

This work is licensed under a
Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-
NoDerivs 3.0 Licence.

To view a copy of the licence please see:
<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/3.0/>

THE SOCIAL FUNCTION OF FORMAL SCHOOLING: The views of Foster & the
Experience of Tanzania.

- David Coast. (1972)

Discussion Paper No. 128 - Univ. of Nairobi. I. D. S.
THE SOCIAL FUNCTION OF FORMAL SCHOOLING IN TANZANIA*

We are making great efforts to promote a new attitude in our schools. Everything possible must be done to replace the discredited values of competitive individualism by the cooperative socialist ideal.....

C.Y. Mgonja, Minister for National Education, Tanzania.

.....it is utopian to expect schools to undergo a major transformation of social function at the present stage of African development.

Philip Foster.

The Problem: Social Transformation and the Structure of Schools

The explicit and visible function of formal schooling is to transmit knowledge and skills by means of classroom instruction and to allocate those trained to appropriate employment. Schools however have a wider function in that they are vehicles of social mobility and also the setting where students learn broad principles of social conduct. Implicit in educational policy statements in East Africa is the view that these three functions are mutually reinforcing and jointly subordinate to the fundamental purposes and values of the emerging national societies. Thus it is widely proclaimed that education should be "relevant" not merely to self advancement and to the acquisition of individual expertise but also to fostering those attitudes and commitments appropriate for future social roles.¹ In even more grandiose terms education is pronounced to be the vehicle of "rural transformation" and "social and economic development."² Yet despite this comprehensive objective schooling in East Africa continues to be perceived and evaluated exclusively in terms of a single instructional function.³ Associated with this concentration upon instructional outcomes is a tendency for the response to the urgent demand for radical educational change to be concentrated in the area of curriculum content.⁴

There is certainly little indication that change in this area makes a contribution to say a more just, equitable or less colonial society, but equally lacking is much evidence of achievement of the narrow technical objective of curriculum change itself.⁵ This latter point is particularly important because it suggests that the instructional and social outcomes of schooling are much more closely inter-related than has perhaps been recognized. It may be that part of the key to educational innovation lies in greater understanding of the social function and structure of schools. On the basis of this assumption this paper examines one area of continuing uncertainty, namely the extent and mechanisms of the impact of formal schooling upon the attitudes and values of students.

Two distinct and seemingly contradictory lines of thought are apparent in theoretical discussion of the social effects of schooling. One view-point sees the school as the single most important instrument of socialization and stresses the influence of curricula and organizational features as the major determinants of student dispositions. A contrasting hypothesis suggests that student socialization is determined by adult expectations rooted in the wider social and economic context which are largely beyond the control of the school.⁶ An analogue of this theoretical debate is provided by the educational scene in East Africa. Educators lay increasing stress on curricula, teachers and organizational change as means of inculcating appropriate attitudes. Students by contrast seem to be influenced exclusively by external factors such as their perception of the employment market and the ability of their school to promote their status mobility. This paradox raises a fundamental question regarding the relationship between schools and society. To what extent and by what means are schools able to influence the outlook of their students, and hence lead in the diffusion of new attitudes and values, and to what extent are they bound to simply follow and reflect the dictates and priorities of the wider society? It is important to attempt to answer this question because of the faith of educators that schools can influence attitudes and values, and because the prospects for educational change are bound up with the answer.

Nowhere in Africa has faith in the transformative potential of formal schooling been more explicitly demonstrated than in Tanzania.

What is being attempted there is the adaption of the inherited western-shaped school system to achieve radical changes in the outlook of Tanzanian youth. Educational policy gives pre-eminence to altering the social function of schooling so that students come to regard it not merely as a means of skill training and personal advance but as a preparation for socialist service to the national community. The student is expected to go out into his society and personify and diffuse the new values acquired in schooling. Thus the goal of creating socialist citizens merges into the goal^{of} transforming society. Tanzania is the latest of those countries which have attempted to use their schools for massive directed culture change. The line of descent includes the attempt to create 'New Soviet Man'; the continuing transformation of political culture in Cuba, and educational policy in China.[?] Educational policy in Tanzania as in the three other countries is based on the assumption that undesirable attitudes are a consequence of particular characteristics of western schooling and that more appropriate dispositions can be achieved by means of the restructuring of school experience. Yet the reorganization of the school system in Tanzania is proceeding on the basis of very little empirical evidence to confirm that schools can be effectively adapted for social transformation on the scale envisaged and by the means suggested.

The central assumption of this paper is that systematic examination of Tanzania's attempt to get schools to perform a new social function can provide important insights into the wider conditions of successful educational change. As a start in this direction the paper attempts to apply what is known about educational effects in general to Tanzania's specific attempt to use schools to create socialist citizens. The purpose is firstly to permit a tentative assessment of the relative influence of school and society in determining student attitudes and secondly to identify some structural features of schools which may be important in this impact. The overarching objective is to derive implications for policies of educational

Schools and the Creation of Socialist Citizens.

The extent of educational innovation intended in Tanzania is best illustrated by a description of the type of citizen which schools are expected to produce. Outstanding characteristics of the official citizenship role are the explicitness with which its desired qualities have been specified, the wide range of qualities involved and the whole heartedness with which their rapid inculcation is being attempted. Examination of policy statements reveals that two distinct types of individual capacity are implicit in the officially expected citizenship role. Firstly citizenship in Tanzania assumes the acquisition of qualities necessary for any national polity. In this aspect the role demands capacities permitting participation in, and prior allegiance to, institutions which extend beyond the confines of kinship, tribe and church. These are the qualities which are prominent in the voluminous literature on nation building and modernization.⁸ However official criteria of citizenship in Tanzania go far beyond these capacities and suggest a more encompassing relationship between the individual and the nation than is usually treated in the literature. A particularly explicit statement of these criteria can be found in the opening pages of the primary school syllabus for political education.⁹ Listed in parallel columns are the twenty four qualities of the 'good' and the 'bad' citizens. The 'good citizen' has not only the familiar duties of obeying the law, paying his taxes and understanding national politics. He is also expected to work hard at cooperative tasks, to be conscientious at seeing jobs through to their conclusion, to eat sensible food, and to eschew gambling and laziness! It is thus clear from the official model that citizenship in Tanzania does not simply, describe ^{the} minimum civil rights and social responsibilities of new nationals. The concept 'mwananchi' is an inclusive call to action inviting people to merge individual qualities with national purposes in almost every aspect of their daily life.¹⁰ The defining principle of the socialist strand of Tanzanian citizenship is the notion of social service: the willingness to yield self-interest for the collective cause of national development. The distinction between the two types of citizenship which has been made

is important because, as will be shown, they may be differentially amenable to the impact of the school. However it is an article of faith among Tanzanian educators that schools can inculcate both types. This faith has been proclaimed in Education for Self Reliance and in a number of subsequent policy statements Schools are expected not only to:

