

August 18th and 19th

2015

Getting to Swachh Bharat Gramin Faster Through Rapid Action Learning and Sharing

A Rapid Action Learning and Sharing Workshop on Innovations in Rural Sanitation

[This report captures the processes, discussions and consolidated outputs of the States, Districts, International and National development partners who participated in the two-day workshop held at Hotel Palash Residency, Bhopal]



Organized by Ministry of Drinking Water and Sanitation, Government of India in association with Water Supply and Sanitation Collaborative Council (WSSCC) and Institute of Development Studies (IDS)

Table of Contents

| | |
|--|-----------|
| Executive Summary | 3 |
| Background | 4 |
| Objectives of the Workshop | 4 |
| Setting the Stage | 5 |
| Welcome Address by Vinod Mishra, WSSCC | 5 |
| Archana Patkar, WSSCC Geneva | 6 |
| Dr. Aruna Sharma, Additional Chief Secretary, Government of Madhya Pradesh | 7 |
| Vijayalakshmi Joshi, Secretary, Government of India..... | 7 |
| Robert Chambers, IDS..... | 8 |
| Discussion of Expectations | 9 |
| Case Studies Overview | 11 |
| Group Activities | 11 |
| Remarks from Vijayalakshmi Joshi, Secretary, Government of India | 13 |
| Key Points from Panel Discussions | 13 |
| Learning and Reflection..... | 13 |
| Innovations and Best Practices at Scale | 16 |
| Nipun Vinayak, Director Swacch Bharat Mission, Government of India- Reflections..... | 18 |
| Learning and Sharing: State- wise Inputs | 19 |
| Development Partners | 20 |
| Reflections from Participants | 21 |
| Feedback forms | 22 |
| Conclusion and Next Steps..... | 22 |
| Annex 1.....Agenda of workshop | |
| Annex 2.....Concept Note of workshop | |
| Annex 3.....Case Study Template | |
| Annex 4.....List of Participants | |
| Annex 5 to Annex 39.....Case studies presented during workshop | |
| Annex 40.....Glimpses of workshop | |

Executive Summary

The two-day National Workshop on Rapid Action Learning and Sharing of Innovations in Rural Sanitation highlighted various best practices and innovations that are helping achieve the outcomes envisaged under Swachh Bharat Mission Gramin. It brought together practitioners and champions at various levels, from Gram Panchayat to District Level and also policy makers from Government of India and State Governments as well as Development Partners. It served as an important first step towards institutionalizing the practice of documenting, learning and sharing of what has worked and also enabled a need to understand what has not worked.



The role of the community, the role of champions at all levels, the need for sustainable and collective behavior change, the role of the district administration as an enabler rather than a provider, and the need to understand the aspirations and drivers of household level behavior change (such as dignity and pride which were central to the success in Rajasthan) were the major points to be understood through the discussions. The political will and enabling environment has been set, but what needs a closer look is the creative use of the incentive, such as a reward for the community after it becomes ODF.

The States identified their needs for similar workshops at the local level for faster dissemination of information and to enable faster action. Capacity and Human Resources Development for supporting and managing rapid action learning processes as well as to meet the momentum for getting results faster was seen as a crucial requirement. Several States such as Chhattisgarh, West Bengal and Madhya Pradesh are keen to take on a State Level Rapid Action Learning Unit (RALU). Development Partners were explicit in the need to capture data, leading to information and knowledge and their role in disseminating widely. The next steps are to dedicate full-time resources for learning and sharing at Central and State Level.

Background

The urgent priority of moving faster and with quality towards Swachh Bharat (Gramin), the shortcomings of earlier programs, the interlocking obstacles to progress, and the sheer scale and diversity of conditions, present challenges which are unique, and for which there can be no universal magic bullet solution. As in other complex situations, a multiplicity of initiatives and innovations, and the rapid sharing, learning, adopting and adapting of these for local needs and conditions are a key way forward. The SBM (G) has shown that a great variety of approaches and methods have been innovated in many Districts and States. Sharing and learning of these and from these, promises to widen the range of options and actions for all States and Districts and to accelerate progress towards Swachh Bharat (Gramin).



In this regard, a Two Day National Rapid Action Learning and Sharing Workshop on Innovations in Rural Sanitation was held on August 18th-19th, 2015 in Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh, organized by the Ministry of Drinking Water and Sanitation, Government of India in association with Water Supply and Sanitation Collaborative Council (WSSCC) and Institute of Development Studies (IDS).

The participants include senior policy-makers from the Government of India and State Governments, practitioners and champions from 25 States and representatives from 19 Development Partners.

This report captures the processes, discussions, and consolidated outputs of the various innovations and learning by Districts and States from across the country. It also captures the inputs of several development partners who are providing critical inputs and support, particularly in the area of capacity building and strengthening of the systems responsible for delivering quality water, sanitation and hygiene for everyone, all the time.

