.pdf

This report focuses on good practices and innovative interventions to improve labour conditions and protect vulnerable workers in the fisheries sector. For each intervention it details the preconditions needed and the types of states they are relevant to. Interventions are characterised into innovative practice (promising initiatives operated for a limited time), good practice (initiatives with positive results under certain conditions) and replicated good practice (initiatives implemented and showing positive results in more than one location).

Replicated good practice initiatives include:

- <u>Vessel registers</u> - Making registries of vessels and their performance publicly available so (migrant) workers can check potential employers/work places to determine whether the vehicles or owners have been associated with fisheries crime and IUU[7] fishing.
- <u>Migrant and seafarer centres</u> - Located where migrant workers live and work and where seafarers come to port, the centres can provide information and access to services (including assistance in cases of abuse) in a safe environment.
- <u>Multi-disciplinary inspection and investigation systems</u> - Increasing the effectiveness and coverage of inspection and other law enforcement and compliance systems by pooling resources, expertise and mandates to cover multiple issues (e.g. labour conditions, environmental protection, safety, tax, etc.).

Berman, J. & Marshall, P. (2011). *Evaluation of the International Organisation for Migration and its efforts to combat human trafficking.* NORAD.
https://www.oecd.org/derec/norway/47448055.pdf

This is an evaluation of Norwegian-funded anti-human trafficking projects implemented by IOM between 2000 and 2010. A key recommendation for IOM was that, to the extent possible, it should separate projects targeting children from those targeting women. Projects for children should target their specific circumstances (as well as being appropriate for the age group concerned, as well as gender-sensitive). Work with children should explicitly reflect the commitment of states under the Child Rights Convention (CRC) to act in the best interests of the child, regardless of whether the child meets the definition of trafficked.

The evaluation also called for IOM to define clearly the objectives of all information activities in terms of target group, intended behavioural outcomes, and specific messages and methodologies to achieve them. It is urged to field test awareness-raising materials, highlighting the importance of determining if and how these materials transmit a prevention message before continuing to fund and implement them.

4. Prosecution interventions

Prosecution measures include support for implementation of legislation to tackle modern slavery, and capacity building of police and law enforcement agencies.

Aaronson, S. & Wham, E. (2016). *Can Transparency in Supply Chains Advance Labour Rights? A Mapping of Existing Efforts.* Institute for International Economic Policy, George Washington University.
https://www2.gwu.edu/~iiep/assets/docs/papers/2016WP/AaronsonIIEPWP2016-6.pdf

---

[7] Illegal, unreported and unregulated fishing.

This report looks at the implementation and impact of two supply-chain anti-slavery transparency initiatives: the 2010 California Transparency in Supply Chains Act and the 2015 UK Modern Slavery Act. Both require companies to report on their actions to eradicate slavery and human trafficking in their supply chains (and in the case of the UK law, in the company as well). Aaronson and Wham found that both laws had had a limited impact. Issues include that they:

- are expensive for firms to implement;
- have not led the bulk of firms to report, and the ones that do make broad statements and general commitments;
- require transparency about supply chain practices but say little about how firms should behave when they find slave or trafficked labour;
- do not yet appear to have changed corporate behaviour, although they have led firms to discuss how to address supply chain problems;
- can help governments and activists monitor those firms that do report but firms are not providing the right kind or sufficient information to facilitate effective monitoring;
- can do little to empower workers.

Aaronson and Wham (2016: 19) describe a promising initiative in France which could address their shortcomings. A private bill (501)4 passed by the Senate in March 2016 and awaiting presidential approval (as of 2016), would require all French companies with over 5,000 employees based in the country, or 10,000 employees under its direct control globally, to prepare and make public a 'plan de vigilance' regarding risks such as human rights and environmental regulations. The bill applies to French companies' subsidiaries, sub-contractors and suppliers.