.....inculcate a sense of commitment to the total community and help the pupils to accept the values appropriate to our kind of future, not those appropriate to our colonial past' but also... to 'emphasize cooperative endeavour, not individual advancement... stress concepts of equality and the responsibility to give service.....'¹¹

Having outlined Tanzania's faith in the social function of formal schooling we can turn to consider some factors relevant to its implementation.

The 'Inevitable' Effect of Schooling

It is one of the best documented principles of social science that an individual's educational attainment is one of the strongest single predictors of some of his most fundamental attitudes and values. The cross national studies of Kehl and Inkeles go beyond this to conclude that education has a substantially similar effect on its participants in different countries.¹² In summary their argument is that formal schooling induces an attitudinal syndrome which they characterize as 'modernity'. On the one hand this principle lends support to Tanzania's assumption that schools are important in the formation of social values. On the other hand by postulating a common and universal effect of schooling the principle implies a limitation on the possibility of controlling that impact.

Two different explanations have been advanced to account for the allegedly common impact of education. The first suggests that the common effect is due to the unique pattern of organizational properties and derivative social experience which is provided by all schools in all places. In other words schools as a distinctive type of institution may provide certain collective experiences which shape their members' expectations in a common way. The general principle behind this view has been enunciated thus:

.....
.....men's environments, as expressed in the institutional patterns they adopt or have introduced to them; shape their experiences and through this their perceptions, attitudes and values, in standardized ways which are manifest from country to country, despite the countervailing and randomizing influence of traditional cultural patterns.¹³

The implications of this viewpoint have been synthesized into an apocalyptic creed by Ivan Illich. He proclaims that all types of institutional schooling have a 'hidden curriculum'—whereby knowledge is valued as property associated with status— which overwhelms the possibility of any other significant learning taking place.¹⁴

A glance at Tanzanian schools suggests that whatever impact is bound up with the universal institutional nature of formal schooling is a feature in some measure of the Tanzanian variety. Tanzanian schools share with schools everywhere a distinctive pattern of organizational properties: schools are buildings in which pupils are contained for the major portion of each day: pupils of similar age are assembled in groups of between thirty and fifty in a classroom where they are under the authority of a certified adult; they are subject to a regular rotational sequence of daily and weekly activities and at the end of a year are promoted to the next level of activities; above all the classroom is a place of public performance and collective sanction where students are differentiated in terms of their academic achievement. There can be little doubt that the modal characteristics and sequential nature of formal schooling in Tanzania, as elsewhere, provide a unique type of experience. Precisely what is learned from the invariable structure of the school beyond the acquisition of knowledge and skill is an empirical question. Fortunately we have Tanzanian data pertaining to this question and they are presented in table 1 below. That the pattern demonstrated in table 1 can be attributed to educational exposure and not age is confirmed by the fact that the differences remain when age is controlled against years of schooling and disappear when amount of schooling is held constant and the independent effect of age is examined.¹⁵

The Cumulative Effect of Formal Schooling
upon aspects of the Citizenship Role.

	F o r m		
	II	IV	VI
% who believe that a student may sometimes know more than his teacher	50%	68%	85%
% who report a low degree of civic idealism	58%	74%	79%
% who report frequent participation in political discussion	29%	34%	51%
% who favour the idea of student community service	70%	64%	58%
% with social rather than individualistic orientation	76%	66%	54%
% who prefer to live in a rural area rather than in a town or city	45%	31%	23%
(N.100%)	(411)	(380)	(242)

A pattern of cumulative school impact across a range of attitudes and reported behaviours is apparent. The longer a student stays in school the more intense do certain dispositions, relating to both types of citizenship value identified earlier, become. Prolonged exposure to formal schooling intensifies qualities of self-confidence, independence and participation as indicated in the pattern of responses to questions asking respondents about the amount of their participation in political discussion, their assessment of the fallibility of teachers and their civic idealism. This pattern summarised in the first three lines of the table implies school inducement of some typical qualities of the alleged 'modernity' syndrome which are also part of official expectation in Tanzania. However the remaining pattern of responses summarised in the table suggest a school effect which is much less supportive of Tanzania's socialist aspirations. Exposure to western schooling is associated with decreased willingness to engage in community service, to live in rural areas and to include the promotion of national welfare as a criterion in career motivation. Such outcomes conflict with the principles of devotion to equality, self sacrifice and rural development which are part of socialist citizenship in Tanzania. The important point being illustrated is that to the extent that the institutional effect is inevitable, and its lessons are not congruent with Tanzania objectives, there is a limitation on the achievement of these objectives. Education may indeed make men 'modern', but 'modernity', at least as identified by western social scientists, is not the

of Tanzania policy. The extreme implication of this point is that any different objective can only be achieved by the dis-establishment of formal schooling.

The Uncontrollable Influence of Social Context

The view advanced in the previous section, precludes the possibility that schools may differ along significant dimensions or may affect different members in different ways. A (second) broad explanation for the substantially common effect of education allows for differences between types of school but still rules out the possibility that this impact can be controlled from within the school. This approach stresses that the effect of education is not so much a product of any organizational features of schools but rather the result of status considerations consequent upon attainment of a given level and type. An educated or rather a certificated person has different social expectations and hence a different outlook on society and his role in it than his uncertificated or less certificated fellow. This view point stresses society as a whole rather than the schools themselves as the source of student attitudes. Empirical evidence is beginning to illustrate this view point by showing ways in which the impact of schools on student attitudes is conditioned by the nature of societal expectations which apply to the education system and within it to particular schools and types of individual. Somerset for instance has shown how the social reputation of certain schools in Kenya overrides the influence of individual ability in determining a student's occupational aspirations.¹⁶ Meanwhile Mbilinyi's work in Tanzania implies that the effect of schools on the aspirations of girls is largely a function of the constricting social definition of females in Tanzanian society.¹⁷ Speculation beyond the East African evidence suggests that the impact of a given school on member attitudes is a derivative of the type of future which the school is generally perceived to confer.¹⁸

Artistic
Maru

Philip Foster is perhaps the most articulate advocate of the view that schools must follow their society and cannot be used instrumentally to initiate changes of social attitude as envisaged in Tanzania.¹⁹ Writing with specific reference to Tanzania he argues that schools cannot be expected to transmit notions of social duty in a society where elite privileges accrue to education.