Objectives of the Workshop

The overriding aim is to provide States and Districts with ideas and means to accelerate progress towards Swachh Bharat. To this end, the workshop is designed:

1. To learn from experiences and provide space for the sharing of promising innovations, methods, processes and approaches.
2. To collect and make available different case studies of effective actions that has taken place.
3. To reflect upon challenges and lessons learnt

4. To enable States to assess the potential of rapid action learning and decide on any follow up actions they may wish to undertake.
5. To demonstrate one way in which innovations, learning and challenges can be shared

Setting the Stage

Welcome Address by Vinod Mishra, National Coordinator, WSSCC India

It is matter of great honor and pleasure for Water Supply & sanitation collaborative Council and Institute for development studies to collaborate with Ministry of drinking water & sanitation, government of India to organize workshop on learning sharing. The Presence of Secretary, GoI is matter of huge inspiration and encouragement for us. I Invite the Secretary for Lighting of the Lamp to Inaugurate the Workshop.



The overriding aim is to provide States and Districts with ideas and means to accelerate progress towards Swachh Bharat. To this end, the workshop is designed:

- To learn from experiences and provide space for the sharing of promising innovations, methods, processes and approaches.
- To collect and make available different case studies of effective actions that has taken place.
- To reflect upon challenges and lessons learnt
- To enable States to assess the potential of rapid action learning and decide on any follow up actions they may wish to undertake.
- To demonstrate one way in which innovations, learning and challenges can be shared

Some innovations, methods and approaches from case studies:

1. **Incentives.** What are the different ways these are managed? How well do they work?
2. **Funding mechanisms.** Revolving funds. Micro-finance. Voucher system etc.
3. **Training, human resources and their deployment.** Innovations with going to scale, including Natural Leaders, motivators, Swachhata Doots, masons, entrepreneurs
4. **Innovations in triggering and post-triggering.** Early examples are the instant cat method in which a community decides to become ODF immediately, and collective pledging to stop open defecation.
5. **Use of services of Natural Leaders/Community Consultants**
6. **Who constructs?** Householders themselves, or masons, or what sequence and mix. Who does what? What is the range of approaches and experiences?
7. **Collective behavior change.** Provoking and sustaining this. Nigrani Committees. Sanctions
8. **Involvement of women and SHGs.** Gender-aware approaches, women's roles, NRLM

9. **Involvement of children, and schools.** How? For what?
10. **Those least able- Disabled, very old, sick, extremely poor.** What help do they need? What can communities do? What experience is there with innovations like vouchers? Other measures?
11. **Assuring timely and suitable supply of materials** phased to fit demand
12. **Technologies.** Widely replicable and accessible technologies, innovations and needs
13. **Problem environments.** Flooding, high water tables, hard rock, remote and small communities, trains (OD on wheels in stations) etc.
14. **District-level campaigns.** What has been found to work? What lessons can be drawn from experiences so far?

Archana Patkar, Program Manager, WSSCC Geneva

For the Water Supply and sanitation Collaborative Council- we were formed exactly 25 years ago through a meeting in Delhi- the goal is to provide a bridge and platforms for learning and dialogue between various actors in water, sanitation and hygiene to accelerate services for those who do not have them. Our largest membership is still from India and our mandate 25 years later is still to enable learning and sharing to ensure that the most marginalized individuals and groups are able to use safe sanitation and hygiene services with dignity and safety as per their constitutional and human rights.

As we celebrate India's progress and recognition on the global stage- we continue to struggle with the huge disease burden imposed by the continued practice of open defecation and unsafe sanitation and poor hygiene for more than 600 million Indians— usually the poorest and most marginalized. This is a state of national emergency calling for immediate, large-scale action. But India is also the hot bed of innovation, creativity, local approaches, adaptation and bottom of the pyramid technologies with the potential to reach millions. How can we take these islands of excellence, incredibly successful cases or experiments with potential to scale? To touch every India rich or poor, across the country with sustainability so that we are not here in 5 years trying to simply understand what works?

The overriding aim of this workshop is to provide States and Districts with ideas and means to accelerate progress towards Swachh Bharat. But we need to consolidate these ideas in a practical, scalable way so that they can be picked up by others, so that they can form the important building blocks of permanent and lasting behavior change for all Indians, everywhere.



We have in the room front line experience from 25 states, districts, Gram Panchayats, 19 development partners and very simply put, more than a 100 people with more than a decade each of experience in WASH on an average. The challenge is to achieve definitive behavior change so that everyone in India everywhere and all of the time practices safe sanitation and hygiene –

breaking the vicious cycle of dirt and disease transmission through various routes and thereby finally enabling individual dignity, safety, health and productivity. We hope that in this workshop you will share, without fear, learn with an open mind, not resist change—and embrace new thinking so that we can get to Swacch Bharat faster. On behalf of the Water Supply and Sanitation Collaborative Council and the Institute of development Studies, Sussex, I thank you for being here and wish us a powerful learning journey today and tomorrow with practical usable outcomes.