The other approach they suggest for enhancing supply chain transparency is use of technology. This would enable companies to more effectively monitor even distant supply chains. Noting that companies can already track compliance or employment data using mobile technology – Unilever, for example, uses an app to track in real time how effectively its agricultural suppliers are complying with the company's Sustainable Agriculture Code – they identify a number of apps (e.g. LaborLink, LaborVoices) that could be used for supply chain monitoring. With technology making monitoring easier, 'it will be harder for firms to argue that they can't conduct such monitoring without high costs'.

CORE (2017). *Risk Averse? Company reporting on raw material and sector-specific risks under the Transparency in Supply Chains clause in the UK Modern Slavery Act 2015*. CORE Coalition. http://corporate-responsibility.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/171003_Risk-Averse-FINAL-1.pdf

This report looks at compliance with reporting requirements under Section 54 of the UK Modern Slavery Act 2015. This requires all commercial organisations with an annual turnover of more than £36 million operating in the UK to publish a Slavery and Human Trafficking Statement. The reporting requirement commenced on 29th October 2015 and it is estimated that between 12,000 and 17,000 companies are within its scope. All companies covered by the requirement should have reported by the end of September 2017. At the time of writing the report (Sept. 2017), just over 3,000 statements were available on the Modern Slavery Registry website. Overall compliance with the reporting requirement is therefore low.

The report explores a very small sample (less than 2 percent) of published statements from larger, well-known companies. In general, it finds that many of these statements are not compliant with the basic requirements of the legislation and that the majority do not address in

substantive detail the six topic areas listed in the Act. Many companies are not reporting on human rights due diligence and are not considering how their own business models can create risks of severe labour rights abuses.

Hameed, S. et al (2010). *Human Trafficking in India: Dynamics, Current Efforts and Intervention Opportunities for The Asia Foundation*. The Asia Foundation.
https://asiafoundation.org/resources/pdfs/StanfordHumanTraffickingIndiaFinalReport.pdf

This report was commissioned by The Asia Foundation (TAF), which was looking to expand its anti-trafficking in persons (TIP) programmes in other parts of Asia to India. As well as looking at the dynamics of human trafficking in India, the report evaluated efforts by NGOs, government and donors in fighting trafficking. It found the Indian legal framework with respect to trafficking to be severely flawed, with the biggest problem being weak implementation of laws. The main thrust of government programmes was towards prevention, with some attention to protection and little to prosecution. NGOs surveyed for the report had mixed views of government initiatives, and identified major gaps in implementation of state initiatives. However a number of recent programmes represented a multi-disciplinary and inter-agency approach to trafficking by the government. These include Integrated Anti-Human Trafficking Units, Anti-Trafficking Nodal Cell Programme and Integrated National Plan of Action. Given that the states analysed in the study were predominantly source areas for trafficking, the focus of NGO interventions was on also prevention and protection. Initiatives recommended in the report included: holding anti-trafficking festivals in rural areas; creating a registry of anti-trafficking individuals/organisations; conducting monitoring and evaluation of the 297 new Integrated Anti-Human Trafficking Units, and creating training/sensitisation programmes for police and prosecution stakeholders.

ILO (2017a). *Lessons learned from the Work in Freedom Programme.*
http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---asia/---ro-bangkok/---sro-new_delhi/documents/publication/wcms_600474.pdf

As described earlier in this report, the Work in Freedom programme undertook interventions to address the multiple facets of forced labour. One area was law and policy. Lessons learned from the law and policy initiatives are as follows:

- Anti-trafficking laws, policies and administrative practices are not alone a comprehensive way of preventing human trafficking - these tend to prioritise educating migrants and holding recruiters accountable while glossing over working and living conditions. It is important to prioritise labour and working conditions in destinations rather than over-emphasising prevention through pre-employment interventions.