In such a situation he claims society and school inevitably complement each other in transmitting notions of individualism and competitive effort and that these inevitably subvert any egalitarian objectives of the educational programme. He cites his West African studies and the inability of Russian education to create 'New Soviet Man' in prophesying failure for Tanzania's educational policy. His prophesy is based on the view that Tanzania's schools have become functionally interwoven in a largely irreversible pattern of development, inaugurated by colonial rule. 'Under these circumstances, he contends, 'attempts to effect a major transformation of the functional relationships between the schools and the broader social structure are likely to meet with limited success.'²⁰

Again in the Tanzanian scene one can identify much to support the Foster thesis, in that vestiges of colonial society have had, and continue to have, a strong influence on student expectations. For example educational demand is still a demand for the kind which in colonial times was perceived to provide its recipients with the best material prospects, i.e., academic schooling certified by examination. Furthermore there are signs that parental expectations of financial and status returns to education have a significant influence upon student outlook. The plea of university students who demonstrated against the requirements of national service in 1966 was their need to gain what they saw as their just reward for their years of school, in order to pay back the investment of their parents in them. Mbilinyi's study, referred to earlier, shows how an investment philosophy still guides parental decisions on the allocation of scarce school fees between boys and girls. The manifest interest which parents continue to attach to national examinations implies that schooling is still perceived in terms of social mobility. These perceptions are hardly surprising, as they reflect a fairly accurate response to the prevailing reward structure which continues to favour the most educated. Occupations are still defined largely according to education, and income increases geometrically with level attained. Nyerere has drawn attention to the power of societal expectation in Tanzania:

.....he (the student) will often find that his parents and relatives support his own conception of his difference and regard it as wrong that he should live and work as the ordinary person he really is. For the truth is that many of the people in Tanzania have come to regard education as meaning that a man is too precious for the rough and hard life which the masses of our people still live.²¹

Edson's
summary #

Part of the picture which is visible in Tanzania is that of stridently explicit Government expectations set off against tacit but strongly held family and student expectations. The Government assumes that schools will inculcate attitudes of socialist commitment and rural orientation. Many parents still treat the same schools as vehicles of individual mobility for their children and family investment. In this situation the continuing task before the Tanzanian government becomes that of changing the terms of educational demand by altering the status expectations associated with levels of schooling or certification. As expectations tend to reflect the reality of opportunities open to students their alteration seems more likely to come from manipulation of the wage and prestige differentials associated with particular occupations than through direct action in schools. The reduction of civil servant salaries after the 1966 student demonstration was an early recognition of this fact. Subsequent measures making income tax more progressive, the Leadership Code and the curtailing of private property ownership are similarly aimed at the reduction of elite privileges. The ultimate objective is to develop social incentives to education which replace the conventional expectations of wage employment and its associated status.

The argument so far supports the conclusion that the instrumental use of schools for socialization is limited by their existing institutional properties and by the nature of the societal expectations which apply to them. For Foster the inequalities of access and elitist mentality consequent upon a highly selective colonial-inspired education system are inevitable and indeed functional. He therefore holds out little encouragement to Tanzania's attempt to promote egalitarian dispositions among students, because he does not believe that formal schooling can be used independently to alter student expectations. Yet Tanzania continues to pursue a policy of adapting school structures for the purpose of transforming social attitudes. The outlook for this strategy would seem to depend on the extent to which Foster's analysis has overstated the inflexibility of schools. Critical scrutiny of this analysis gives a number of grounds for the view that schools are not entirely powerless to contribute to social change.

Variability in School Social Structure and Impact

Those who conclude that schooling has an inevitable and uncontrollable impact — place great emphasis upon a single aspect of school socialisation i.e., its impact on occupational and status expectations. From a demonstrated association between such expectations and educational attainment they have inferred a general and uncontrollable impact upon student values. However while status expectations constitute an important area of self-image there is yet no empirical reason for believing that they are entirely encompassing of a student's outlook. There may be a range of socializing consequences of schools which cannot be subsumed under a particular status expectation effect and which furthermore may be subject to the internal influence of the school social structure. A given status expectation is compatible with a variety of orientations. For example the desire, engendered by schooling, to occupy an important position in the State Trading Corporation is compatible with both a sense of social responsibility or irresponsibility along a dimension which is central to the official citizenship role in Tanzania. As a consequence of the decision to use the inherited formal school system for socialization Tanzanian students are inevitably an elite in the sense that they are given special treatment and singled out for a special task. However the content of the citizenship concept which students take with them to elite positions is not wholly a function of particular status expectations. Thus for Tanzania 'the really crucial question facing schools is how to develop an elite that has not got a corresponding elitist mentality'.²²

A related criticism of the "inevitable effect" thesis concerns its underestimation of students' ability to reconcile seemingly opposed expectations in their definition of an integrated role. We have implied that Tanzanian students are subject to conflicting demands. For example the official citizenship demand stresses equality and the obligations of service while the lessons of the economic reward structure, reinforced by the fundamental nature of formal schooling, emphasize individual elitism and competitiveness. Yet there is some reason for believing that Tanzanian students have a much greater ability to tolerate different perspectives in a single view than is allowed by Foster, although little is known

about the extent to which the internal social structures of schools are significant in this process.²³

Foster tends to invest his predictions with a stamp of global or at least continental inevitability. To argue that the ability of schools to initiate social transformation is contingent upon their society reaching a certain stage of development is, at the national level, to raise legitimate questions about the nature of a society and its schools. But to assume a 'present stage of African development' and that the pace of advance from it is determined by a common colonial inheritance seems to be invoking a continental determinism by assigning all African countries a common destiny.²⁴ The success of Tanzania's divergent course is a test of the hypothesis. But the extent of present differences in school structure at least implies that the latitude for successful national experimentation may be greater than allowed by Foster.