Dr. Aruna Sharma, Additional Chief Secretary, Government of Madhya Pradesh

‘This is the most difficult program of the Government, as all other programs is a one time relationship. But this is one program, where there is no completion certificate, we have to go on and on until we achieve behavior change.’ It is a national hygiene issue and one that we need to work on constantly. It is not just about individual behavior. We need to convince people that it is criminal to go out and defecate. GoI has put prime focus on this issue of open defecation—cleanliness and hygiene is seen as the most important issue. The necessary and enabling political scene and will is well set.



What have helped in this journey are the successes brought about by the participants here, which gives us the confidence that this is achievable and if we can document the successes, then it helps those that are lagging behind, to learn from the challenges. Four types of models such as the Gram Panchayat led, SHGs led, Individual led and Community led, have emerged in the best practices from across the country. . Sufficient and necessary precautions and considerations have been taken to avoid financial misuse across the different models. There is now accurate data available (from 2011) of which households have received a incentive earlier to ensure fiscal discipline. It is important to undertake concurrent evaluation of those villages declared ODF once in three months to ensure validity and credibility of the processes and systems established. This is not a race, however we have to attain it qualitatively and we must achieve something that is sustainable. Once the village is ODF, the next step will be Solid and Liquid Waste Management covering all households.

Vijayalakshmi Joshi, Secretary, Government of India

Let’s pause to think, where are we, after a year of working hard on this subject. 80 Lakh toilets, 12600 GPs ODF, we’ve almost completed the toilets (in schools) as the PM has said two days back. Still, is this the real success, is it the numbers, have we achieved the outcome? To me this is not success. The big success is the absolutely fantastic leadership in the field, the young administrators, the GP leaders, women, school children, the Collectors, etc. The success is in the idea of working in a team. It is not about how many toilets were constructed, but where there is a team it has become possible. That is really successful. Alone we can never change.

The new initiatives will move forward, and take the energy and momentum forward to achieve outcomes at scale; the sharing of these activities is a success. Collective action across different groups is a success. We have taken a year to get here and we have another four years to make the entire country ODF, ODF+ and this is a very long story

We need to first share the experiences, we are not trying to boast our success but someone might learn from you and fix their own problems. Please document what you are doing, for the new collector, the new Sarpanch etc., so share the experience, share the success story. If there are commonalities, someone else will do it. Use our website, put up your stories.



This workshop has been really thought out. The three things working behind it- if we are looking at success stories- we are looking at scale, sustainability, and saturation. In the last workshop when we met all of us in Pune, we could finalize the definition of ODF. The second part is ODF verification. Yes, we are working on ODF verification and we are going to come out soon with how to easily define and verify ODF. We are also working on an incentive mechanism with the states- for doing a good job; doing it quickly- we should be coming out very shortly with this. We need to incentivize the people that are working in the whole process. RALU at the National Level and also at the States- Madhya Pradesh and Chhattisgarh are thinking about it. These will help to quickly make corrections and take action and at the national level for policy changes. With regard to capturing ODF status, changes have been made on IMIS and we need to start working on this and share the success stories.

The overseas Indians would like an opportunity to fund things from states that they belong to. If we can suggest ways for this, such as for funding defunct toilets, toilets for APL families and others, that can be made possible. There is a corporate facilitation desk set up at the GOI to channel CSR funds as per the need. India Sanitation Council has been launched with the corporates, which can be tapped into for additional funds. BRICS Ministry of Finance is open to funding large-scale projects within States. Capacity Building- large numbers of training is required at all levels for doing the handholding. Today, a lot of us are dependent, but GOI is working on a program of how we will do the capacity building of States. Training is going to be one very major area as we are moving forwards. We have to run ahead, the days ahead are not going to be easy, sustainability is going to be a major issue- we are all here with you, you are doing a great job and now we just need to scale it up.

‘ Raise the bar, compress the time and beat the traffic’

Robert Chambers, Professor, IDS Sussex

It is a privilege to be welcomed as an ally in this campaign. What you are all engaged in is far more important than we realized or knew 3 or 4 years ago. Recent research has found that 54 per cent of under nutrition and stunting in children is due to open defecation, and when population density is also taken into account this becomes 65 per cent, nearly two-thirds. The situation has been getting worse. According to the census, there were over 8 million more rural households defecating in the open in 2011 than in 2001. We also know now that among fecally-transmitted infections (FTIs) the diarrheas are only the tip of the iceberg, and other FTIs, especially environmental enteropathy, are much more significant causes of stunting. Under nutrition and stunting have also been found to affect cognitive development, performance in school, duration of schooling, later earning capacity, immune systems in later life and even obesity in

middle age. The Ganges basin has the greatest density of open defecation and of undernourished children in the world.

So why are we here? There is no magic bullet but a common objective in collective behavior change. This means that everybody in the community has to stop open defecation. It is not enough just to think about women. Men have to stop. It has to be the whole family with everyone using the toilet at all times.