- Migration bans increase vulnerability to human trafficking - when both demand for migrant workers and supply of workers are high, employers and workers will find ways of circumventing such bans at a greater cost for all and increasing vulnerability to trafficking of migrant workers. Hence anti-trafficking programming and policy makers should not seek to stop or prevent migration. Moreover advocacy to repeal such bans should be sustained overtime, otherwise bans may be reinstated.

- Recognising how different forms of discrimination are perpetrated against migrant women workers, is critical for better anti-trafficking interventions - Programming should include measures that deliberately tackle exclusion and facilitate access to rights and entitlements for populations who are subject to multiple forms of discrimination.

- Law enforcement and labour inspection should be responsive to migrant workers' rights - The disparity of power and resources between women migrants and forced labour

offenders compounded with structural incentives of law enforcement agencies to meet performance targets (e.g. addressing irregular migration) means that litigation is likely to result in migrants themselves being incriminated under other alleged offences such as theft of property, trespassing, illegal migrant status, document fraud, prostitution, etc. This is further aggravated by behavioural stereotypes among law enforcement personnel related to power, gender, race and social status. Strengthening the capacity of workers to uphold their rights and ensuring that administrative measures allow them to seek justice, is important.

- Improving laws, policies and practices requires more than technical assistance for reviewing - Prior to deciding to review a draft policy, it is important for organisations or programmes to assess the actual leverage of their technical inputs in the broader political context in order to judge whether the act of reviewing a policy may be instrumentalised for a different political purpose that undermines the very intent of the review.

Delaney, A. & Connor, D. (2016). *Forced labour in the textile and garment sector in Tamil Nadu, South India: Strategies for redress*. Non-judicial Human Rights Redress Mechanisms Project. http://www.indianet.nl/pdf/ForcedLabourTextileGarment.pdf

This report is about the grievances of young women, predominantly from disadvantaged Dalit and low caste communities, who are recruited from remote and impoverished rural villages to work in the garment sector in a number of districts of Tamil Nadu. The report discusses the issues facing these young women, many of whom are employed under bonded and forced labour conditions. It looks at the impact of three strategies to end these rights violations:

a) social movement campaigns – by local NGOs and unions, as well as international NGOs, have been successful in raising awareness of these human rights violations amongst local communities in Tamil Nadu, state institutions, global brands, multi-stakeholder initiatives and, to some extent, global consumers;

b) Complaints to national and state judicial and non-judicial institutions – by Indian NGOs and trade unions. While these various proceedings have resulted in some improvements in official policy regarding working conditions in the industry, there is little evidence of these policy improvements being effectively monitored and enforced by state institutions.

c) Complaints to an international non-judicial mechanism, the Ethical Trading Initiative (ETI) - the ETI's intervention has been relatively indirect, focusing on raising awareness of labour rights issues in the villages from which the workers are recruited, among recruiting agents, and among the textile and mill workers themselves.

All three strategies have had minimal impact. The report argues that the ETI would make a more useful contribution to reducing the ongoing rights violations if its member companies used their collective buying power to persuade the mill and factory owners to allow trade unions and other local advocacy organisations to have regular contact with the women working in the garment sector. This would allow those organisations to support those workers to pursue human rights grievances, by raising their cases with state authorities and with the global brands themselves. However, such a strategy would be much more likely to be effective if ETI member companies were willing to reward mills and factories that cooperated, for example by offering higher prices or 'preferred supplier' status. the unwillingness of global companies (from the UK and elsewhere) to offer their suppliers genuine incentives to cooperate in human rights initiatives (as opposed to threats to cut orders) significantly limits the effectiveness of voluntary, non-judicial mechanisms, including the ETI.