At the national level the view that schools can only follow and reflect their society implies a static and one way relationship between the educational and social systems of a country. Even if the direction of the relationship is conceded the extent and rapidity with which schools are able to follow the priorities of the wider society are not absolute or inevitable functions. At the very least the speed of response to societal imperatives is contingent upon features of school organization, procedure and social structure. Status expectations are the type of social attitudes most subject to the reality of the opportunity and prestige patterns outside the school. Yet even in this area, as Somerset as shown, student preceptions of reality are subject to factors operating within the school, namely the nature of the careers guidance service.²⁵

One can agree with Foster that the use of schools to achieve certain types of social objective is unlikely to be successful unless the objectives are rooted in corresponding social change outside the school. It may well be that socialist society in Tanzania has to reach a threshold of strength, institutionalization or acceptance before schools can begin to complement or supplement the socialist course. Our argument is that when this state is reached what happens inside schools has an important effect upon student attitudes and hence on social change. Foster's analysis

has little to say about the response of schools when the society itself begins to change. In Tanzania social transformation is underway. Socialist objectives have been defined and a socialist institutional framework established. If, as seems the case, schools are already lagging behind their society in Tanzania the important issue becomes not that broached by Foster of why they are unable to lead, but in what respects they need to be restructured so that they are better able to follow.

It is important to emphasize that the existence of unique structural changes in the schools of Tanzania is not itself evidence for any correspondingly distinctive impact. Foster does not deny the possibility of major structural changes in Tanzanian schools. He simply questions that they can have the egalitarian consequences hoped for. Indeed the centrally directed changes in the organization of Tanzanian schools — compared with those of Kenya — provide a continuing example of what is possible in terms of changing the inherited structures of colonial education. They do not however define the consequences of those changes. In questioning some of Foster's arguments we have implied that there is an area of school impact which is not an inevitable effect of basic institutional characteristics or external societal expectations, but is a product of systematic alterable features of school social structure. However it is easier to produce marginal criticisms of an otherwise significant statement, than it is to identify which aspects of school social structure have what effects. The weight of evidence seems to support the universalist case which has been outlined, but it is important to ask if there is any evidence to support the prospects of Tanzania as a successfully divergent case.

Social Structure and Citizenship in Tanzanian Schools.

The second part of the paper introduces some dimensions of school social structure relevant to Tanzania's objective of creating socialist citizens and presents some evidence appropriate to an assessment of their significance. Five areas are discussed:-

- a) the formal instructional setting including the role of teachers and curriculum.
- b) the social isolation of schools
- c) the composition of student membership.

- 14 -

These dimensions are chosen because they are prominent in the theoretical literature on school impact and because they are all dimensions which are within the control of educational policy makers in Tanzania. Furthermore they are areas on which some descriptive and empirical evidence for Tanzania is available. The empirical findings presented here are drawn from a continuing study of education and social transformation in Tanzania. It is important to emphasize that they are used here simply to illustrate speculation and not to build a comprehensive case which is the objective of the study from which they derive.²⁶

Formal Structure

The clarity of Tanzania's goals and the vigour of her educational policies over the past five years tend to give a misleading impression of the extent to which relationships between specific school practices and student outcomes are understood. Changes intended to implement 'Education for Self Reliance' are familiar. They initially centred on curricula aspects of school experience and aimed to eliminate the colonial character of Tanzanian education. They have included the more intensive use of Swahili, the achievement of virtual self sufficiency in pre-university teachers, the removal of foreign references from school names, the localization of the syllabus content, at all levels and the introduction of cooperative agriculture, political education, paramilitary drills and defence training. These changes undoubtedly amount to a major nationalization of education in Tanzania in the sense of removing the most visible excesses of inherited colonial practice. It is likely too that they have contributed to a corresponding nationalization in the frame of reference of students. Less certain however are the ways in which changes in the instructional setting contribute positively to the new social function intended for schools in Tanzania, i.e., the creation of a sense of socialist service. The achievement of a sense of cultural autonomy and of socialist commitment are not synonymous products although the first is probably a pre-requisite for the second.

That there is less certainty than is often implied in policy rhetoric over what changes contribute to what results is suggested by a number of recent educational debates. Examples are the debate over whether there can be 'socialist' mathematics,²⁷ the nature of socialist leadership training following the renaming of

the former Tabora School, and the issue of whether prizes for individual academic achievement are a useful spur to intellectual excellence or foster an undesirable individualism. Similarly the nature of opposition to the former Development Studies course at the University of Dar Es Salaam is perhaps indicative of limitations to the mobilizing potential of exhortation.²⁹ In short it is difficult amid the welter of innovation in formal structures to distinguish those changes which contribute to national awareness and self confidence, i.e., aspects of national citizenship and those which lead to a strengthening of the socialist character of citizenship. The recent decision on examinations is a particularly good example of this point. The removal of Cambridge from any influence over the content of study and the allocation of students in Tanzania is a significant step towards national self reliance in education. The more difficult question which remains is the role of examinations themselves and criteria of selection which are relevant to the development of socialist aspirations.³⁰ Since access to successive levels of education is restricted, and the rewards of access high, selection examinations have an all pervasive influence in schools which is independent of the content or national origin of the examinations. Their purpose as presently constituted is to differentiate people on one particular criterion — i.e., academic achievement — and the lesson they tend to inspire is that rewards go to those whose individual achievement in this restricted sphere is greatest. It is interesting to note that in China formal examinations are castigated as 'launching sudden attacks on the students' mentality' and are dispensed with as a basis of selection.³¹

The main conclusion of the theoretical literature on school impact is that the informal features of schooling experience are more important than formal instruction in the development of social values.³² Thus while it is widely believed that teachers transmit social values to their students there is very little evidence to document this notion. A similar inconclusiveness characterizes research attempts to link exposure to specific curricula with subsequent student attitudes. There is yet no indication from Tanzania to contradict these general findings. This is not to conclude that political education and curriculum change are unimportant, but simply

nationalist citizenship — may be misplaced. At the same time it raises the possibility that the major sources of socialist citizenship values lie outside the classroom in the complex social structure of the school.³³

The informal social structure

The formal structures of colonial schooling are relatively amenable to central fiat, but those which are strategic in the achievement of socialist citizenship are perhaps less formal and less accessible. The Minister of National Education acknowledges this fact when he points out that the inculcation of socialist orientations requires the achievement of an entirely new socialist environment in schools:

It remains for us to ensure not only that our courses really provide the expertise needed, but also that the school itself is a living model of the ideal community to which we wish trained students to return.³⁴

As formal schooling — the chosen weapon of social transformation in Tanzania — is itself a product of the colonial inheritance the consequent strategy of adaption must be predicated on a distinction between the important and the superficial characteristics of the inherited social structure of schools.