Let us find ways of going faster and better to Swachh Bharat. In doing this we need to be careful not to be taken in by isolated success stories. There is a scattered archipelago of successes. We can draw important lessons from these, but what we really need is approaches and methods, which can be replicated, going to scale in the surrounding ocean, in ordinary circumstances without the champions that we have here. If we can identify and spread these, then there will be a much better hope of achieving the objectives of Swachh Bharat Abhiyan.

‘Challenge is to provoke, support, sustain, collective behavior change’

Discussion of Expectations

With the background, the context explained, the Participants were then asked to share their expectations of the workshop by writing them down on cards, which were then sorted out into the following categories as listed below:

- Learning
 1. Which District is using what approaches with what results
 2. Knowing the Best practices
 3. Innovations in Capacity Development
 4. Lessons emerging from field for scale
- Learning from failures
 1. Openness to learn from failures
 2. Gaps which may lead to failure
 3. Learn from failures and success of scaling up sanitation success
- How to Go to Scale
 1. Learning about scalability with sustainability
 2. Would like to know most effective delivery implementation strategies
 3. Does replication work: any examples from India
- CBC, Motivation, Triggers
 1. Explain the Triggers
 2. How to overcome superstitions?
 3. Politicization of Community Exercise
 4. CLTS not the magic bullet???
- Involvement/ Participation
 1. Mobilization vis a vis Regulation
 2. Community Involvement in Real terms
 3. Community Participations



- Incentives
 1. How are incentives being distributed?
 2. Incentive provision should be continued?
 3. Learn Innovative Ways of Streamlining incentive delivery mechanism
- Financing
 1. How to arrange upfront money?
 2. What would be possible funding mechanisms between DWSSM and GPs
 3. Streamlining the fund flow
 4. How can Indians in the US help, support Swachh Bharat/ Swachh States
- Challenges
 1. Difficulty in Accessibility in Remote Areas
 2. Sharing of challenges faced and their mitigation strategies
 3. Sustaining ODF Status
- Technical, Practical, Physical
 1. Low cost Technologies; Alternate Materials
 2. Discussion on Pre-fabricated Toilets
 3. Dysfunctional Toilets
 4. Addressing those without space to construct toilets at household level or even to construct community toilet
- Champions, Capacity Building
 1. How to create Champions? Are they born or created?
 2. How to plan dedicated team from district to GP Level
 3. How can foreign governments better support Swachh Bharat through advocacy?
- RALU- Related
 - a. Agreement on Working Model for RALUs
 1. Define more clearly the knowledge sharing strategies along with pathways to scale up these 'archipelagoes' of success
 2. A dedicated platform for RALU across states
 3. Define Role of RALUs, expected skill sets, do's and don'ts.

Case Studies Overview

| States | No. Case-Studies |
|----------------|------------------|
| Andhra Pradesh | 3 |
| Assam | 1 |
| Bihar | 1 |
| Chhattisgarh | 4 |
| Delhi | 1 |
| Haryana | 2 |
| Karnataka | 1 |
| Madhya Pradesh | 5 |
| Maharashtra | 1 |
| Odisha | 2 |
| Rajasthan | 2 |
| Sikkim | 1 |
| Tamil Nadu | 1 |
| Telangana | 1 |
| Uttar Pradesh | 2 |
| Uttarakhand | 1 |
| West Bengal | 2 |



Group Activities

Over the course of the two days in groups the different case studies were presented. Groups focused on different themes and over three sessions, 9 subjects were discussed and innovations shared. Innovations in:

- Stakeholder engagement
- G.P. wide successes
- District wide successes and what works at scale
- Construction and matching supply with demand
- Solid waste management
- Managing the incentive
- Defining and changing social norms
- Strengthening capacity for management, implementation and monitoring
- Learning, sharing and documentation



In addition, there was a rotating session with four stations. Participants:

- Had a glimpse of the CLTS triggering process
- Discussed counting ODF villages vs. counting toilets
- Were able to discuss with Natural Leaders from Madhya Pradesh
- Presented with two learning processes that included reflection and corrections. One from Sikkim and the other from Malda district, West Bengal.

From these discussions participants were asked to list what they saw as the keys to success, common challenges and golden principles that emerged. Groups then feed back into plenary. These were consolidated together and are listed below.

1. What works

- Focusing on sustainable collective behavior change
- Triggering different stakeholders: primary, secondary and tertiary keeping in mind local culture and sensitivities
- Planning and preparation prior to triggering
- Rewards and recognition for good performance – especially for natural leaders.
- Capacity development of government and community level workers.
- Making materials available for quality construction
- Linkages and coordination with other government schemes
- Transparency and efficiency in disbursement of incentive
- Consistent IEC material
- One-to-one interaction for behavior change
- Regular and systematic follow-up and visits with consistent IEC material
- Use of local knowledge and local adaptability



2. Challenges

- Keeping the sense of unity alive in the community
- The incentive – transparency and flowing of funds
- Availability of masons and supply of material
- Collective behavior change – lack of homogenization of different stakeholder group
- Full coverage – APL and BPL
- What to do with defunct toilets
- Regulation – legal or social
- Finding champions who can sustain activities needed
- How to create new champions to take SBM to scale
- SWM – scattered households, separating waste at source