5. References

Aaronson, S. & Wham, E. (2016). *Can Transparency in Supply Chains Advance Labour Rights? A Mapping of Existing Efforts.* Institute for International Economic Policy, George Washington University. https://www2.gwu.edu/~iiep/assets/docs/papers/2016WP/AaronsonIIEPWP2016-6.pdf

Abrahams, D. (2017). *Independent Impact Assessment of the Stronger Together Initiative, October 2013-June 2017.* Stronger Together. http://stronger2gether.org/resources/

Berman, J. & Marshall, P. (2011). *Evaluation of the International Organisation for Migration and its efforts to combat human trafficking.* NORAD. https://www.oecd.org/derec/norway/47448055.pdf

Boateng, P. (2017) *Interventions on Child Labour in South Asia.* Institute of Development Studies (IDS), Brighton. http://www.gsdrc.org/publications/interventions-on-child-labour-in-south-asia/

CORE (2017). *Risk Averse? Company reporting on raw material and sector-specific risks under the Transparency in Supply Chains clause in the UK Modern Slavery Act 2015.* CORE Coalition. http://corporate-responsibility.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/171003_Risk-Averse-FINAL-1.pdf

Delaney, A. & Connor, D. (2016). *Forced labour in the textile and garment sector in Tamil Nadu, South India: Strategies for redress.* Non-judicial Human Rights Redress Mechanisms Project. http://www.indianet.nl/pdf/ForcedLabourTextileGarment.pdf

Hameed, S. et al (2010). *Human Trafficking in India: Dynamics, Current Efforts and Intervention Opportunities for The Asia Foundation.* The Asia Foundation. https://asiafoundation.org/resources/pdfs/StanfordHumanTraffickingIndiaFinalReport.pdf

ILO (2015). *Combating the worst forms of child labour in shrimp and seafood processing areas of Thailand – Independent Final Evaluation.* International Labour Organisation (ILO). http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_mas/---eval/documents/publication/wcms_450459.pdf

ILO (2016). *Fishers First: Good practices to end labour exploitation at sea.* International Labour Organisation (ILO). http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_norm/---declaration/documents/publication/wcms_515365.pdf

ILO (2017a). *Lessons learned from the Work in Freedom Programme.* International Labour Organisation (ILO). http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---asia/---ro-bangkok/---sro-new_delhi/documents/publication/wcms_600474.pdf

ILO (2017b). *Evaluation summary: Global Action Programme on Child Labour Issues GAP11.* International Labour Organisation (ILO). http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_mas/---eval/documents/publication/wcms_608091.pdf

Nwogu, V. (2014). 'Anti-Trafficking Interventions in Nigeria and the Principal-Agent Aid Model'. *Anti-Trafficking Review,* Issue 3, 2014: 41-63. http://www.antitraffickingreview.org/index.php/atrjournal/article/view/64/62

Sainsbury, C. (2006). *Final evaluation: Information campaign to combat trafficking in women and children in Cambodia.* International Organisation for Migration (IOM). Final evaluation: Information campaign to combat trafficking in women and children in Cambodia

Skuse, A.J. & Downman, S. (2012). *MTV EXIT ASIA III: A campaign to increase awareness and prevention of trafficking in persons (Independent Review).* Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT), Australia.
https://digital.library.adelaide.edu.au/dspace/bitstream/2440/91117/3/hdl_91117.pdf

Expert contributors

- Juliette Gaussem, Global Reporting (GRI)
- Jan te Roller, Global Reporting (GRI)
- Annie Delaney, RMIT University (Melbourne)

Suggested citation

Idris, I. (2017). *Interventions to combat modern slavery.* K4D Helpdesk Report 255. Brighton, UK: Institute of Development Studies.

About this report

This report is based on five days of desk-based research. The K4D research helpdesk provides rapid syntheses of a selection of recent relevant literature and international expert thinking in response to specific questions relating to international development. For any enquiries, contact helpdesk@k4d.info.

K4D services are provided by a consortium of leading organisations working in international development, led by the Institute of Development Studies (IDS), with Education Development Trust, Itad, University of Leeds Nuffield Centre for International Health and Development, Liverpool School of Tropical Medicine (LSTM), University of Birmingham International Development Department (IDD) and the University of Manchester Humanitarian and Conflict Response Institute (HCRI).