1). Social Isolation

Prominent among theories of school impact is the notion that the more isolated students are from surrounding society the greater the ability of the school to socialize them in a given direction. The argument has been summarized thus:

The intensity of any socialization experience is probably related to the degree of separation, for separated settings are able to reduce potentially conflicting influences.³⁵

Many of Tanzania's schools at the secondary level are boarding schools and share many of the characteristics of the "total institution."³⁶ However, if physical isolation is itself a significant feature one would expect that students from boarding schools would differ markedly in their attitudes from day school students. A comparison of the two found very little difference across a wide range of attitudes.³⁷ It would thus appear that

residence in school is not itself the significant factor which is often claimed. Probably much more important in its impact on nascent socialist citizenship is the extent to which school experience, whether boarding or day, is integrated into a range of meaningful community activities. There is little evidence to suggest what types of integrative activity are crucial, but the example of China is persuasive. In China educational institutions are conceived as intrinsic segments of the social infrastructure. Attempts are made to implement this conception by insistence that throughout the educational tiers all students spend some time working on the land or in factories.³⁸ In Tanzania it appears that despite interesting intentions, attempts to integrate school and community especially at post primary levels - have got little beyond such token measures as open days and brief vacation stints in Ujamaa villages. There is little to suggest that such experiences make any inroad into the overwhelming impact of the conventional regularities of formal schooling.

2). Social Composition of Schools

It is a well documented principle of social psychology that attitudes and values are nourished and sometimes created through group membership.

The importance of student peer groups in the development of individual attitudes is familiar to teachers and researcher alike.³⁹ Particularly influential in the learning of important social values is the degree of homogeneity of school peer groups on a significant background characteristic such as sex, social class, tribe and religious affiliation. The process has been described thus:

A persons contacts with other individuals affect his way of viewing the social and political world. The composition of a student body can aid in the development of community identification or prevent it. It can help create inter-group cooperation and harmony, or isolation and conflict.⁴⁰

Tanzanian schools continue to differ markedly in both ethnic and religious homogeneity. To the extent that either of these ascribed characteristics is associated with dispositions inimical to the qualities of socialist citizenship we would expect such qualities to be less strongly held in homogeneous than in heterogeneous schools. In order to investigate this issue the study of Tanzanian students compared two groups of Catholic students who

were similar in all respects except that one group had attended exclusively Catholic schools while the other had attended schools which were religiously heterogeneous in their membership.⁴¹

A similar comparison was made for Protestant students. Responses to three questions from the study can be used to illustrate the point we are making. The first asked students to indicate on a four point scale how important it was for them to marry someone of their own religion, i.e., an issue which is close to their religious identification. The second question asked whether they thought students should assist in self help projects during their vacation i.e., a question not directly relevant to their religion but bearing centrally on the service ethic of Tanzanian socialist citizenship. A third question similarly probed students' sense of self reliance by asking them to weigh dependence upon government assistance against personal effort as means of improving their standard of life.⁴² The table below summarises the responses:

The effect of Religious Composition of Schools upon three aspects of Citizenship

	<u>Catholics</u>		<u>Protestants</u>	
	<u>School composition</u>		<u>School composition</u>	
	Homo- geneous	Hetero- geneous	Homo- geneous	Hetero- geneous
% who attach little or no importance to marrying a co-religionary	21%	40%	24%	37%
% who favour the idea of student community service	54%	69%	64%	72%
% who rank high on self reliance	50%	63%	54%	62%
(N. 100%)	(167)	(72)	(58)	(102)

As one might expect both Catholics and Protestants in the religiously homogeneous schools attach significantly greater importance to marrying a co-religionary than their fellows in schools where the religious composition is more varied. Much more interesting however is the fact that a similar pattern of responses is found for the questions bearing on social service and self reliance.

The strong inference is that the social composition of a school influences a student's emerging concept of a socialist citizenship role.

The evidence of this and other tables not presented here would appear to confirm the wisdom of current policies in Tanzania which aim to establish greater religious and ethnic balance in school composition than previously existed.

3). Extra curricular participation

Another type of experience inside schools which is thought to relate to a student's concept of citizenship is the extent to which the school provides opportunities for participation in activities which require qualities they are expected to assume. The process has been described thus:

Attitudes and beliefs leading to both extensive and diffuse behavioral change are best shaped by participation in those institutions where direction social suggestion and peer group pressures are greatest.⁴³

Yet again despite the substantial faith of educators in the socially redeeming quality of various types of extra curricula activity there is little solid evidence to connect specific types of participation with a subsequent attitude or value. Mazrui has proclaimed that in East African schools participation in the debating society is an important way of acquiring the qualities of 'team work, tolerance and toil'.⁴⁴ This assertion seems to owe more to autobiographical fervour than to representative evidence. In the Tanzanian study the effect of student participation in the debating society and the Tanu Youth League was examined. The interesting conclusion from analysis is that the influential factor in predicting certain salient citizenship attitudes is not individual participation but the formal political atmosphere of the school. The point can be illustrated by quoting the distribution of responses on a social trust scale which was intended as a measure of the extent to which respondents felt able to trust and therefore co-operate with various identifiable groups of fellow citizens in the country.⁴⁵ It can be taken to be an indicator of Mazrui's notion of 'tolerance' and of a virtue central to the role of socialist citizens in Tanzania. The results

Trust Organizational Membership and Social
Trust Organizational Membership

	<u>Debating Society</u>	<u>TANU Youth League</u>	<u>Both</u>	<u>Neither</u>
<u>Social Trust</u>				
High	31%	56%	39%	43%
Low	69%	44%	61%	57%
(N. 100%)	(190)	(160)	(55)	(205)

The significant percentage difference between the TYL and the Debating Society members seems to suggest that the school organization to which a student belongs may be an important determinant of certain citizenship dispositions or vice versa. Commitment to and participation at the school level in the nationalist political organization may inculcate a stronger sense of citizenship than participation in the more academic pursuits of the Debating Society. However the relatively high scores of members of neither organization counsel against unquestioning acceptance of this interpretation. Closer examination of the membership pattern for each school in the sample revealed that TYL membership was concentrated in a number of schools. The possibility implicit in this fact is that the apparent influence of TYL membership is in reality the impact of the formal political atmosphere of the school where the TYL is prominent.