3. Golden Principles

- Flexibility
- Have faith in the process, people and communities to achieve results
- Government to FACILITATE rather than lecture (be true to goals of SB)
- Ensure needs of marginalized, poor and disabled
- Delegation and decentralization
- Affordability and adaptability of solutions
- Ownership by community.
- Focus on outcomes (ODF) rather than only outputs (toilets)

Remarks from Vijayalakshmi Joshi, Secretary, Government of India

The good thing was that almost everyone participated. Even when English was a problem, people participated in Hindi. We have enough on the board now. What we need to do is cull out the main elements in all three and then come out with something that is very solid and something we can work with. We need to take back lessons from here, the field, lessons of experiences gained over the last year. It is important to hear from the Development Partners about what is happening outside India and how India is being looked at from outside India. We need to find solutions together.

Key Points from Panel Discussions

Learning and Reflection

Panel Discussion with Deepak Sanan, Nilanjana Mukherjee, Shyam Kishore Yadav, Shama Sahu, Bhavna Bhatt, and Murali Ramashetty

Deepak Sanan, Additional Chief Secretary, Himachal Pradesh

Very happy to see and hear about so many new champions. Since last year, the type of experiences, champions that are emerging, I see in this workshop, that I am primarily addressing two kinds of people. Firstly, those jaded, old sanitation workers who are interested in keeping their livelihoods going, Secondly, New converts who are enthusiastic and who are interested in making a change. We need to encourage this enthusiasm and innovation, keep this energy alive and we should not be afraid to say 'the emperor is without clothes'.



Some trends emerging across the country are:

- Legal rule- if you don't have a toilet then don't let them contest election
- We will saturate households with toilets then the behavior change will happen
- For construction, they talk about the dignity of women and provide money for constructing toilets
- Collective behavior change through triggering tools- create demand and then construct toilets
- Let the communities take the lead- we have to ignite the desire in the community- how do we alter the system as it exists to make sure the community takes the lead.
- We have found the magic formula- we will trigger demand and then supply toilets. Therefore the cry is, how will we get enough to create this demand across and then we will supply the toilets

We are looking for scale and sustainability. I think what I see since morning is a broad consensus that sustainability is brought about by collective behavior change. So what enables successful, collective behavior change? It's very clear that if we are to get sustainable, collective behavior change, then we need to keep the community in the forefront. We need to treat the community not as something that we are addressing; it is going to come out of a process of self-realization. The change will come only when the community understands that it is our problem.

What is to be avoided for this?

- Avoid a focus on toilets- means I am telling someone, it is not your problem but it is someone else's problem. This is dangerous when I talk about toilets or construction of toilets. The point is this is your problem, think of ways to solve this problem and a toilet is one way of solving this problem
- This is a community problem. Open defecation affects everyone, IPC is not the only thing, and it has to be about the whole community.
- 'Sustainability means stop talking toilets, stop counting toilets, stop talking TO the community'

Nilanjana Mukherjee, Water & Sanitation Program

The most exciting about this workshop and all of you is the aspect of creatively taking on the challenge of rural sanitation in an environment of ever increasing and substantial subsidies. One of the first comparisons between India and any other country fighting rural sanitation is the quantity of money available for the program, which is being channeled through as subsidies. This is not the case in Africa or East Asia. So the challenges are rather different when we talk about scale. We have been used to programs aiming at coverage targets, but something's changed in the way we are approaching rural sanitation challenges, after a brush with CLTS and a brush with Kamal Kar, in many countries. He has brutalized the thinking of many policy makers in his own unique manner and as a result, some of these countries have actually come around to banning subsidies.



Unless you have a national goal or target defined in behavioral terms, you don't get any support related to behavior changing interventions in most countries. We have that now, in India, the India ODF 2019, which wasn't the case maybe even two years ago. We have sufficient justification for behavior change rather than just the construction targets. The MIS is a necessary accompaniment, which must be geared towards capturing this behavior change at scale and linked to performance incentives. Over the last three years, it's great to see the flexibility in the guidelines to support behavior change. It just shows how some of you have already so creatively interpreted it, to show that the guidelines are facilitating and not seen as barriers to innovation.

Can you begin then by telling people there is no money for sanitation? I believe Aarti Dongra has already done that, and with great results. Apparently, it's a golden principle. So, let's not start off on the wrong foot, by talking to people about construction. Let's just focus on collective behavior change and what does it take to get there. Institutional

Capacity Building- it seems to me that everyone thinks capacity building is only required for the implementers at each level. There is a much bigger agenda than this, when we are going in for behavior changing approached at scale. Have we had any systematic capacity building for management of behavior changing rural sanitation programs at scale? There are a number of online courses, which bring together relevant global knowledge, such as the WEDC University's online course on Scaling up Rural Sanitation. The Government of Indonesia for instance, has made it mandatory for all to complete this course and made necessary in order to qualify for promotions. 100 Flowers are very welcome, but we are talking about doing it at a scale as large as this country and doing it sustainably.

Ram Kishore Yadav, Sarpanch Madhay Pradesh

Frequent changes in the administration led to a loss of momentum initially. We undertook social and facilities mapping and identified dysfunctional toilets and reaching both APL and BPL populations as key challenges. Communities had lots of excuses linked to the rains, expense and poor sustainability of kuchha toilets. However we set up awareness committees that helped people realize that they can achieve the change themselves. On 15th August we declared ODF and now that we have seen that we can do it the fire will never be extinguished. Anybody who defecates in the open is now shamed as we have understood that if one person defecates in the open, everyone actually defecates in the open

Shama Sahu

Need to institutionalize legal provisions against those who refuse to use their toilet after ODF has been achieved



Murali Ramashetty, Convenor Fresh Water Action network, South Asia

Most people without toilets do want access to toilets. Hardships are a real barrier to this aspiration. The system simply does not have the capacity to respond to this aspiration. Old, disabled people, women and girls are disproportionately affected by poor sanitation but have no voice or decision making power. How do we bring their voices to the table? Caste and class also affect very often behavior change so that people wait for the higher class to make the first move.

Bhavna Bhatt ,Vice President LLI, World Bank Group

There was a lot of energy in the room and people were mostly talking about action and not about policy or a guideline, and that was a very refreshing shift that I've seen. People are actually rolling up their sleeves and almost everyone here has started their journey, are fully triggered or almost triggered. This is significant for a program that was started about a year back. Another reflection is that while we talk about scale, saturation and sustainability, there is another aspect of speed. What I am really looking at, it is great to see 30 plus districts being represented here and all the energy, there are another 600 plus districts that need to get there and so there is a huge task ahead of all of us.

There are quite a few common elements but there are also a lot of innovations. What we didn't talk a lot about were the challenges and the failures. Moving forward, in addition

to triggering, self-realization and aspiration are very critical for the design of programs to tackle this problem. Everybody is a stakeholder; it has to be a collaborative effort. It is not about one person who started a movement and moves on, and no body else knows what to do. It needs to be emphasized that this should be seen as a collaborative initiative. Capacity building has mostly been seen as a requirement at the community level particularly related to CLTS and triggering. But there is another aspect of capacity building, which is really looking at the whole program implementation and managing the program. As we are talking about scale, some of these issues and challenges will become huge hurdles in the system. We also need to look much closer and deeper at the whole programmatic level and understand what capacity needs must be built.

Vertical alignment and horizontal alignment of capacities- the horizontal has been talked about and thought about, but more needs to be done on the vertical alignment of capacities. We need to bring in an institutionalized approach to enable more districts to come into this circle of achievers and enable those sitting on the fence or just outside the fence to learn and adapt and come up with new innovations to take rural sanitation to scale.

Robert Chambers, Professor IDS Sussex

There exist a couple of blind Spots. The first is social norms. As per the SQUAT survey, there are many households who have a toilet, prefer to defecate in the open and actually feel that it is healthier than to use a toilet. Not all members of the household use the toilet at all times. Is this something that we need to understand? The second is emptying toilets. If you have a twin pit and the first one gets filled, what happens to the toilet? Are there any experiences of someone emptying the pit etc.? The question I'd simply like to ask is should we try to understand why people so desperately want septic tanks because there's a good chance they will never have to empty it. If this is the case, then should it be confronted and need to be confronted on a very wide scale? Political leaders, religious leaders and others, should they be involved to handle these social norms and predispositions to help achieve this goal of ODF.

There's another collective behavior change and that's about us. Do we need a collective behavior change, for all those that are involved in achieving behavior change, particularly related to subsidies and incentives? If you focus on ODF only and not on toilets, then toilets take care of themselves. If you focus on toilets then you can never achieve ODF. Is this something, which is actually quite difficult for some of us to accept? But do we actually need a change of mindset for all of us?

Innovations and Best Practices at Scale

Panel Discussion with Nilesh Kshirsagar, Rohit Gupta, Shanmuga Priya Mishra, Priyanka Shukla, Sachin Jadhav, Vineet Mittal, Aarti Dongra- Facilitated by Santosh Mehrotra and Robert Chambers

The key outputs from this discussion are:



- Community is to be put in the front and center- when the community is empowered and motivated to change, things will happen. Top down approach will not work
- Sensitization of the higher officials also- it should be in the list of everybody's priority
- Go about the strategy that you believe in- think about it and go with conviction
- The district collector needs to be strong and work harder than others to inspire hard work from everyone else because this is a huge task and required dedicated efforts
- Hard for the team in Angul to accept that the funds should be given to the community- it was like giving their power away- The first village became ODF in a month and right now there are over 190 villages that are ODF
- Government officials can't do all of this on their own. Need to identify motivators from community level, train them and to be sent to the field for accelerating change and bringing further impact
- Result motivated incentive system upon achieving ODF
- On the subject of construction- community is empowered to decide if they would like to construct or have the GP construct it for them. The community is also empowered to take action against those that defecate in the open after the households all have toilets
- With more time, there is less focus- lets do nothing but focus on ODF for the next one year and achieve ODF by 2016 and not 2019.
- No generation wants to leave a bad legacy for the next generation
- The issue of national pride- your behavior is hurting the overall image of the country- the data is well established that the maximum number of open defecators in the world are in this country- the triggers are all there we just need to talk, make this connection with the community
- It is immaterial what strategy we use, but the idea and language, our machinery if they are believers; we need some examples to convert everyone towards the ODF stage. The branding of the campaign locally, then they feel that it is a district campaign- the stakes are very high
- The use of CSR funds, IEC funds- to create positive discrimination in the society
- Government machinery is not to be seen as providers but enablers of the community
- We focused on dignity and pride- huge issue of central Rajasthan- main point of the campaign
- Lay the emphasis on ODF- toilets will take care of themselves
- Ruthless in verification- if something is being fudged- block it immediately
- Keep the public representatives involved- there is no political representative who will not understand the implications of an ODF village- highlight the lowest worker- find such people and their voice will be much louder than anything else we do.



Santosh Mehrotra, Professor, Jawaharlal Nehru University

Taking to scale from individual to community in the village itself-

1. How do you address the poorest?

- The answers were, when the community is mobilized, the community gets together to provide for the poorest household or the disabled household.
 - Bureaucrats should stop seeing themselves as Providers but should see themselves as Enablers.
2. How do we communicate with the community as whole? How do we enthuse and mobilize the community?
 - We need to know the history of our district- examples of achievements within our area- remind the people that this is what your forefather's did- legacy to the next generation
 3. Taking it to scale at the state level and national level
 - Supply chain- many parts of our country, this is really missing
 - Political commitment – within a year can we still ensure supply chain is ensured
 - How do we use the media to make it into a state level issue, beyond a community issue?
 - I didn't hear something- about taking it to scale but then sustaining it- it doesn't talk about hygiene- breaking the oral-fecal transmission- how are you going to sustain the ODF status?
 - Exit policy – there is a second phase beyond this and there can essentially be no exit but a continuous process

Nipun Vinayak, Director Swacch Bharat Mission, Government of India- Reflections

- There is a shift from counting toilets to ODF communities
- Verification process of ODF – there can only be certain guidelines which have flown- we will be asked the states to put in some mechanism- to vet which GPs are ODF- this is not to dampen the spirit
- Basic monitoring tool- why Chhattisgarh is moving forward- because state government is asking how many ODF and not toilets. How can we put the data in the public domain- mechanism for verifying and validating ODF
- Swacch Bharat awards- what form should these take?
- Manpower and incentive structure- the states need to look at some processes also- let the states decide what type of manpower structure they would like
- MGNREGA- constraints in actual implementation- we would be very happy if there is an opinion on how to streamline both because we cant have two models
- Positive incentivisation- there are so many ways, what are those mechanisms and how can they be institutionalized?
- It's not about cash awards- how can we link them up with other development schemes? Which are the states that are coming up with these policies?
- How long do we keep it limited to individual initiatives of the collector?
- There is an issue of capacity building- only 1 knowledge links and 1 feedback foundations- big challenge on how to replicate these agencies- we need to look at capacity development holistically



- Each state should pick at least one organization who they believe in, like an ATI, KRC etc., and these agencies can be trained further- unless the state wants to use them, who is experienced in community led approaches, it is important
- Creating of capacities in each state is a 'shark'
- Do the states, which have RDD and PR, have performed better than PHED department? Where is this kind of evaluation and study- this is another 'shark'
- To conclude at the state level- these are the kind of support at the state level- this should be mainstreamed in the development agenda
- Allowing innovations- let districts also come up with some innovations- are the states allowing innovations, telling the collectors do your best in your two years, go ahead with innovations
- More workshops for cross learning and sharing
- Multilateral agencies- many right kind of push and messages come from these agencies- only request is that the kind of support can be concrete in terms of implementation as well- lets do it together- while targets are not the right thing- we must have a vision.



Learning and Sharing: State- wise Inputs

UP

1. We need to include politicians in workshops such as this
2. We need to organize these workshops in remote areas as well
3. Training programs at district, block, GP level

MP and Bihar:

1. Common learning platform- first forum was organized by MP and technical service partner; second was organized by Government of MP only
2. Exposure visits- intra state visit for the members of the community to visit different districts and blocks to understand the best practices
3. Sensitization of interdepartmental functionaries as well
4. Utilization of media.

What support do we need?