By dividing schools between those where the TYL is strong and those where it is non-existent or relatively weak, and looking again at individual membership, it is possible to investigate this alternative hypothesis.⁴⁵

The relationship between individual membership in the TANU Youth League and Social Trust when strength of School TYL is taken into account.

	<u>Membership in TYL</u>	
	<u>Member</u>	<u>Non Member</u>
<u>School strength of TYL</u>		
<u>Strong</u>	57% (154)	57% (86)
<u>Weak</u>	38% (21)	43% (115)

As is clear from the above table the effect of individual membership disappears when the strength of the TYL in a school is taken into account.

in schools where the TYL is strong members do not differ from non members in their social trust. It seems reasonable to conclude that membership of the organization is not itself a determining influence. A vertical reading of this table reveals the corollary that the strength of their TYL seems to be an important factor distinguishing schools. In other words the important variable is a school culture factor rather than an individual level factor.

Probably the presence of an active TYL has itself a casual influence upon students' citizenship role but neither this table nor other available evidence permits this inference. We cannot separate the effect of the TYL as a specific casual factor and as an indicator of the level of politicization of the school. Knowledge of the individual schools involved suggests that a strong TYL is the most important among a number of ingredients of politicization. Other factors might be a vigorously socialist Headmaster, contacts with the outside Party, Self Help schemes within the school and Nation Building schemes outside it. Further work is needed to specify which factors combine to raise the politicization level of a school and what the relative effect of each is on student outlook. The scanty data presented here at least does not refute the view of Tanzanian policy makers that a politicized school is the appropriate environment for the development of committed citizens or the utility of a vigorous TYL in such a task.

4). The administrative and authority structure of schools

As Tanzania's schools are intended to exemplify the self-reliant socialist community it is clearly important to distinguish which features of the administrative and authority structure are most congruent with socialist objectives. The point has been strongly made with regard to the university of Dar es Salaam:

What kind of social structure exists at the University?
How do decisions get made? Who makes them? What values guide them? Are all the different strata of the social structure involved in making the decisions?
What is the nature of the hiring and the promotions policy with regards members of staff, (i.e., what kind of behaviour is rewarded within the University system?)
What kind of reward-punishment system operates for students?
In all this investigation the essential question must be,

Similar questions apply to the administrative structure of Tanzanian schools. One might ask for example what effect the World-Bank inspired introduction of student lockers is having on the concept of property of budding student socialists. Two very visible features of the inherited system seem to be particularly relevant to the attempt to achieve a socialist school environment: Prefects and Houses. The House and Prefect systems are the twin pillars of the administrative and authority structure of the inherited colonial model. It is conceivable that they have a correspondingly significant influence in the development of a student's sense of citizenship.⁴⁸ The question which arises is whether a hierarchical and authoritarian prefect system is the most appropriate form of self government for an embryonic socialist community. A similar question is whether the House or similar administrative divisions do not promote exclusiveness and fragmentation rather than the corporate spirit of unity and responsibility which is being sought from students in Tanzania. In the absence of any suggestive data on this dimension we can do little more here than raise what seem to be pertinent questions.

The foregoing section has identified four broad dimensions of school social structure in Tanzania and assembled some evidence suggesting that differences between schools on these dimensions may be associated with particular student dispositions. As these dimensions are all within the control of policy makers they would seem to be strategic areas of 'leverage' in the drive to create a school socialist environment.

Conclusion: Social Structure and Educational Change

The objective of this paper has been, by examining the case of Tanzania, to increase understanding of the capacity of schools for performing a new social function. Its method has been to contrast two distinctive views about the extent and means of the social impact of schools. The one view, exemplified in the writing of Foster, proclaims that as schools are part of an elaborate economic and social context they cannot have an independent effect upon the attitudes and values of their students. The alternative view is evident in the faith of Tanzanian educators

that schooling can be used to initiate comprehensive socialization. In Tanzania the two hypotheses have their reference points in the two main types of expectation to which students are subject. On the one hand a student's perception of his future role is influenced by expectations engendered by the social and economic context and expressed most forcibly by parents and relatives. Pitted against these are expectations emanating from Government, defining a comprehensive set of attitudes and behaviours required of socialist citizens, which are intended for inculcation through the school.

Intellectual perversity alone would suggest that the actual capability of schools for performing a prescribed social function lies somewhere between the instrumental view of Tanzanian policy makers and the Educational Darwinianism of Foster. Our survey of Tanzanian experience suggests that reality and hence complexity is being obscured by the extremism of the alternative view points. In both obscurity stems from an over-simplified view of the social structure of schools and from their perception of the social outcomes of schooling as an all-inclusive package of attitudes values and commitments. For Foster the contents of the package are all derivatives of externally inspired status expectations. For Tanzanian policy makers the social structure of the school is infinitely malleable while for Foster it can be manipulated but not controlled. The evidence assembled in this paper is sufficient to challenge belief in a one way and all-inclusive pattern of interaction between schools and their society. We have suggested that the two main types of expectation to which a student is subject are perhaps not as mutually exclusive as has been claimed. Beyond this our principal point of emphasis has been that the socialization process in which these expectations are forged into a perception of a future role is determined in large measure by the variable social structure of the school.

The argument that social learning is determined by a school structure which can be altered is to conjure up Orwellian possibilities of social manipulation. However it is important to emphasize that an influential school social structure is just as much a product of action as of inaction. Inaction in the Tanzania case implies the perpetuation of an inherited structure of education based on premises

... objectives.