1. Choice of incentive utilization- right now its only linked to the incentive MIS
2. There should be an option to book the community level incentive disbursement as well
3. Health and hygiene is under the law and if we avoid this then we cant avoid the lawyer

Uttarakhand

1. IEC has been replaced by ICT – social media also
2. Document failure and unsuccessful initiatives as well
3. Political will

Jharkhand

1. We worked a lot over the last year and we have been successful also

2. ZP CEO and DMs conference- GSF was partner, also UNICEF has been working in the state
3. Correcting the baseline survey will need support from UNICEF, GSF and others

J&K

1. We have organized many awareness camps
2. What type of technology would be conducive for the temperature and environmental conditions that is prevalent there? What type of SLWM technologies are available
3. Demand has definitely increased across the state for toilets – this brings in issues of funding etc.

Sikkim

1. Exposure visits, workshops should be specific for different stakeholders- GP level to politicians and functionaries- religious heads, schools etc.
2. We did mistakes but we learnt from those mistakes as well
3. We learnt segregation, composting, and others regarding SWM and then we changed our strategies and we moved forward
4. We need CLTS training – innovative experts for triggering for SWM

West Bengal and Tamil Nadu -but not state specific comments

1. Using local icons; use of websites
2. We need to have fair and open sharing of our mistakes so we can help others from avoiding the same
3. Capacity building on documentation, monitoring and verification
4. Post ODF monitoring, verification and supervision
5. Shifting to EFMS- not just UCs

Chhattisgarh

1. CRPs as brand ambassadors and learning within the districts; social media and cross visits; workshops
2. The transition from assigning the mission to a different department, i.e. from PHED when the language was just about construction of toilets. Now that it is within RD department, it is about communities; the other lesson we are still trying to learn when trying to do things faster- looking at the mistakes made in NGP villages that have slipped back- to avoid the same in the future
3. Capacity building in different levels and for certain skills that is required; particularly to handle certain specific issues in the northern and southern parts of Chhattisgarh

Development Partners

It is important not just to look at the successes but also the failures, the one's that did not work, to reach out to them and to understand why they did not work. It is also important to have more local consultations for 'trickle up' of innovations, approaches that work. More people may be



inspired by ODF celebrations, inviting several stakeholders for these. The case studies available in this workshop need to be documented further to understand the broader issues at work and should be disseminated more widely. The Policy makers need to be triggered and State Level Workshops could be the forum for these to share small victories.

What are the incentives to capture learning? How do we incentivize this at various levels, so that the relevant lessons and processes may be captured at the right time and stakeholders understand what needs to be captured. There needs to be a better look at learning and data collection, a need to use data more at the local levels and bring about more of a recognition for the champions on the ground- such as the natural leaders. Knowledge-data-information is the key for effective learning and analytics to understand what's working. Development Partners' role in RALUs could be to collect data, converting it to knowledge leading to greater dissemination.

Reflections from Participants

On the morning of the second day participants were asked to select one key learning point from day one. Selection of Learning Points are given below:

'Let us make a revolution for Swacch to become an ODF India' - Swamikanta
'Unlearn' - Askhay
'Engagement of diverse set of stakeholders essential' - Preetha
'Have faith in the community: Their capacity; their integrity; their will' - Sachin Jadhav

'Trigger, enable and facilitate rather than delivering by yourself'
'Community ownership is the one and only key'
'Sustained behavioral change can only be achieved through active community participation and ownership' - Nileshkumar Kshirsagar

'Recognize natural leaders and involve them productively' - Sachin Jadhav
'We should not expect someone to be natural leader it should start from me' - Ibomch

'Little/small efforts lead to big change' - Dr. Ramjeet

'Toilet construction is not an end in itself, but an important step towards making a community ODF'- Abhishek

'Not only reporting of toilet construction, report the using it or not should be reported on' - Ibomcha Imphal

'ODF not counting toilets should be the objective'
'ODF – A necessity not luxury!' - Shanmuga Priya Mishra

'Very limited understanding of ODF is a concern' - Preetha, CLTS Foundation

'Importance of collective behavior change towards ODF'- Abhishek

'No exit policy' - Santosh. Mehrotra

'What after ODF?' -Satyen

'There is no success formula. You have to find your own way according to situation'-
Sachin Sakalie

'Cut and paste models not feasible – do not work well' - Anil Raj Rai

Feedback from Participants

Almost all participants reported they had learnt new ideas and innovations and were planning on sharing these learning in various different ways. Similar state-level workshops are being planned in West Bengal, Telangana and Madhya Pradesh. The vast majority agreed that the workshop was beneficial for their own work.

People attending were those performing well and not those struggling. People were disappointed by the lack of discussions on failures. It was felt that stories of failures would provide more opportunities for learning.

The forms also gave the opportunity for people to mention innovations, which were not mentioned in the workshop. This information has shown there are lots of other innovations and ideas being tried and tested across the country that need to be documented and shared.

Conclusion and Next Steps

- Desire to share success
- No incentive for learning but demand for Information (technology, IEC)
- Advocacy, learning and Influencing
- Blind Spots
 - a. Hygiene
 - b. Inclusion
 - c. Research
 - d. Reading
- Systematic and Institutionalized Learning
- Not eager to share failed initiatives or steps but recognize the need for discussing failures