The assumption of this paper has been that change based on maximum knowledge is the desirable situation. It is appropriate to conclude considering a few implications of what has been said for general educational change.⁴⁹

In the first place the assumption that the social structure of schools has a determining influence on their impact places the burden of responsibility for educational innovation inside rather than outside the school. Educational policy makers are not at the mercy of immutable institutional forms or intangible economic and social forces. This is not to say that educational innovations merely awaits the necessary will. The sad history of most educational innovations testifies to the presence of powerful factors inhibiting change. Our main conclusion is that the complexity of the school social structure is greater than is readily acknowledged and that this is a major factor impeding successful change.

Tanzania is one of the only African countries which is attempting serious educational change. It is confronting the fact that the inherited way of doing things reflects considerations that have little or nothing to do with the intended object of creating socialist citizens. It is daring to imagine alternative means to the achievement of its newly defined objectives. Successful change requires that intended outcomes are clear, that acceptable criteria exist for assessing whether these outcomes have been achieved, and above all that a clear concept exists of the relationship between a desired outcome and the process of change which leads to it. As shown at the beginning of this paper the objectives and priorities of educational policy in Tanzania are clearly defined and acceptable criteria of evaluation are almost self evident. The analysis of this paper leads to the conclusion that what is most lacking is understanding of the relationship between a desired outcome and the process of change which can produce it. The reason for this vulnerability in Tanzania, as elsewhere, is because not enough is known about the realities of the social structure of schools and the ways in which it conditions the attempts at social and technical innovation. In this respect the clarity of Tanzania's objectives constitutes a danger in suggesting that there is a correspondingly simple and single route to given goals. To have any chance of success educational policy has to take into account the complexities of the school social structure — its informal as well as its formal aspects — some of which have been emphasized in this

paper. Because knowledge and understanding of their working are limited policy cannot be 'clean' and single channelled, but must be flexible to unfolding understanding. The danger is that faith, good intentions and administrative fiat become substitutes for the objective monitoring of educational change and the implementation of a flexible course towards well defined objectives.

This paper has attempted to illustrate the utility of combining even sketchy theory and experience as a way of increasing understanding of the complexity of school social structures. Although only the surface has been scratched attention has drawn to four of the more visible dimensions of the school social structure. The more general lesson to be drawn from this illustrative exercise is the need for policy itself to infuse experience with a theory of educational change. The elements of such a theory for the Tanzanian context are not complex esoteric abstractions but simple practical guidelines. On the basis of what has been said four elements of such a theory or framework seem particularly important: a) the need to take maximum possible account of unfolding knowledge of the social structure of schools, b) the need to formulate changes in such a way that available criteria can be applied to assess whether and when they realise their intended outcome, c) the need to base structural changes on some concept of the relationship between that change and the outcome it is intended to produce, d) the need, implicit in the previous three points, to take account of all possible alternative routes to the desired outcome. Operating within such a framework is perhaps one of the best ways of minimizing the extent to which educational policy is determined by personal opinion, political rhetoric or good intentions.

Implicit in almost everything that has been said is an assertion of faith in the utility of social science research for educational policy and a suggested area of needed research. The general need stems from the requirement that the theory of educational change just mentioned be rooted in empirical fact and be open to a constant flow of careful research evidence on what is actually happening in schools. The point has been summarised elsewhere: 'The behavioral study of an institutional situation must precede deciding whether or not that situation accomplishes the desired ends'.⁵⁰ The more specific research required is again fairly

evident from the preceding argument and the very tentativeness of our substantive conclusions. It is clear that little is known about the range of social outcome of schooling and the relationship of different outcomes to each other. For instance it is clear that status and occupational expectations are a consequence of schooling. To the extent that they are important in a student's self image they are likely to relate to a wider range of attitudes and values. In deciding exactly what is learned in school we can begin to specify what aspects of school social structure are particularly relevant and what types of structural change relate to given objectives. Because Tanzania is engaged in change much can be learned from the accumulation of systematic data on its experience. By tracing the history of individual and aggregate innovations important understanding should emerge concerning the conception, initiation and implementation of change and more generally the potential of East African schools for breaking away from the inherited colonial mould to perform a new and constructive social function.

FOOTNOTES

* This is a slightly revised version of a paper presented at the 1971 Universities of East Africa Social Science Conference Kampala, Dec. 1971.

- 1 See for example The Republic of Kenya Development Plan 1970-74, Nairobi Government Printer, 1969.
- 2 That such pronouncements are the daily bread of the Ministerial speaking circuit can be seen in a glance at any East African Newspaper. The most recent Universities of East Africa educational conference had as its theme 'The Role of Teacher Education in Promoting Rural Transformation.'
- 3 This was one of the conclusions of a recent review of educational research in Kenya. See David Court, 'An Inventory of Research on Education in Kenya', Discussion Paper No. 108, Institute for Development Studies, University of Nairobi, May 1971.
- 4 The recent most heralded re-assessment of pre-university education in Kenya was a curriculum commission from Britain!
- 5 For a fascinating discussion of this point, using the attempt to introduce New Mathematics in the United States as an example, see Seymour B. Sarason, The Culture of the School and the Problem of Change, Boston, Allyn and Bacon Inc., 1971, pp 33-48.
- 6 These views are discussed more fully in a later section. For an interesting analysis of their East African referents see John Anderson, 'Socialization and Selection, Incompatible Functions for Schools in Developing Countries,' Staff Paper No.65, Institute for Development Studies, University of Nairobi, February 1970.
- 7 For the USSR see Jeremy Azrael, 'Soviet Union'; James S. Coleman; Education and Political Development, Princeton, University Press, 1968 pp 233 - 271. On Cuba see Richard A. Fagor 'The Transformation of Political Culture in Cuba, Stanford California, University Press, 1969. For a recent report on education in China see Reg Hunt, 'Beyond the Cultural Revolution', The Times Educational Supplement, August, 20, 1971.
- 8 Good examples of this type of analysis are contained in Clifford Geertz (ed.,) Old Societies and New States, New York, Free Press of Glencoe, 1963. For a discussion of the nationalist aspects of Tanzanian citizenship see Goren Hyden, Tanu Yajenge Nchi, Nairobi, East African Publishing House, 1966, Chapters 1 and 2, 1968.
- 9 Muhtasari Ya Mafundisho Ya Elimu Ya Siasa, Shule Za Msingi (Madarasa ya IV-VII), Wizara ya Elimu Ya Taifa, Dar es Salaam, November 1969.

10

- 11 Julius K. Nyerere, Education for Self Reliance, Dar es Salaam: Government Printer, 1967 p. 7 and p. 25.
- 12 Joseph Kahl, The Measurement of Modernism, A Study of Values in Brazil and Mexico, Austin, University of Texas Press, 1968; Alex Inkeles, 'Participant Citizenship in Six Developing Nations', American Political Science Review, 3, January 1970.
- 13 Alex Inkeles, 'Industrial Man', American Journal of Sociology, July 1960, p. 2. The application of this principle to the organization of the school is the basic theme of Robert Dreeben, On What is Learned in School, Reading Massachusetts, Addison Wesley, 1968.
- 14 For a recent succinct statement of this creed see Ivan Illich 'The Alternative to Schooling' Saturday Review, June 19, 1971.
- 15 These and subsequent tables are contained in David Court, 'Schooling Experience and The Making of Citizens: A Study of Tanzanian Students', unpublished Dissertation Stanford University, California, January 1971. A copy of the questionnaire and details on index construction can be found there. The original data are from the Tanzanian segment of the East African Education and Citizenship Project initiated and directed by Kenneth Prewitt, and refer to 1967. Further information on the whole project can be found in Kenneth Prewitt (1971).
- 16 Tony Somerset 'Educational Aspirations of Fourth Form Pupils in Kenya', Discussion Paper No: 117 Institute for Development Studies, University of Nairobi, September, 1971.
- 17 Marjorie Mbilinyi, 'Traditional Attitudes Towards Women' A Major Constraint on Rural Development', Paper read at the Universities of East Africa Social Science Conference, Dar es Salaam, 1970.
- 18 For a sophisticated development of this general thesis see John Meyer, 'The Charter: Conditions of Diffuse Socialization in Schools' in Richard W. Scott (ed.), Social Processes and Social Structures, New York, Holt Rinehart and Winston, 1970.
- 19 The summary of Foster's thesis in this paragraph and the subsequent criticism of it refer particularly to Philip Foster, 'Education for Self Reliance a Critical Evaluation' in Richard Jolly (ed.), Education in Africa, Nairobi, East African Publishing House, 1969.
- 20 Philip Foster in Richard R. Jolly (1969), p.100.
- 21 Julius K. Nyerere Education for Self Reliance, (1967) p.11
- 22 David Morrison, 'Educating Citizens for Tanzania,' Kampala, Proceedings of the East African Institute of Social Research, January 1967.

- 23 For a discussion of this issue in relation to East Africa, see Kenneth Prewitt 'Schooling Stratification, Equality', in Michael Kirst (ed.), The State, The School and Politics (forthcoming).
- 24 Foster specifically prophesies a common educational destiny for countries as diverse as Ghana, Tanzania, and the Ivory Coast.
- 25 Tony Somerset 'Educational Aspirations of Fourth Form Pupils in Kenya' (1971).
- 26 David Court (1971).
- 27 The Standard March 9, 1971.
- 28 See the report by Reginald Mhango 'From a school of scandal to a breeding ground for Socialist Revolution', The Standard, October 14, 1971, and responding article by Philip Ochieng.
- 29 This issue received prominent coverage in the Tanzania press between mid March and mid April 1971.
- 30 This point is implied in the editorial of The Standard of June 11, 1971 following the decision on examinations.
- 31 Reginald Hunt 'Beyond the Cultural Revolution' (1971).
- 32 The bulk of the work on the effect of educational institutional refers to the American College. For a summary of this work see Kenneth A. Feldman and Thomas M. Newcomb, The Impact of College on Students, Vol. I, San Francisco, Jossey Bass Inc., 1969.
- 33 Some early and productive thinking on this subject is contained in a recently published series of essays; Kenneth Prewitt, Education and Political Values (1971) See particularly the essays by Lionel Cliffe and George Von der Muhl.
- 34 C.Y. Mgonja, Annual Report of the Minister of Education to the National Assembly, 1969.
- 35 Stanton Wheeler, 'The Structure of formally Organized Socialization Settings' in Orville Brim and Stanton Wheeler, Socialization After Childhood, New York John Wiley, 1966, p.84.
- 36 For a discussion of the 'Total Institution' see Erving Goffman, 'The Characteristics of Total Institutions' in a Etzioni (ed.) Complex Organizations. A Sociological Reader, New York, Holt, Rinehart & Winston 1961. For an attempt to apply the concept to the English Public School see Ian Weinberg, The English Public Schools, New York, Atherton, 1967.

- 37 David Court (1971) Chapter V.
- 38 Reg Hunt 'Beyond the Cultural Revolution' (1971)
- 39 See for example Thomas M. Newcomb and Everett K. Wilson, College Peer Groups, Chicago, Aldine, 1966.
- 40 Richard Dawson and Kenneth Prewitt, Political Socialization, Boston, Little Brown, 1968.
- 41 A more thorough discussion of the rationale behind this notion is contained in Kenneth Prewitt, George Von der Muhl and David Court, 'School Experiences and Political Socialization: A Study of Tanzanian Secondary Students, Comparative Political Studies, July 1970.
- 42 The actual question was:
Which sentence is more true?
It is difficult for a man to improve his life unless the government makes conditions better.
A man who works hard enough can do much to improve his life, even if government does not make conditions better.
- 43 Richard R. Fagen, The Transformation of Political Culture in Cuba. (1968).
- 44 Ali Mazrui, 'National Goals and political philosophies in Africa. The Implications for Teacher Education' Education in East Africa Vol. 2, No.1, 1971.
- 45 The groups identified included: Teachers, Government leaders, Army, Tax collectors, classmates, Africans, Asians, Religious leaders.
- 46 Schools were treated as highly politicized if their proportion of TYL members exceeded forty per cent.
- 47 Marjorie Mbilinyi, 'Whats Wrong At the Hill?' Sunday News, June 13, 1971.
- 48 That this is believed in Tanzania is indicated by the fact that in some schools a community dining hall has replaced separate Houses as the eating place for students, and by various experiments varying the selection and size of the Prefect body.
- 49 This final section draws on some ideas contained in Seymour B. Sarason. The Culture of the School and the Problem of Change (1971).
- 50 Jon Morris, 'The Impact of Secondary Education Upon Student Attitudes Toward Agriculture; Some Preliminary Considerations, Kampala, 'Proceedings of the East African Institute for Social Research, 1967, p. 2.'